Bacterial vaginosis: a review on clinical trials with probiotics

Paola Mastromarino¹, Beatrice Vitali², Luciana Mosca³

¹Department of Public Health and Infectious Diseases, Section of Microbiology, Roma, Italy; ²Department of Pharmacy and Biotechnology, University of Bologna, Bologna, Italy; ³Department of Biochemical Sciences, Sapienza University School of Medicine, Roma, Italy

SUMMARY _

Bacterial vaginosis (BV) is the most common vaginal syndrome afflicting fertile, premenopausal and pregnant women. BV is associated with important adverse health conditions and infectious complications. Therapy with oral or local recommended antibiotics is often associated with failure and high rates of recurrences. The dominance of lactobacilli in healthy vaginal microbiota and its depletion in BV has given rise to the concept of oral or vaginal use of probiotic *Lactobacillus* strains for treatment and prevention of BV. This review investigated the evidence for the use of a single strain or cocktail of probiotics, administered orally or intravaginally, either alone or in conjunction with antibiotics for the treatment of BV. Lactobacilli use in BV is supported by positive results obtained in some clinical trials. The majority of clinical trials yielding positive results have been performed using probiotic preparations containing high doses of lactobacilli suggesting that, beside strain characteristics, the amount of exogenously applied lactobacilli could have a role in the effectiveness of the product. However, substantial heterogeneity in products, trial methodologies and outcome measures do not provide sufficient evidence for or against recommending probiotics for the treatment of BV.

KEY WORDS: Bacterial vaginosis, Probiotics, Lactobacilli, Controlled clinical trials.

Received May 12, 2013 Accepted May 28, 2013

INTRODUCTION

The female lower genital tract, consisting of vagina and ectocervix, is an ecological niche where several aerobe and anaerobe microorganisms coexist in a dynamic balance. The homeostasis of the vaginal ecosystem results from complex interactions and synergies among the host and different microorganisms that colonize the vaginal mucosa (Mårdh, 1991; Sobel, 1997). This ecosystem is dynamic with changes in structure and composition being influenced by age, menarche, time in menstrual cycle, pregnancy, infections, methods of birth control, sexual activity, use of

time in menstrual cycle, pregnancy, infect methods of birth control, sexual activity, understanding author

Paola Mastromarino
Department of Public Health and Infectious Diseases Section of Microbiology
Università "Sapienza"

Piazzale Aldo Moro, 5 - 00185 Roma, Italy

E-mail: paola.mastromarino@uniroma1.it

medication and hygiene (Srinivasan and Fredricks, 2008). In fertile, premenopausal healthy women, the vaginal ecosystem is dominated by Lactobacillus spp., but a diverse array of other bacteria can be present in much lower numbers. L. crispatus, L. iners, L. jensenii and L. gasseri are the predominant vaginal Lactobacillus species (Lamont et al., 2011). The main frequent undesirable organisms are yeasts (Candida albicans, Candida tropicalis, Candida krusei), anaerobic bacteria responsible for vaginosis (Gardnerella vaginalis, Mycoplasma hominis, Atopobium vaginae, Prevotella spp., Veillonella spp., Mobiluncus spp.), uropathogens (Escherichia coli, Proteus spp., Klebsiella spp., Serratia spp.), and sexually transmitted viruses (HIV, Herpes virus) (Lamont et al., 2011). Lactobacilli are involved in maintaining the normal vaginal microflora by preventing overgrowth of pathogenic and opportunistic organisms (Rönnqvist et al., 2006). The principal mechanisms by which lactobacilli exert their protective functions are:

- 1. stimulation of the immune system;
- competition with other microorganisms for nutrients and for adherence to the vaginal epithelium;
- 3. reduction of the vaginal pH by the production of organic acids, especially lactic acid;
- 4. production of antimicrobial substances, such as bacteriocins, and hydrogen peroxide (Aroutcheva *et al.*, 2001).

The hydrogen peroxide microbial metabolite represents one of the most effective protective agents against pathogens. It has been observed that 70% to 95% of lactobacilli present in the vaginal flora of healthy women produce hydrogen peroxide. This percentage drops to 5% in women affected by vaginal infections (Eschenbach *et al.*, 1989).

BACTERIAL VAGINOSIS

Bacterial vaginosis (BV) represents the most common vaginal syndrome afflicting fertile, premenopausal and pregnant women, with an incidence rate ranging from 5% to 50% (Sobel, 1997). BV is a complex, polymicrobial disorder characterized by an overgrowth of strict or facultative anaerobic bacteria (Gardnerella vaginalis, Atopobium vaginae, Prevotella spp., Mobiluncus spp., Mycoplasma hominis) and a reduction of lactobacilli particularly those producing hydrogen peroxide (Fredricks et al., 2005; Lamont et al., 2011). Women with BV typically complain of vaginal discomfort and homogeneous malodorous vaginal discharge, which is more noticeable after unprotected intercourse, although a substantial fraction of women are asymptomatic (Klebanoff et al., 2004). The overgrowth of vaginal anaerobes determines an increased production of amines (putrescine, cadaverine and trimethylamine) that become volatile at alkaline pH, i.e. after sexual intercourse and during the menstrual cycle, and contribute to the typical malodor of the vaginal discharge (Chen et al., 1979). BV is frequently disregarded since the symptoms are often insignificant, however the clinical consequences could be important. In fact, the alterations in the vaginal microbiota have been associated with ascending infections and obstetric complications (Koumans et al., 2002), as well as with urinary tract infections (Harmanli et al., 2000). In women undergoing in vitro fertil-

ization, BV may result in lower implantation rates and increased rates of early pregnancy loss (Eckert et al., 2003; Verstraelen et al., 2005). Increasing data also indicate that BV facilitates the acquisition of sexually transmitted diseases such as Neisseria gonorrhoeae, Chlamydia trachomatis, HIV and Herpes simplex virus type-2 infection (HSV-2) (Martin et al., 1999; Cherpes et al., 2003; Wiesenfeld et al., 2003; Sessa et al., 2013). Moreover, genital tract shedding of HSV-2 (Cherpes et al., 2005) and cytomegalovirus (Ross et al., 2005) is significantly higher in women with BV than in BV-free women and female genital tract HIV load correlates inversely with Lactobacillus count (Sha et al., 2005). Therefore, vaginal lactobacilli in vivo exert an important role in sexually transmitted infections both in relation to the protection of female health or by reducing the risk of virus transmission from an infected woman to a healthy man.

