

Irish comments on FCD ISO/IEC 10646-1/PDAM 15 (Kangxi radicals and CJK radicals supplement)

Reference: SC2 N3213

Closes: 1999-02-05

Date: 1999-01-19

Q1: Ireland approves the PDAM registration.

Q2: Ireland disapproves the PDAM draft with the technical comments given below. Acceptance of these reasons and appropriate changes in the text will change our vote to approval.

Technical:

1. With regard to the distinction made between Kangxi radicals and the CJK radicals supplement, we have grave concerns with regard to the duplication of radicals in the UCS. The CJK radicals especially appear to be designed for more than description of characters. *We suggest very strongly that CJK radicals supplement be removed entirely from this PDAM pending further research and justification.*

2. In general, we believe that a thorough review of the character names needs to be undertaken, because of the very great utility which radicals have to learners of languages which use CJK ideographs, since such users may have recourse to the UCS names, and may wish, for example, to find them in dictionaries.

As a test, we undertook a review of the Kangxi radicals by looking them up in a dictionary commonly found in Irish bookstores, the *Concise English-Chinese Chinese-English dictionary (Jīng xuǎn Yīng-Hàn Hàn-Yīng cídiǎn)*, Oxford and Shāng Wù, ISBN 0-19-584048-8. This dictionary contains some 20,000 entries in each section. The first thing we did was to look up the English gloss of the current names. In most cases (68.3%) we were able to verify the names by finding the correct character immediately. When we did not find a suitable character under the English name, we looked for the radical in the radical index, and found there just over half the remaining characters (16.8%), which we then looked up in the Chinese half of the dictionary; most of these yielded characters with a different gloss than has been proposed in the PDAM. The remaining 14.9% of the radicals we were unable to find in the dictionary. (We know that the dictionary consulted is not a large dictionary with many historical characters, and that a larger dictionary could yield a higher percentage of matches.)

Of the 16.8% for which we found different names, not all of them were found under the “raw” radical. We do not consider this problematic; if one looks at the Yi radicals in FPDAM 14, one finds a convention which can be successfully applied to the ideographic radicals. By convention a Yi radical is named either by the Yi syllable to which it corresponds exactly (YI SYLLABLE TU ㄊ = YI RADICAL TU ㄊ), or by the simplest Yi syllable which contains the radical (YI SYLLABLE WO ㄨㄛ > YI RADICAL WO ㄨㄛ; YI SYLLABLE DU ㄉㄨ > YI RADICAL DU ㄉㄨ). A number of the names for the ideographic radicals in this PDAM follow this convention (KANGXI RADICAL ICE < *bīng*, KANGXI RADICAL HEAD < *shǒu*, KANGXI RADICAL TIGER < *hǔ*).

We propose that the same convention be applied to a number of the characters in the PDAM which have been named according to a physical description of their shape (KANGXI RADICALS LINE, DOT, SLASH, LID, CLIFF, etc.), so that their names, instead, reflect the simplest real character which contains them (PLENTIFUL, JUSTICE, NINE, FLEE, FACTORY, etc.). We would like to request the Chinese NB to prepare a paper which documents *all* of the missing radicals, by showing them, if possible, with photocopies from a Chinese-English dictionary with the example chosen for the character’s name as constructed according to the principle described here. Such a document would be essential for resolving the naming issue.

We do not wish to see terms like LINE, DOT, CLIFF, etc., because the user may be confused by an inconsistent naming convention, since one can find RADICAL MAN by looking up “man” ‘*rén*’, but one cannot find RADICAL LINE by looking up “line” ‘*xián, suǒ, shéng*’ in a dictionary.

