Perspectives

Evocations of Mahler: "Mahlerian" Music by Others

by David B. Ellis

"Mahlerian" is an adjective whose time has more than come. When it occurs, the word is used to connote length, large orchestration, wild emotional qualities (particularly *Angst*), and the inclusion of widely disparate musical styles within a single piece. Although it is encouraging that "Mahlerian" seems, on balance, a positive term, its over-use has reduced its descriptive qualities. This article limits the term "Mahlerian" to works with either a strong emotional resemblance to Mahler's music or those which appear to allude to specific works by Mahler. This allusion may include an auditory similarity or an apparent structural resemblance of at least some portion of the work to a Mahlerian model.

COMPOSER	WORK	YEAR	MAHLERIAN ASSOCIATION
Karłowicz	"Rebirth" Symphony	1902	Symphonies Nos. 1 and 2
Foerster	Symphony no. 4	1905	Symphony no. 2
Suk	**"Asrael" (Symphony)**	1905	Symphony no. 2*, Das Lied von der Erde*
Webern	Langsamer Satz	1905	Symphony no. 4
Webern	Six Pieces, Op 6	1909	Symphony no. 2
Zemlinsky	Six Songs, Op 13	1913	Symphony no. 9
Berg	**Three Pieces, Op 6**	1914	Symphonies Nos. 6,7, and 9
Irgens-Jensen	*Japanischer Frühling*	1919	*Das Lied von der Erde*
Zemlinsky	*Lyric* Symphony	1922	*Das Lied von der Erde*
Krenek	Symphony no. 2	1922	Symphonies Nos. 6 and 10
Miaskovsky	Symphony no. 6	1923	Symphony no. 6, *Das Lied von der Erde*
Berg	*Wozzeck*	1925	Symphony no. 2*,* "Revelge"
Zemlinsky	Sinfonietta	1934	Symphony no. 5
Berg	**Violin Concerto**	1935	Symphony no. 5, *Das Lied von der Erde*
Shostakovich	**Symphony no. 10**	1953	*Das Lied von der Erde*
Rochberg	*Music for the Magic Theater*	1965	Symphony no. 9
Berio	*Sinfonia*	1968	Symphony no. 2
Crumb	*Ancient Voices of Children*	1970	*Das Lied von der Erde*
Rochberg	*Caprice Variations*	1970	Symphony no. 5
Rochberg	**String Quartet no. 3**	1972	Symphonies Nos. 4, 5, and 9
Rochberg	**Violin Concerto**	1975	General emotional resemblance
Gorecki	Symphony no. 3	1976	*Kindertotenlieder*
Silvestrov	Symphony no. 5	1982	Symphony no. 5
Schnittke	String Quartet no. 3	1983	"Der Tamboursg'sell"
Adams	***Harmonielehre***	1985	Symphonies Nos. 4,5, and 10
Rochberg	Symphony no. 5	1985	Symphony no. 9
Schnittke	**Cello Concerto no. 1**	1986	General emotional resemblance
Schnittke	Piano Quartet	1988	Piano Quartet
Schnittke	**Concerto Grosso no. 4 / Symphony no. 5**	1988	Symphonies Nos. 2 and 6, Piano Quartet
Korndorf	Hymn III (in Honor of Gustav Mahler)	1990	Symphony no. 4
Silvestrov	*Dedication* (Symphony for Violin & Orch.)	1991	Symphony no. 9
Silvestrov	*Stufen*	1994	*Ich bin der Welt abhanden gekommen*
Bell	*Mahler in Blue Light*	1996	*Das Lied von der Erde*

The summary table contains a list of arguably "Mahlerian" works, along with my hearing of their association with Mahler's music. The works in bold type are those which I would particularly recommend as suggestions for further listening to someone who wanted to hear music similar to that of Mahler. (Boldface type, or its lack, should not be taken as any implication of artistic quality). In order to keep this article within space constraints, I have omitted coverage of Benjamin Britten [1]and of Dmitri Shostakovich, except for the latter's Tenth Symphony. Mahler's influence on Shostakovich was profound and can be heard in so many works that the subject is beyond the scope of this article.