Two methods are used for BV diagnosis: the first was described by Amsel (Amsel *et al.*, 1983) and implies the presence of at least three of the following criteria:

- 1. thin, homogeneous vaginal discharge;
- 2. vaginal pH higher than 4.5;
- 'fishy' odour of vaginal fluid after addition of 10% KOH (whiff test);
- 4. presence of clue cells on microscopic evaluation of saline wet preparations.

The second method, the Gram stain score of vaginal smears according to Nugent (Nugent *et al.*, 1991), involves the microscopic quantitation of bacterial morphotypes yielding a score between 0 and 10. A Gram stain score ≥7 is considered indicative of BV.

In recent years, culture-independent techniques based on the analysis of rRNA gene sequences have been developed, providing powerful tools to reveal the phylogenetic diversity of the microorganisms found within the vaginal ecosystem and to understand community dynamics (Fredricks *et al.*, 2005; Lamont *et al.*, 2011). These molecular studies indicate that the vaginal bacterial communities differ dramatically between women with and without BV. BV is associated with increased taxonomic richness and diversity. The microbiota composition is highly variable among subjects at a fine taxonomic scale (species or genus level), but, at the phylum level, *Actinobacteria* and *Bacteroidetes* are strongly as-

sociated with BV, while higher proportions of *Firmicutes* are found in healthy subjects. Several vaginal bacteria have been indicated as excellent markers of BV, either alone or in combination, including *Megasphaera*, three novel bacteria in the order *Clostridiales*, *Leptotrichia/Sneathia*, *Atopobium vaginae*, and an *Eggerthella*-like bacterium (Lamont *et al.*, 2011).

Therapy of BV involves oral or local administration of metronidazole or intravaginal clindamycin, and varies in efficacy (48-85% for absence of infection 4 or more weeks after treatment) (Koumans et al., 2002). The long-term cure rate is low, BV recurs in up to 40% of women within 3 months after initiation of antibiotic therapy and in up to 50% of women after 6 months (Bradshaw et al., 2006). There are several unpleasant side-effects and disadvantages associated with these therapies, including superinfections by pathogenic microorganisms (Sobel et al., 2006) and susceptibility of lactobacilli to clindamycin (Bayer et al., 1978). Moreover, vaginal pathogens, particularly G. vaginalis and anaerobic bacteria. are showing increasing drug resistance (McLean and McGroarty, 1996; Beigi et al., 2004). The high recurrence rates resulting in repeated exposure to antibiotics and the emergence of drug-resistant strains suggest a need for alternative therapeutic tools based both on new antibacterial agents (Cruciani et al., 2012) and probiotic products.

RATIONALE FOR USING PROBIOTICS IN GENITOURINARY INFECTIONS

Many studies provided evidence of the beneficial functions of the human microbiota, and prompted the selection of bacterial strains, recognized as probiotics, with health-promoting capacities for the treatment of conditions in which the microbiota, or its optimal functioning, is perturbed. Probiotics have been defined as "live microorganisms which when administered in adequate amounts confer a health benefit on the host" (Joint FAO/WHO Working Group Report on Drafting Guidelines for the Evaluation of Probiotics in Food, 2002). Clinical applications of probiotics include the prevention and treatment of gastrointestinal, urogenital and respiratory infections, inflammatory bowel diseases and allergic diseases and use as adjuvants in vacci-

nation (Kligler et al., 2007; Nova et al., 2007; Goldin and Gorbach, 2008; Barrons and Tassone, 2008; Vouloumanou et al., 2009; Borchers et al., 2009). The clinical utility of probiotics may extend to fields such as stress-related disorders (anxiety and depression) (Bravo et al., 2001; Rao et al., 2009) and cancer (Geier et al., 2006; de Moreno de LeBlanc et al., 2007). Moreover, recent studies suggested that probiotics may represent a therapeutic strategy for metabolic and cardiovascular diseases through the modulation of host metabolism and inflammation (Lye et al., 2010; Wang et al., 2011; Lam et al., 2012). Indeed, atherosclerosis is associated with lipid accumulation and inflammation in the arterial wall, and bacteria have been suggested as the causative agents of this disease (Sessa et al., 2006; Sessa et al., 2007; Koren et al., 2011).

The rationale for the use of probiotics in women is based on the genitourinary regulatory role played by the vaginal healthy microbiota and the need for restoration of this microbial ecosystem after insult. Lactobacilli are the commonest organisms used as probiotics. The use of lactobacilli to re-establish a physiological microbial flora of the female urogenital tract dates back to the early 1900s (reviewed by Sieber and Dietz, 1998). Since the beginning of the nineties there has been a renewed interest in the use of probiotic products in the treatment and prevention of BV and vaginitis. Since antimicrobial treatment of urogenital infections is not always effective, and problems remain due to bacterial and yeast resistance, recurrent infections, and side-effects, it is not surprising that alternative remedies are of interest to patients and their caregivers. Indeed, lactobacilli probiotics can be used over a long time without adverse effects, making them an attractive alternative to antibiotics, particularly in addressing the problem of high recurrence rates.