| Hex | Name | Pinyin | Gloss | Change to: |
|------|---------------------------------|----------|-------------------|-------------------|
| 2F00 | KANGXI RADICAL ONE | yī | one | |
| 2F01 | KANGXI RADICAL LINE | fēng | plentiful | PLENTIFUL |
| 2F02 | KANGXI RADICAL DOT | yì | justice | JUSTICE |
| 2F03 | KANGXI RADICAL SLASH | jiǔ | nine | NINE |
| 2F04 | KANGXI RADICAL SECOND | yǐ | second | |
| 2F05 | KANGXI RADICAL HOOK | | | radical not found |
| 2F06 | KANGXI RADICAL TWO | èr | two | |
| 2F07 | KANGXI RADICAL LID | wáng | flee | FLEE |
| 2F08 | KANGXI RADICAL MAN | rén | man | |
| 2F09 | KANGXI RADICAL LEGS | ér | son | SON |
| 2F0A | KANGXI RADICAL ENTER | rù | enter | |
| 2F0B | KANGXI RADICAL EIGHT | bā | eight | |
| 2F0C | KANGXI RADICAL DOWN BOX | gāng | ridge | RIDGE |
| 2F0D | KANGXI RADICAL COVER | rǒng | superfluous | SUPERFLUOUS |
| 2F0E | KANGXI RADICAL ICE | bīng | ice | |
| 2F0F | KANGXI RADICAL TABLE | jī | table | |
| 2F10 | KANGXI RADICAL OPEN BOX | xiōng | fierce | FIERCE |
| 2F11 | KANGXI RADICAL KNIFE | dāo | knife | |
| 2F12 | KANGXI RADICAL POWER | lì | power | |
| 2F13 | KANGXI RADICAL WRAP | shào | spoon | SPOON |
| 2F14 | KANGXI RADICAL SPOON | | | radical not found |
| 2F15 | KANGXI RADICAL RIGHT OPEN BOX | qū | area | AREA |
| 2F16 | KANGXI RADICAL HIDING ENCLOSURE | | | radical not found |
| 2F17 | KANGXI RADICAL TEN | shí | ten | |
| 2F18 | KANGXI RADICAL DIVINATION | bǔ | divination | |
| 2F19 | KANGXI RADICAL SEAL | wèi | defend | DEFEND |
| 2F1A | KANGXI RADICAL CLIFF | chǎng | factory | FACTORY |
| 2F1B | KANGXI RADICAL PRIVATE | yǔn | permit | PERMIT |
| 2F1C | KANGXI RADICAL AGAIN | yòu | again | |
| 2F1D | KANGXI RADICAL MOUTH | kǒu | mouth | |
| 2F1E | KANGXI RADICAL ENCLOSURE | líng/qiǔ | ?/imprison | IMPRISON (?) |
| 2F1F | KANGXI RADICAL EARTH | tǔ | earth | |
| 2F20 | KANGXI RADICAL SCHOLAR | shì | scholar | |
| 2F21 | KANGXI RADICAL GO | dōng | winter | WINTER |
| 2F22 | KANGXI RADICAL GO SLOWLY | | | radical not found |
| 2F23 | KANGXI RADICAL EVENING | xī | evening | |
| 2F24 | KANGXI RADICAL BIG | dà | big | |
| 2F25 | KANGXI RADICAL WOMAN | nǚ | woman | |
| 2F26 | KANGXI RADICAL CHILD | zǐ | child | |
| 2F27 | KANGXI RADICAL ROOF | níng | peaceful | PEACEFUL |
| 2F28 | KANGXI RADICAL INCH | cùn | three centimetres | THREE CM |
| 2F29 | KANGXI RADICAL SMALL | xiǎo | small | |
| 2F2A | KANGXI RADICAL LAME | yóu | particularly | PARTICULARLY |
| 2F2B | KANGXI RADICAL CORPSE | shī | corpse | |
| 2F2C | KANGXI RADICAL SPROUT | chú | ? | |
| 2F2D | KANGXI RADICAL MOUNTAIN | shān | mountain | |
| 2F2E | KANGXI RADICAL RIVER | zāi | disaster | DISASTER |
| 2F2F | KANGXI RADICAL WORK | gōng | work | |
| 2F30 | KANGXI RADICAL ONESELF | jǐ | oneself | |
| 2F31 | KANGXI RADICAL TURBAN | jīn | turban | |
| 2F32 | KANGXI RADICAL DRY | gān | dry | |
| 2F33 | KANGXI RADICAL THREAD | yāo | ? | |
| 2F34 | KANGXI RADICAL DOTTED CLIFF | guǎng | broad | BROAD |
| 2F35 | KANGXI RADICAL LONGSTRIDE | | | radical not found |
| 2F36 | KANGXI RADICAL TWO HANDS | huì | grass | GRASS |
| 2F37 | KANGXI RADICAL SHOOT | yì | ? | |

