

Michael J. Vlach

The Church as a Replacement of Israel:

An Analysis of Supersessionism

EDIS

Edition Israelologie

Band 2

PETER LANG

Internationaler Verlag der Wissenschaften

TABLE OF CONTENTS

FOREWORD	11
PREFACE	13
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	15
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION: DEFINING SUPERSESSIONIONISM ...	17
Purpose	17
Importance of Supersessionism to Theology.....	20
Doctrine of God.....	21
Christology	21
Soteriology	22
Ecclesiology	23
Eschatology	23
Recent Events.....	24
Defining Supersessionism	25
Variations within Supersessionism.....	27
Punitive Supersessionism	27
Economic Supersessionism	29
Structural Supersessionism	31
Variations on the Future of Israel.....	33
Distinction Between Supersessionism and Non-supersessionism	37
Conclusion.....	38
CHAPTER 2: SUPERSESSIONIONISM IN CHURCH HISTORY	41
Introduction	41
The Origin and Acceptance of Supersessionism	43
Increasing Gentile Composition of the Early Church	43
The Church’s Perspective on the Two Destructions of Jerusalem.....	45

Hermeneutical Issues.....	47
Supersessionism in the Patristic Era.....	49
Justin Martyr	51
Origen.....	52
Augustine	54
Supersessionism in the Medieval Era.....	56
Medieval Art	57
Thomas Aquinas.....	58
Supersessionism in the Reformation Era.....	59
Martin Luther	59
John Calvin	61
Other Reformers.....	61
Supersessionism in the Modern Era	67
Immanuel Kant.....	67
Friedrich Schleiermacher	68
Karl Barth.....	70
The Holocaust and the Modern State of Israel	73
Churches and Denominations Since the Holocaust.....	74
Dispensationalism	77
Historical Jesus Research	79
Conclusion.....	80
CHAPTER 3: THE THEOLOGICAL CASE FOR SUPERSESSIONISM.....	83
Introduction	83
The Hermeneutics of Supersessionism.....	84
Interpretive Priority of the New Testament.....	85
Typological Interpretation.....	88
Non-literal Fulfillment of Old Testament Prophecies	94

Acts 2:16-21	95
Acts 15:15-18	95
Romans 9:24-26	97
Theological Arguments of Supersessionism	97
Permanent Rejection of National Israel.....	98
Matt 21:43	98
Rom 11:26.....	101
New Testament Silence.....	104
Application of Israelite Imagery to the Church.....	105
Gal 6:16.....	105
Rom 9:6.....	109
Rom 2:28-29.....	110
1 Pet 2:9-10	111
Gal 3:7, 29.....	114
Unity Between Jews and Gentiles	115
Eph 2:11-22	115
Rom 11:17-24.....	117
Church's Relationship to the New Covenant (Heb 8:8-13).....	118
Conclusion.....	119
CHAPTER 4: THE THEOLOGICAL CASE FOR NON-SUPERSESSIONISM.....	121
Introduction	121
The Hermeneutics of Non-supersessionism	122
Old Testament Not Reinterpreted by New Testament.....	123
Unconditional Promises Not Canceled by Progressive Revelation	126
Israel Not a Type	128

Multiple Fulfillment/Application of Old Testament Promises	130
Theological Arguments of Non-supersessionism	132
New Testament Keeps Israel and the Church Distinct	132
New Testament Affirms a Future for National Israel	134
Matt 19:28/Luke 22:30	134
Matt 23:37–39/Luke 13:34–35	137
Luke 21:24	141
Acts 1:6–7	144
Romans 11	147
Salvific Equality and Functional Distinctions	149
Fulfillment of New Covenant with Israel and the Church	151
Conclusion	154
CHAPTER 5: EVALUATION OF SUPERSESSIONISM AND NON-SUPERSESSIONISM	157
Introduction	157
Challenges in Evaluating Supersessionism and Non-supersessionism	157
Evaluating the Case for Supersessionism	158
Hermeneutics of Supersessionism	158
Theological Arguments of Supersessionism	165
National Israel’s Permanent Rejection	166
Matt 21:43	166
Rom 11:26	168
New Testament Silence	170
Application of Old Testament Language to the Church	172
Gal 6:16	172
Rom 9:6	175

Rom 2:28–29.....	175
1 Pet 2:9–10	177
Gal 3:7, 29.....	180
Unity Between Jews and Gentiles	181
Eph 2:11–22	181
Rom 11:17–24.....	183
New Covenant Fulfilled with the Church.....	184
Summary	185
Evaluating the Case for Non-supersessionism	185
Hermeneutics of Non-supersessionism	185
Theological Arguments for Non-supersessionism	188
Distinction between Israel and the Church.....	188
New Testament Affirms a Future for National Israel.....	189
Matt 19:28/Luke 22:30	189
Matt 23:39/Luke 13:35	190
Luke 21:24	192
Acts 1:6.....	194
Romans 11	196
Salvific Unity and Functional Distinctions	198
New Covenant for both Israel and the Church	199
Summary	201
Conclusion.....	202
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	207