CLINICAL TRIALS

Studies have been carried out to assess the efficacy of a single strain or cocktail of probiotics administered orally or intravaginally in the treatment of BV (Falagas *et al.*, 2007). Two types of experimental approaches have been used in clinical trials using probiotics for treatment of BV. In the first, BV therapy was carried out using on-

ly probiotics. In the second, probiotics were administered following a conventional antibiotic therapy.

Clinical trials on probiotics use for treatment of bacterial vaginosis

The major randomized controlled trials using the first type of approach on women affected by BV are reported in Table 1. Only two studies emploving different species of lactobacilli have been performed using well-characterized and well-selected strains specific for treatment of genitourinary infections (Anukam et al., 2006b; Mastromarino et al., 2009). Both studies used a combination of different species of lactobacilli with different biological properties on fertile nonpregnant women. L. rhamnosus GR-1 and L. fermentum RC-14 were the strains used in the first study (Anukam et al., 2006b). L. rhamnosus GR-1 adheres strongly to uroepithelial cells and inhibits adhesion and growth of uropathogens (Reid et al., 1987). L. fermentum RC-14 produces biosurfactant compounds (Velraeds et al., 1998) and significant amounts of hydrogen peroxide, adheres to uroepithelial cells and inhibits pathogen binding (Reid and Bruce, 2001). These strains can be recovered from the vagina after oral administration (Reid et al., 2001). The second study used a product containing a combina-

tion of three strains of lactobacilli (Lactobacillus brevis CD2, Lactobacillus salivarius FV2 and Lactobacillus plantarum FV9) (Mastromarino et al., 2009). L. salivarius FV2 and L. plantarum FV9 produce anti-infective agents, including hydrogen peroxide, and are able to co-aggregate efficiently with vaginal pathogens (Mastromarino et al., 2002). L. plantarum and L. brevis strains are able to adhere at high levels to human epithelial cells, displacing vaginal pathogens (Maggi *et al.*, 2000; Mastromarino et al., 2002). The strains were able to temporarily colonize the human vagina (Massi et al., 2004), reduce vaginal proinflammatory cytokines IL-1β and IL-6 (Hemalatha et al., 2012) and showed inhibitory activity towards HSV-2 replication in cell cultures (Conti et al., 2009; Mastromarino et al., 2011). A single-blind comparison of intravaginal probiotics (L. rhamnosus GR-1 and L. fermentum RC-14) and metronidazole gel for the treatment of BV was carried out on a group of Nigerian women (Anukam et al., 2006b). Cure of BV was based on a Nugent score ≤3 at 30 days. A BV cure rate of 65% was achieved after probiotic treatment compared to 33% of the metronidazole therapy (*P*=0.056). The double-blind, placebo-controlled trial (Mastromarino et al., 2009) used both the Amsel criteria and Nugent scores to assess BV cure as recommended by the FDA (US Dept of

TABLE 1 - Clinical trials on probiotics use for treatment of bacterial vaginosis (BV).

Authors	Size	Type of study/ duration	Intervention	BV cure rate
Anukam et al., 2006b	40	R, OB, AC 30 days	Daily vaginal capsule containing <i>L. rhamnosus</i> GR-1 (109 CFU) and <i>L. reuteri</i> RC-14 (109 CFU) or 0.75% metronidazole gel b.i.d. for 5 days	65% compared to 33% metronidazole (P = 0.056)
Mastromarino et al., 2009	34	R, DB, PC 3 week	Daily vaginal tablet containing ≥109 CFU of <i>L. brevis</i> CD2, <i>L. salivarius</i> FV2, and <i>L. plantarum</i> FV9 for 7 days	50% compared to 6% control (P = 0.017)
Parent <i>et al.</i> , 1996	32	R, PC 4 week	1-2 daily vaginal tablet containing L. acidophilus ≥107 CFU and 0.03 mg estriol for 6 days	88% compared to 22% control (P <0.05)
Hallén <i>et al.</i> , 1992	57	R, DB, PC 20-40 days	Vaginal suppository containing L. acidophilus 10 ⁸⁻⁹ CFU or placebo b.i.d. for 6 days	21% compared to 0% control (P = NS)

R = randomized; DB = double blind; PC = placebo controlled; OB = observer blind. AC = active controlled. CFU = colony forming units.

Health and Human Services, Food and Drug Administration, Center for Drug Evaluation and Research. Guidance for industry: Bacterial vaginosis-developing antimicrobial drugs for treatment 1998). The intravaginal probiotic-treated group (*L. brevis* CD2, *L. salivarius* FV2 and *L. plantarum* FV9) obtained a BV cure rate of 50% compared to 6% in the placebo-treated group with the combined test methods, whereas a 67% vs 12% cure rate was obtained when considering only the Amsel criteria. The other clinical studies were performed using different strains of *Lactobacillus acidophilus*.

A high BV cure rate (88%) was observed in a placebo-controlled study using a pharmaceutical product (containing a H_2O_2 -producing L. acidophilus strain plus estriol) that included both pregnant and non-pregnant women (Parent et al., 1996). However, the results reported in this trial may have been biased by the enrolment criteria in which only two of the four Amsel criteria were required for a positive definition of BV status. A product containing H_2O_2 -producing L. aci-

dophilus turned out to be ineffective for treatment of BV assessed according to Amsel criteria (Hallén *et al.*, 1992). However it is difficult to evaluate the real efficacy of the product tested in this study since 50% of the patients in the active group and 86% of the placebo group did not complete the trial.