| | | | | |
|------|--------------------------------|--------|----------------|-------------------|
| 2F38 | KANGXI RADICAL BOW | gōng | bow | |
| 2F39 | KANGXI RADICAL SNOOT | guī | return | RETURN |
| 2F3A | KANGXI RADICAL BRISTLE | xíng | shape | SHAPE |
| 2F3B | KANGXI RADICAL STEP | chì | ? | |
| 2F3C | KANGXI RADICAL HEART | xīn | heart | |
| 2F3D | KANGXI RADICAL HALBERD | gē | halberd | |
| 2F3E | KANGXI RADICAL DOOR | hù | door | |
| 2F3F | KANGXI RADICAL HAND | shǒu | hand | |
| 2F40 | KANGXI RADICAL BRANCH | zhī | branch | |
| 2F41 | KANGXI RADICAL RAP | qiāo | knock | KNOCK |
| 2F42 | KANGXI RADICAL SCRIPT | wén | script | |
| 2F43 | KANGXI RADICAL DIPPER | dǒu | dipper | |
| 2F44 | KANGXI RADICAL AXE | jīn | half kilogram | HALF KILOGRAM |
| 2F45 | KANGXI RADICAL SQUARE | fāng | square | |
| 2F46 | KANGXI RADICAL NOT | | | radical not found |
| 2F47 | KANGXI RADICAL SUN | rì | sun | |
| 2F48 | KANGXI RADICAL SAY | yuē | say | |
| 2F49 | KANGXI RADICAL MOON | yuè | moon | |
| 2F4A | KANGXI RADICAL TREE | mù | tree | |
| 2F4B | KANGXI RADICAL LACK | qiàn | owe | OWE |
| 2F4C | KANGXI RADICAL STOP | zhǐ | stop | |
| 2F4D | KANGXI RADICAL DEATH | dǎi | bad | BAD |
| 2F4E | KANGXI RADICAL WEAPON | shū | ? | |
| 2F4F | KANGXI RADICAL DO NOT | | | radical not found |
| 2F50 | KANGXI RADICAL COMPARE | bǐ | compare | |
| 2F51 | KANGXI RADICAL FUR | máo | fur | |
| 2F52 | KANGXI RADICAL CLAN | shì | clan | |
| 2F53 | KANGXI RADICAL STEAM | qì | steam | |
| 2F54 | KANGXI RADICAL WATER | shuǐ | water | |
| 2F55 | KANGXI RADICAL FIRE | huǒ | fire | |
| 2F56 | KANGXI RADICAL CLAW | zhǎo | claw | |
| 2F57 | KANGXI RADICAL FATHER | fù | father | |
| 2F58 | KANGXI RADICAL DOUBLE X | | | radical not found |
| 2F59 | KANGXI RADICAL HALF TREE TRUNK | | | radical not found |
| 2F5A | KANGXI RADICAL SLICE | piàn | slice | |
| 2F5B | KANGXI RADICAL FANG | yá | fang | |
| 2F5C | KANGXI RADICAL COW | niú | cow | |
| 2F5D | KANGXI RADICAL DOG | zhuàng | strong | STRONG |
| 2F5E | KANGXI RADICAL PROFOUND | | | radical not found |
| 2F5F | KANGXI RADICAL JADE | yù | jade | |
| 2F60 | KANGXI RADICAL MELON | guā | melon | |
| 2F61 | KANGXI RADICAL TILE | wǎ | tile | |
| 2F62 | KANGXI RADICAL SWEET | | | radical not found |
| 2F63 | KANGXI RADICAL LIFE | shēng | life | |
| 2F64 | KANGXI RADICAL USE | yòng | use | |
| 2F65 | KANGXI RADICAL FIELD | tián | field | |
| 2F66 | KANGXI RADICAL BOLT OF CLOTH | pǐ | ? | |
| 2F67 | KANGXI RADICAL SICKNESS | dīng | malignant boil | BOIL |
| 2F68 | KANGXI RADICAL DOTTED TENT | | | radical not found |
| 2F69 | KANGXI RADICAL WHITE | bái | white | |
| 2F6A | KANGXI RADICAL SKIN | pí | skin | |
| 2F6B | KANGXI RADICAL DISH | mǐn | ? | |
| 2F6C | KANGXI RADICAL EYE | mù | eye | |
| 2F6D | KANGXI RADICAL SPEAR | máo | spear | |
| 2F6E | KANGXI RADICAL ARROW | shǐ | arrow | |
| 2F6F | KANGXI RADICAL STONE | shí | stone | |