Clinical trials on probiotics use combined with antibiotic treatment for BV

Five randomized controlled trials used lactobacilli following conventional antibiotic treatment (Table 2) to evaluate the BV cure rate after one month (Anukam *et al.*, 2006a; Petricevic and Witt, 2008) or BV recurrence after 2-6 months (Larsson *et al.*, 2008; Eriksson *et al.*, 2005; Bradshaw *et al.*, 2012). A trial in Nigeria evaluated augmentation of antimicrobial metronidazole therapy for BV by a 30-day oral probiotic treatment (*L. rhamnosus* GR-1 and *L. fermentum* RC-14) compared to placebo-treated control (Anukam *et al.*, 2006a). At the end of treatment a significantly greater number of women in the probiotic group com-

TABLE 2 - Clinical trials on probiotics use combined with antibiotic treatment for BV.

Authors	Size	Type of study duration	Intervention	BV cure rate
Anukam et al., 2006a	125	R, DB, PC 30 days	Oral metronidazole 500 mg b.i.d. for 7 days and oral capsules containing <i>L. rhamnosus</i> GR-1 (10 ⁹ CFU) and <i>L. reuteri</i> RC-14 (10 ⁹ CFU) or placebo b.i.d. for 30 days starting on day 1 of metronidazole treatment	88% compared to 40% control (P <0.001)
Petricevic and Witt, 2008	190	R, OB, PC 4 weeks	Oral clindamycin 300 mg b.i.d. for 7 days, then vaginal capsules containing 10 ⁹ CFU of <i>L. casei rhamnosus</i> for 7 days	83% compared to 35% control (P <0.001)
Larsson et al., 2008	100	R, DB, PC 6 menstrual periods	Vaginal 2% clindamycin cream directly followed by vaginal capsules containing <i>L. gasseri</i> Lba EB01-DSM 14869 (10 ⁸ -10 ⁹ CFU) and <i>L. rhamnosus</i> Lbp PB01-DSM 14870 (10 ⁸ -10 ⁹ CFU) for 10 days, probiotic treatment repeated for 10 days after each menstruation during 3 menstrual cycles	65% compared to 46% control (P = 0.042)
Eriksson et al., 2005	187	R, DB, PC 2 menstrual periods	Vaginal 100 mg clindamycin ovules for 3 days, then tampons containing 10 ⁸ CFU of <i>L. gasseri</i> , <i>L. casei rhamnosus</i> , <i>L. fermentum</i> or placebo tampons during the next menstrual period	56% compared to 62% control (P = NS)
Bradshaw et al., 2012	268	R, DB, PC 6 months	Oral metronidazole 400 mg b.i.d. for 7 days followed by vaginal pessary containing <i>L. acidophilus</i> KS400 ≥10 ⁷ CFU and 0.03 mg estriol for 12 days	72% compared to 73% control (P = NS)

R = randomized; DB = double blind; PC = placebo controlled; OB = observer blind. CFU = colony forming units.

pared to the placebo group were BV-free (Nugent score ≤3).

The study by Petricevic and Witt (2008) performed a 7-day *Lactobacillus* treatment after clindamycin therapy. Intravaginal *Lactobacillus casei rhamnosus* (Lcr35) was used in the intervention group, whereas women in the control group did not receive Lcr35 (Petricevic and Witt, 2008). The BV cure rate was evaluated by Nugent method four weeks after the last administration of medication in both groups. A significantly higher cure rate was obtained in the intervention group.

The efficacy of *Lactobacillus* supplementation after clindamycin or metronidazole treatment on the recurrence rate of BV was evaluated in three trials (Larsson et al., 2008; Eriksson et al., 2005; Bradshaw et al., 2012). A ten-day repeated treatment with L. gasseri Lba EB01-DSM 14869 and L.rhamnosus Lbp PB01-DSM 14870 during three menstrual cycles was compared with a placebo treatment on BV-affected women enrolled according to Amsel criteria (Larsson et al., 2008). The cure rate was evaluated by the Hay/Ison score (Ison and Hay, 2002). Probiotic use did not improve the efficacy of BV therapy after the first month of treatment, but it significantly reduced the recurrence rate of BV at six months from initiation of treatment.

Administration of tampons impregnated with *L*. gasseri, L. casei subsp. rhamnosus and L. fermentum or placebo tampons during the menstrual period following clindamycin treatment was exploited (Eriksson et al., 2005). Cure rates assessed by Amsel criteria after the second menstrual period did not show a significant difference between the two groups. Possible explanations for the lack of effects could be the low amount of lactobacilli in tampons at the end of the study (10⁶ PFU) or the unfavourable period of administration i.e. during the menstrual flow. Pessaries containing L. acidophilus KS400 were used in a recent trial to evaluate the efficacy of probiotics on the recurrence rate of BV following oral metronidazole treatment (Bradshaw et al., 2012). A 12 day course of probiotic pessary did not achieve higher cure rates for BV compared with placebo pessary over six months of follow-up as assessed by Nugent score.

A recent prospective, randomized, placebo-controlled, double-blinded study evaluated the effi-

cacy of vaginal probiotic capsules for BV prophylaxis in healthy women with a history of recurrent BV (Ya et al., 2010). One hundred and twenty healthy Chinese women with a history of recurrent BV (≥2 BV episodes in the previous year) were assigned randomly to daily vaginal prophylaxis with 1 capsule that containing 8×10⁹ CFU of L. rhamnosus (6.8×109 CFU), L. acidophilus (0.4×109 CFU) and Streptococcus thermophilus (0.4×10⁹ CFU) or 1 placebo capsule for 7 days on, 7 days off, and 7 days on. Probiotic prophylaxis resulted in lower recurrence rates for BV (15.8% vs 45.0%; P<0.001) through 2 months as assessed according to Amsel criteria. Between the 2 and 11-month follow-up period, women who received probiotics reported a lower incidence of BV (10.6% vs 27.7%; P=0.04). However a limitation of this study was that 11-month outcomes were collected by telephone follow-up interview.