| | | | | |
|------|-------------------------------|-------|---------------|-------------------|
| 2F70 | KANGXI RADICAL SPIRIT | shì | show | SHOW |
| 2F71 | KANGXI RADICAL TRACK | | | radical not found |
| 2F72 | KANGXI RADICAL GRAIN | hé | grain | |
| 2F73 | KANGXI RADICAL CAVE | xué | cave | |
| 2F74 | KANGXI RADICAL STAND | lì | stand | |
| 2F75 | KANGXI RADICAL BAMBOO | zhú | bamboo | |
| 2F76 | KANGXI RADICAL RICE | mǐ | rice | |
| 2F77 | KANGXI RADICAL SILK | | | radical not found |
| 2F78 | KANGXI RADICAL JAR | | | radical not found |
| 2F79 | KANGXI RADICAL NET | wǎng | net | |
| 2F7A | KANGXI RADICAL SHEEP | yáng | sheep | |
| 2F7B | KANGXI RADICAL FEATHER | yǔ | feather | |
| 2F7C | KANGXI RADICAL OLD | lǎo | old | |
| 2F7D | KANGXI RADICAL AND | | | radical not found |
| 2F7E | KANGXI RADICAL PLOW | lěi | ? | (PLOUGH) |
| 2F7F | KANGXI RADICAL EAR | ěr | ear | |
| 2F80 | KANGXI RADICAL BRUSH | yù | ? | |
| 2F81 | KANGXI RADICAL MEAT | | | radical not found |
| 2F82 | KANGXI RADICAL MINISTER | chén | minister | |
| 2F83 | KANGXI RADICAL SELF | zì | self | |
| 2F84 | KANGXI RADICAL ARRIVE | | | radical not found |
| 2F85 | KANGXI RADICAL MORTAR | jiù | mortar | |
| 2F86 | KANGXI RADICAL TONGUE | shé | tongue | |
| 2F87 | KANGXI RADICAL OPPOSE | | | radical not found |
| 2F88 | KANGXI RADICAL BOAT | zhōu | boat | |
| 2F89 | KANGXI RADICAL STOPPING | | | radical not found |
| 2F8A | KANGXI RADICAL COLOR | sè | colour | COLOUR |
| 2F8B | KANGXI RADICAL GRASS | | | radical not found |
| 2F8C | KANGXI RADICAL TIGER | hǔ | tiger | |
| 2F8D | KANGXI RADICAL INSECT | chóng | insect | |
| 2F8E | KANGXI RADICAL BLOOD | xuè | blood | |
| 2F8F | KANGXI RADICAL WALK ENCLOSURE | | | radical not found |
| 2F90 | KANGXI RADICAL CLOTHES | yī | clothes | |
| 2F91 | KANGXI RADICAL WEST | xī | west | |
| 2F92 | KANGXI RADICAL SEE | jiàn | see | |
| 2F93 | KANGXI RADICAL HORN | jiǎo | horn | |
| 2F94 | KANGXI RADICAL SPEECH | yán | word | WORD |
| 2F95 | KANGXI RADICAL VALLEY | gǔ | valley | |
| 2F96 | KANGXI RADICAL BEAN | dòu | bean | |
| 2F97 | KANGXI RADICAL PIG | shǐ | ? | |
| 2F98 | KANGXI RADICAL BADGER | zhì | ? | |
| 2F99 | KANGXI RADICAL SHELL | bèi | shellfish | SHELLFISH |
| 2F9A | KANGXI RADICAL RED | chì | red | |
| 2F9B | KANGXI RADICAL RUN | zǒu | walk | WALK |
| 2F9C | KANGXI RADICAL FOOT | zú | foot | |
| 2F9D | KANGXI RADICAL BODY | shē | body | |
| 2F9E | KANGXI RADICAL CART | mǎ | cart | |
| 2F9F | KANGXI RADICAL BITTER | xīn | bitter | |
| 2FA0 | KANGXI RADICAL MORNING | chén | morning | |
| 2FA1 | KANGXI RADICAL WALK | | | radical not found |
| 2FA2 | KANGXI RADICAL CITY | | | radical not found |
| 2FA3 | KANGXI RADICAL BIRD SIGN | yǒu | ? | |
| 2FA4 | KANGXI RADICAL DISTINGUISH | xī | know | KNOW |
| 2FA5 | KANGXI RADICAL VILLAGE | lǐ | neighbourhood | NEIGHBOURHOOD |
| 2FA6 | KANGXI RADICAL GOLD | jīn | gold | |
| 2FA7 | KANGXI RADICAL LONG | cháng | long | |
| 2FA8 | KANGXI RADICAL GATE | mén | gate | |