DISCUSSION

In recent years several clinical trials have been performed to investigate whether specific strains of lactobacilli, administered either orally or intra-vaginally, in combination with antibiotics or not, could be effective in the treatment or prevention of vaginal infections. The studies using lactobacilli to treat BV, albeit small in size, showed the potential of probiotics to cure BV. Although the species used in the various trials differed, three out of four studies reported a significant cure rate (Parent et al., 1996; Anukam et al., 2006b; Mastromarino et al., 2009). When probiotics were used following antibiotic treatment, the BV cure rate was increased and recurrence rates were reduced in three out of five studies (Anukam et al., 2006a; Petricevic and Witt, 2008; Larsson et al., 2008).

An important issue concerns the prevention of BV recurrence in healthy women with a history of recurrent BV. Despite the important adverse health conditions associated with abnormal vaginal flora, no preventive treatments are available. The positive results obtained in the only clinical trial using lactobacilli in healthy Chinese women (Ya *et al.*, 2010) suggest the potential of probiotics for BV prophylaxis. It is noteworthy that, unlike antibiotics, lactobacilli probiotics can be

used over a long period without adverse effects. The majority of clinical trials reporting positive results were performed using probiotic preparations containing high doses of lactobacilli (around 10⁹ CFU) suggesting that, beside strain characteristics, the amount of exogenously applied lactobacilli could have a role in the effectiveness of the product. Moreover, recent observational data using prolonged repetitive courses of *Lactobacillus*-containing probiotics appear to be more promising than short courses (Ya *et al.*, 2010; Bradshaw *et al.*, 2012).

The preferred route of delivery for probiotic lactobacilli is intravaginal. However, some authors delivered lactobacilli orally to repopulate the vagina, based on the observation that pathogens can pass from the gut into the urogenital system and that orally administered Lactobacillus strains have been recovered from the vagina (Strus et al., 2012). It is noteworthy that the capability of the lactobacilli to colonize the vagina after oral ingestion is strictly dependent on their viability and on their potential to survive gastric acid and bile salts. Furthermore, the fact that lactobacilli can reach the vagina is not to be taken for granted as the gut microbiota and the vaginal microbiota differ greatly, which excludes a direct passage of all the species and strains present in the gut. It should also be pointed out that since none of the trials on oral use of lactobacilli in BV evaluated vaginal colonization by the administered strains, it cannot be excluded that the bacteria may have exerted a systemic immunomodulating effect thus conferring an improvement of the clinical conditions. Obviously, the timing of vaginal colonization after oral administration is longer compared to direct vaginal administration. In addition, the load of lactobacilli that can be delivered orally to the vagina is clearly lower than direct vaginal administration.

In conclusion, lactobacilli use in bacterial vaginosis is supported by positive results obtained in some clinical trials. However, substantial heterogeneity in products, trial methodologies and outcome measures do not provide sufficient evidence for or against recommending probiotics for the treatment of BV. Indeed, the trials with probiotics on BV have been conducted using different bacterial species and strains, dosage regimen, route of administration, duration of treatment and population under study. All these differences

could act as confounding factors hindering a real comparison among the trials and also may account for the different effectiveness of the treatments.

Larger, well-designed randomized controlled trials with standardized methodologies are needed to confirm the benefits of probiotics in the treatment of BV.

REFERENCES

- AMSEL R., TOTTEN P.A., SPIEGEL C.A., CHEN K.C.S., ESCHENBACH D., HOLMES K.K. (1983). Non specific vaginitis: diagnostic criteria and microbial and epidemiologic associations. *Am. J. Med.* **74**, 14-22.
- ANUKAM K., OSAZUWA E., AHONKHAI I., NGWU M., OSEMENE G., BRUCE A.W., REID G. (2006). Augmentation of antimicrobial metronidazole therapy of bacterial vaginosis with oral probiotic *Lactobacillus rhamnosus* GR-1 and *Lactobacillus reuteri* RC-14: randomized, double-blind, placebocontrolled trial. *Microbes. Infect.* 8, 1450-1454.
- Anukam K.C., Osazuwa E., Osemene G.I., Ehigiagbe F., Bruce A.W., Reid G. (2006). Clinical study comparing probiotic *Lactobacillus GR-1* and RC-14 with metronidazole vaginal gel to treat symptomatic bacterial vaginosis. *Microbes Infect.* 8, 2772-2776.
- Aroutcheva A., Gariti D., Simon M., Shott S., Faro J., Simoes J.A., Gurguis A., Faro S. (2001). Defense factors of vaginal lactobacilli. *Am. J. Obstet. Gynecol.* **185**, 375-379.
- Barrons R., Tassone D. (2008). Use of Lactobacillus probiotics for bacterial genitourinary infections in women: a review. *Clin. Ther.* **30**, 453-468.
- BAYER A.S., CHOW A.W., CONCEPCION N., GUZE L.B. (1978). Susceptibility of 40 lactobacilli to six antimicrobial agents with broad gram-positive anaerobic spectra. *Antimicrob. Agents Chemother.* **14**, 720-722.
- Beigi R.H., Austin M.N., Meyn L.A., Krohn M.A., Hillier S.L. (2004). Antimicrobial resistance associated with the treatment of bacterial vaginosis. *Am. J. Obstet. Gynecol.* **191**, 1124-1129.
- Borchers A.T., Selmi C., Meyers F.J., Keen C.L., Gershwin M.E. (2009). Probiotics and immunity. *J. Gastroenterol.* **44**, 26-46.
- Bradshaw C.S., Morton A.N., Hocking J., Garland S.M., Morris M.B., Moss L.M., Horvath L.B., Kuzevska I., Fairley C.K. (2006). High recurrence rates of bacterial vaginosis over the course of 12 months after oral metronidazole therapy and factors associated with recurrence. *J. Infect. Dis.* 193, 1478-1486.
- Bradshaw C.S., Pirotta M., De Guingand D., Hocking J.S., Morton A.N., Garland S.M., Fehler G., Morrow A., Walker S., Vodstrcil L.A., Fairley