| | | | | |
|------|----------------------------------|-------|----------|-------------------|
| 2FA9 | KANGXI RADICAL MOUND | | | radical not found |
| 2FAA | KANGXI RADICAL SLAVE | lì | slave | |
| 2FAB | KANGXI RADICAL SHORT TAILED BIRD | | | radical not found |
| 2FAC | KANGXI RADICAL RAIN | yǔ | rain | |
| 2FAD | KANGXI RADICAL BLUE | qīng | blue | |
| 2FAE | KANGXI RADICAL WRONG | fēi | wrong | |
| 2FAF | KANGXI RADICAL FACE | miàn | face | |
| 2FB0 | KANGXI RADICAL LEATHER | gé | leather | |
| 2FB1 | KANGXI RADICAL TANNED LEATHER | wéi | reed | REED |
| 2FB2 | KANGXI RADICAL LEEK | jiǔ | leek | |
| 2FB3 | KANGXI RADICAL SOUND | yīn | sound | |
| 2FB4 | KANGXI RADICAL LEAF | yè | page | PAGE |
| 2FB5 | KANGXI RADICAL WIND | fēng | wind | |
| 2FB6 | KANGXI RADICAL FLY | fēi | fly | |
| 2FB7 | KANGXI RADICAL EAT | shí | eat | |
| 2FB8 | KANGXI RADICAL HEAD | shǒu | head | |
| 2FB9 | KANGXI RADICAL FRAGRANT | xiāng | fragrant | |
| 2FBA | KANGXI RADICAL HORSE | mǎ | horse | |
| 2FBB | KANGXI RADICAL BONE | gǔ | bone | |
| 2FBC | KANGXI RADICAL TALL | gāo | tall | |
| 2FBD | KANGXI RADICAL HAIR | fà | hair | |
| 2FBE | KANGXI RADICAL FIGHT | dòu | fight | |
| 2FBF | KANGXI RADICAL SACRIFICIAL WINE | | | radical not found |
| 2FC0 | KANGXI RADICAL CAULDRON | | | radical not found |
| 2FC1 | KANGXI RADICAL GHOST | guǐ | ghost | |
| 2FC2 | KANGXI RADICAL FISH | yú | fish | |
| 2FC3 | KANGXI RADICAL BIRD | niǎo | bird | |
| 2FC4 | KANGXI RADICAL SALT | lǚ | bittern | BITTERN |
| 2FC5 | KANGXI RADICAL DEER | lù | deer | |
| 2FC6 | KANGXI RADICAL WHEAT | mài | wheat | |
| 2FC7 | KANGXI RADICAL HEMP | má | hemp | |
| 2FC8 | KANGXI RADICAL YELLOW | huáng | yellow | |
| 2FC9 | KANGXI RADICAL MILLET | shǔ | millet | |
| 2FCA | KANGXI RADICAL BLACK | hēi | black | |
| 2FCB | KANGXI RADICAL EMBROIDERY | | | radical not found |
| 2FCC | KANGXI RADICAL FROG | miǎn | frog | |
| 2FCD | KANGXI RADICAL TRIPOD | | | radical not found |
| 2FCE | KANGXI RADICAL DRUM | gǔ | drum | |
| 2FCF | KANGXI RADICAL RAT | shǔ | rat | |
| 2FD0 | KANGXI RADICAL NOSE | bí | nose | |
| 2FD1 | KANGXI RADICAL EVEN | | | radical not found |
| 2FD2 | KANGXI RADICAL TOOTH | chǐ | tooth | |
| 2FD3 | KANGXI RADICAL DRAGON | lóng | dragon | |
| 2FD4 | KANGXI RADICAL TURTLE | guī | turtle | |
| 2FD5 | KANGXI RADICAL FLUTE | | | radical not found |