- C.K. (2012). Efficacy of oral metronidazole with vaginal clindamycin or vaginal probiotic for bacterial vaginosis: randomised placebo-controlled double-blind trial. *PLoS One.* **7**, e34540.
- Bravo J.A., Forsythe P., Chew M.V., Escaravage E., Savignac H.M., Dinan T.G., Bienenstock J., Cryan J.F. (2011). Ingestion of Lactobacillus strain regulates emotional behavior and central GABA receptor expression in a mouse via the vagus nerve. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA.* **108**, 16050-16055.
- CHEN K.C., FORSYTH P.S., BUCHANAN T.M., HOLMES K.K. (1979). Amine content of vaginal fluid from untreated and treated patients with nonspecific vaginitis. *J. Clin. Invest.* **63**, 828-835.
- CHERPES T.L., MELAN M.A., KANT J.A., COSENTINO L.A., MEYN L.A., HILLIER S.L. (2005). Genital tract shedding of Herpes simplex virus type 2 in women: effects of hormonal contraception, bacterial vaginosis and vaginal group B Streptococcus colonization. *Clin. Infect. Dis.* 40, 1422-1428.
- CHERPES T.L., MEYN L.A., KROHN M.A., LURIE J.G., HILLIER S.L. (2003). Association between acquisition of herpes simplex virus type 2 in women and bacterial vaginosis. *Clin. Infect. Dis.* **37**, 319-325.
- CONTI C., MALACRINO C., MASTROMARINO P. (2009). Inhibition of herpes simplex virus type 2 by vaginal lactobacilli. *J. Physiol. Pharmacol.* **6**, 19-26.
- Cruciani F., Brigidi P., Calanni F., Lauro V., Tacchi R., Donders G., Peters K., Guaschino S., Vitali B. (2012). Efficacy of rifaximin vaginal tablets in treatment of bacterial vaginosis: a molecular characterization of the vaginal microbiota. *Antimicrob. Agents Chemother.* **56**, 4062-4070.
- DE MORENO DE LEBLANC A., MATAR C., PERDIGON G. (2007). The application of probiotics in cancer. *Br. J. Nutr.* **98**, S105-S110.
- DI PIETRO M., DE SANTIS F., DE BIASE D., SESSA R. (2013). The elusive but pathogenic peptidoglycan of *Chlamydiae. Eur. J. Inflamm.* 11, 257-260.
- ECKERT L.O., MOORE D.E., PATTON D.L., AGNEW K.J., ESCHENBACH D.A. (2003). Relationship of vaginal bacteria and inflammation with conception and early pregnancy loss following in-vitro fertilization. *Infect. Dis. Obstet. Gynecol.* 11, 11-17.
- ERIKSSON K, CARLSSON B., FORSUM U., LARSSON P.G. (2005). A double-blind treatment study of bacterial vaginosis with normal vaginal lactobacilli after an open treatment with vaginal clindamycin ovules. *Acta Derm. Venereol.* **85**, 42-46.
- ESCHENBACH D.A, DAVICK P.R, WILLIAMS B.L, KLEBANOFF S.J., YOUNG-SMITH K., CRITCHLOW C.M., HOLMES K.K. (1989). Prevalence of hydrogen peroxide-producing *Lactobacillus* species in normal women and women with bacterial vaginosis. *J. Clin. Microbiol.* **27**, 251-256.
- FALAGAS M.E., BETSI G.I., ATHANASIOU S. (2007). Probiotics for the treatment of women with bacterial vaginosis. Clin. Microbiol. Infect. 13, 657-664.

- FREDRICKS D.N., FIEDLER T.L., MARRAZZO J.M. (2005). Molecular identification of bacteria associated with bacterial vaginosis. N. Engl. J. Med. 353, 1899-1911.
- GEIER M.S., BUTLER R.N., HOWARTH G.S. (2006). Probiotics, prebiotics and symbiotics: a role in chemoprevention for colorectal cancer? *Cancer Biol. Ther.* **5**, 1265-1269.
- GOLDIN B.R., GORBACH S.L. (2008). Clinical indications for probiotics: an overview. *Clin. Infect. Dis.* 46 (Suppl. 2), S96-S100.
- HALLÉN A, JARSTRAND C, PÅHLSON C. (1992). Treatment of bacterial vaginosis with lactobacilli. Sex. Transm. Dis. 19, 146-148.
- HARMANLI O.H., CHENG G.Y., NYIRJESY P., CHATWANI A., GAUGHAN J.P. (2000). Urinary tract infections in women with bacterial vaginosis. *Obstet. Gynecol.* **95**, 710-712.
- HEMALATHA R., MASTROMARINO P., RAMALAXMI B.A., BALAKRISHNA N.V., SESIKERAN B. (2012). Effectiveness of vaginal tablets containing lactobacilli versus pH tablets on vaginal health and inflammatory cytokines: a randomized, double-blind study. *Eur. J. Clin. Microbiol. Infect. Dis.* **31**, 3097-3105.
- ISON C.A., HAY P.E. (2002). Validation of a simplified grading of Gram stained vaginal smears for use in genitourinary medicine clinics. *Sex. Transm. Infect.* **78**, 413-415.
- JOINT FAO/WHO WORKING GROUP REPORT ON DRAFTING GUIDELINES FOR THE EVALUATION OF PROBIOTICS IN FOOD. London, Ontario, Canada, April 30 and May 1, 2002. http://www.who.int/foodsafety/fs_management/en/probiotic_guidelines.pdf.
- KLEBANOFF M.A., SCHWEBKE J.R., ZHANG J., NANSEL T.R., YU K.F., ANDREWS W.W. (2004). Vulvovaginal symptoms in women with bacterial vaginosis. *Obstet. Gynecol.* **104**, 267-272.
- KLIGLER B., HANAWAY P., COHRSSEN A. (2007). Probiotics in children. *Pediatr. Clin. North. Am.* 54, 949-967.
- Koren O., Spor A., Felin J., Fåk F., Stombaugh J., Tremaroli V., Behre C.J., Knight R., Fagerberg B., Ley R.E., Bäckhed F. (2011). Human oral, gut, and plaque microbiota in patients with atherosclerosis. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA.* **108**, 4592-4598.
- Koumans E.M., Markowitz L.E., Hogan V. (2002). Indications for therapy and treatment recommendations for bacterial vaginosis in non-pregnant and pregnant women: a synthesis of data. *Clin. Infect. Dis.* **35** (Suppl. 2), S152-S172.
- LAM V., Su J., KOPROWSKI S., HSU A., TWEDDELL J.S., RAFIEE P., GROSS G.J., SALZMAN N.H., BAKER J.E. (2012). Intestinal microbiota determine severity of myocardial infarction in rats. FASEB J. 26, 1727-1735.
- Lamont R.F., Sobel J.D., Akins R.A., Hassan S.S., Chaiworapongsa T., Kusanovic J.P., Romero R. (2011). The vaginal microbiome: new information about genital tract flora using molecular based techniques. *BJOG.* **118**, 533-549.

- Larsson P.G., Stray-Pedersen B., Ryttig K.R., Larsen S. (2008). Human lactobacilli as supplementation of clindamycin to patients with bacterial vaginosis reduce the recurrence rate; a 6-month, double-blind, randomized, placebo-controlled study. *BMC Women's Health*. 2008; 8: 3. doi:10.1186/1472-6874-8-3
- Lye H.S., Rusul G., Liong M.T. (2010) Removal of cholesterol by lactobacilli via incorporation and conversion to coprostanol. *J. Dairy. Sci.* **93**, 1383-1392.
- MAGGI L., MASTROMARINO P., MACCHIA S., BRIGIDI P., PIROVANO F., MATTEUZZI D., CONTE U. (2000). Technological and biological evaluation of tablets containing different strains of lactobacilli for vaginal administration. *Eur. J. Pharm. Biopharm.* **50**, 389-395.
- MåRDH P.A. (1991). The vaginal ecosystem. *Am. J. Obstet. Gynecol.* **165**, 1163-1168.
- Martin H.L., Richardson B.A., Nyange P.M., Lavreys L., Hillier S.L., Chohan B., Mandaliya K., Ndinya-Achola J.O., Bwayo J., Kreiss J. (1999). Vaginal lactobacilli, microbial flora, and risk of human immunodeficiency virus type 1 and sexually transmitted disease acquisition. *J. Infect. Dis.* **180**, 1863-1868
- MASSI M., VITALI B., FEDERICI F., MATTEUZZI D., BRIGIDI P. (2004). Identification method based on PCR combined with automated ribotyping for tracking probiotic *Lactobacillus* strains colonizing the human gut and vagina. *J. Appl. Microbiol.* **96**, 777-786.
- MASTROMARINO P., BRIGIDI P., MACCHIA S., MAGGI L., PIROVANO F., TRINCHIERI V., CONTE U., MATTEUZZI D. (2002). Characterization and selection of vaginal *Lactobacillus* strains for the preparation of vaginal tablets. *J. Appl. Microbiol.* **93**, 884-893.
- MASTROMARINO P., MACCHIA S., MEGGIORINI L., TRINCHIERI V., MOSCA L., PERLUIGI M., MIDULLA C. (2009). Effectiveness of *Lactobacillus*-containing vaginal tablets in the treatment of symptomatic bacterial vaginosis. *Clin. Microbiol. Infect.* **15**, 67-74.
- MASTROMARINO P., CACCIOTTI F., MASCI A., MOSCA L. (2011). Antiviral activity of *Lactobacillus brevis* towards herpes simplex virus type 2: role of cell wall associated components. *Anaerobe*. **17**, 334-336.
- McLean N.W., McGroarty J.A. (1996). Growth inhibition of metronidazole-susceptible and metronidazole-resistant strains of *Gardnerella vaginalis* by lactobacilli in vitro. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* **62**, 1089-1092.
- Nova E., Warnberg J., Gomez-Martinez S., Diaz L.E., Romeo J., Marcos A. (2007). Immunomodulatory effects of probiotics in different stages of life. *Br. J. Nutr.* **98**, 90-95.
- NUGENT R.P., KROHN M.A., HILLIER S.L. (1991). Reliability of diagnosing bacterial vaginosis is improved by a standardized method of Gram stain interpretation. *J. Clin. Microbiol.* **29**, 297-301.
- PARENT D., BOSSENS M., BAYOT D., KIRKPATRICK C., GRAF

- F., WILKINSON F.E., KAISER R.R. (1996). Therapy of bacterial vaginosis using exogenously-applied Lactobacilli acidophili and a low dose of estriol: a placebo-controlled multicentric clinical trial. *Arzneimittelforschung.* **46**, 68-73.
- Petricevic L., Witt A. (2008). The role of *Lactobacillus* casei rhamnosus Lcr35 in restoring the normal vaginal flora after antibiotic treatment of bacterial vaginosis. *BJOG.* **115**, 1369-1374.
- RAO A.V., BESTED A.C., BEAULNE T.M., KATZMAN M.A., IORIO C., BERARDI J.M., LOGAN A.C. (2009). A randomized, double-blind, placebo-controlled pilot study of a probiotic in emotional symptoms of chronic fatigue syndrome. *Gut. Pathog.* 1, 6.
- Reid G., Bruce A.W., Fraser N., Heinemann C., Owen J., Henning B. (2001). Oral probiotics can resolve urogenital infections. *FEMS Immunol. Med. Microbiol.* **30**, 49-52.
- REID G., BRUCE A.W. (2001). Selection of *Lactobacillus* strains for urogenital probiotic applications. *J. Infect. Dis.* **183** (Suppl. 1), S77-S80.
- REID G., COOK R.L., BRUCE A.W. (1987). Examination of strains of lactobacilli for properties that may influence bacterial interference in the urinary tract. *J. Urol.* **138**, 330-335.
- RÖNNQVIST P.D., FORSGREN-BRUSK U.B., GRAHN-HÅKANSSON E.E. (2006). Lactobacilli in the female genital tract in relation to other genital microbes and vaginal pH. *Acta Obstet. Gynecol. Scand.* **85**, 726-735.
- Ross S.A., Novak Z., Ashrith G., Rivera L.B., Britt W.J., Hedges S., Schwebke J.R., Boppana A.S. (2005). Association between genital tract cytomegalovirus infection and bacterial vaginosis. *J. Infect. Dis.* **192**, 1727-1730.
- Sessa R., DI Pietro M., Schiavoni G., Galdiero M., Cipriani P., Romano S., Zagaglia C., Santino I., Faccilongo S., Del Piano M. (2006). *Chlamydia pneumoniae* in asymptomatic carotid atherosclerosis. *Int. J. Immunopathol. Pharmacol.* **19**, 111-118.
- Sessa R., Di Pietro M., Schiavoni G., Petrucca A., Cipriani P., Zagaglia C., Nicoletti M., Santino I., del Piano M. (2007). Measurement of *Chlamydia pneumoniae* bacterial load in peripheral blood mononuclear cells may be helpful to assess the state of chlamydial infection in patients with carotid atherosclerotic disease. *Atherosclerosis.* 195, e224-e230.
- Sha B.E., Zariffard M.R., Wang Q.J., Chen H.Y., Bremer J., Cohen M.H., Spear G.T. (2005). Female genital-tract HIV load correlates inversely with *Lactobacillus* species but positively with bacterial vaginosis and *Mycoplasma hominis*. *J. Infect. Dis.* 191, 25-32.
- SIEBER R., DIETZ U.T. (1998). *Lactobacillus acidophilus* and yogurt in the prevention and therapy of bacterial vaginosis. *Int. Dairy. J.* **8**, 599-607.
- SOBEL J.D., FERRIS D., SCHWEBKE J., NYIRJESY P.,

- WIESENFELD H.C., PEIPERT J., SOPER D., OHMIT S.E., HILLIER S.L. (2006). Suppressive antibacterial therapy with 0.75% metronidazole vaginal gel to prevent recurrent bacterial vaginosis. *Am. J. Obstet. Gynecol.* **194**, 1283-1289.
- Sobel J.D. (1997). Vaginitis. N. Engl. J. Med. **337**, 1896-1903.
- Srinivasan S., Fredricks D.N. (2008). The human vaginal bacterial biota and bacterial vaginosis. *Interdiscip. Perspect. Infect. Dis.* 2008; 750479. Epub 2009 Feb 16.
- Strus M., Chmielarczyk A., Kochan P., Adamski P., Chełmicki Z., Chełmicki A., Pałucha A., Heczko P.B. (2012). Studies on the effects of probiotic Lactobacillus mixture given orally on vaginal and rectal colonization and on parameters of vaginal health in women with intermediate vaginal flora. *Eur. J. Obstet. Gynecol. Reprod. Biol.* 163, 210-215.
- US DEPT OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES, FOOD AND DRUG ADMINISTRATION, CENTER FOR DRUG EVALUATION AND RESEARCH. GUIDANCE FOR INDUSTRY: BACTERIAL VAGINOSIS-DEVELOPING ANTIMICROBIAL DRUGS FOR TREATMENT. (1998). 7/21/98. http://www.fda.gov/cder/guidance/2572dft.pdf.
- Velraeds M.C., van der Belt B., van der Mei H.C., Reid G., Busscher H.J. (1998). Interference in ini-

- tial adhesion of uropathogenic bacteria and yeasts silicone rubber by a *Lactobacillus acidophilus* biosurfactant. *J. Med. Microbiol.* **49**, 790-794.
- VERSTRAELEN H., SENOK A.C. (2005). Vaginal Lactobacilli, probiotics and IVF. *Reprod. Biomed. Online*; **11**, 674-675.
- Vouloumanou E.K., Makris G.C., Karageorgopoulos D.E., Falagas M.E. (2009). Probiotics for the prevention of respiratory tract infections: a systematic review. *Int. J. Antimicrob. Agents.* **34**, 197.e1-10.
- Wang Z., Klipfell E., Bennett B.J., Koeth R., Levison B.S., Dugar B., Feldstein A.E., Britt E.B., Fu X., Chung Y.M., Wu Y., Schauer P., Smith J.D., Allayee H., Tang W.H., Di Donato J.A., Lusis A.J., Hazen S.L. (2011). Gut flora metabolism of phosphatidylcholine promotes cardiovascular disease. *Nature*. **472**, 57-63.
- WIESENFELD H., HILLIER S., KROHN M.A., LANDERS D., SWEET R. (2003). Bacterial vaginosis is a strong predictor of *Neisseria gonorrhoeae* and *Chlamydia trachomatis* infection. *Clin. Infect. Dis.* **36**, 663-668.
- YA W., REIFER C., MILLER L.E. (2010). Efficacy of vaginal probiotic capsules for recurrent bacterial vaginosis: a double-blind, randomized, placebo-controlled study. Am. J. Obstet. Gynecol. 203 (2), 120.e1-6.