Hans Rott
Before expanding on the summary table, adherence to the title compels mention of one of the most Mahlerian pieces of all, the Symphony in E Major (1878) by Hans Rott (1858-1884). It is not included in the table because the thesis of this article implies influence by Mahler, but Rott's Symphony predates Mahler's First Symphony by ten years. The beginning of Rott's Scherzo (the third movement of his Symphony in E) sounds, to my ears, quite close to the beginning of the Scherzo ("Ländler") of Mahler's First Symphony. This same passage, however, was definitely used by Mahler in the Scherzo of his Second Symphony.[2] Rott's slow movement (the second movement) contains two passages which seemingly furnished Mahler with material for the Adagio of his own Third Symphony.[3]

Karłowicz
The similarities between Mahler and the "Rebirth" Symphony of Mieczyslaw Karłowicz (1876-1909) are programmatic rather than musical.The score translates the title of the symphony into German as "Auferstehung", which of course is the title of Mahler's Second Symphony. Karłowicz wrote an extensive "poem" whose words for the first movement begin "Requiem aeternam…Dreary, ominous singing, mingling with the fumes of incense, flows from the coffin of shattered youthful dreams." Near the end of the movement the poem states "But now the hour for the miracle seems to be approaching…It seems about to be become triumphant…No…Too early…That also was an illusion. And because the nearer the moment of rebirth seemed to be, the stronger and more distressing is the disappointment."[4]

Karłowicz's poem goes on at great length about the struggles of the soul to achieve rebirth, and in rendering the ideas in the Symphony, Karłowicz composed a work in four movements, which takes about forty minutes to perform.. The poem for the final movement has the soul advancing toward victory: "Only one step more! But it is still too early. There is still one more trial…It is a hard trial, perhaps the hardest of all. But the soul's power is mighty…."and so forth to final rebirth. These words are extremely close to Mahler's description of his First Symphony in his 1894 letter to Richard Strauss in which he explains why Strauss could not excise a major portion of the Finale:

In the passage you mention, the denouement is only an illusion (in the true sense of the word a 'false conclusion'). I needed to turn back, for the whole being to touch rock bottom, before a real victory could be obtained. The battle I was concerned with was the one in which victory is always furthest away when the fighter thinks it is at hand. That is the essence of any spiritual combat. It is not easy to be a hero![5]

Despite these verbal similarities to the programs of Mahler's first two symphonies, Karłowicz's "Rebirth" Symphony is much more akin to Tchaikovsky 's Fifth musically, since both Karłowicz and Tchaikovsky use mottos (in E Minor) to represent fate, and then transform those mottos to E Major rebirth/triumph in their respective Finales.

Foerster, Suk
Both Josef Bohuslav Foerster (1859-1951) and Josef Suk (1874-1935) shared Mahler's Bohemian heritage. Foerster was with Mahler in Hamburg and attended the funeral of Hans von Bülow, at which Klopstock's ode "Auferstehung" was sung. It was Foerster who first "guessed the secret" that Mahler would use this ode as the words for the Finale of his "Resurrection" Symphony.[6] In 1905 Foerster composed what I think of as a smaller scale, Czech "Resurrection" as his Fourth Symphony, titled "Easter Eve". The first movement is a funeral march "Calvary" in C Minor (mirroring Mahler's funeral march in the same key), followed by two shorter inner movements – "A Child's Good Friday" and "The Charm of Solitude"- and a Finale in C Major (the parallel major rather than Mahler's relative major of E-flat) titled "The Victory of Holy Saturday" with an organ, without a chorus, but with a triumphant nature similar to that of Mahler's "Resurrection" Symphony.

Josef Suk married the daughter of Antonin Dvorak, and composed his "Asrael" Symphony as a memorial to both his wife and her father after their deaths in 1904. (Asrael is the angel of death in Muslim mythology). The combination of the Symphony's five movements, approximately one hour in length, large orchestra, and "fate"motif virtually compels the "Mahlerian" adjective, which is fully deserved in this piece. The final C-Major transfiguration of the fate motif (previously hammered on the timpani like that motif in Mahler's Sixth Symphony), combines both the tonality and the emotional feeling of acceptance of the end of *Das Lied von der Erde,* but composed three years earlier.

Zemlinsky, Irgens-Jensen
Alexander von Zemlinsky (1871-1942) and Ludvig Irgens-Jensen (1894-1969) have at least one thing in common: orchestral song cycles modeled on *Das Lied von der Erde*. Zemlinsky is well known as a teacher and as the composer of the *Lyric Symphony*, which he stated was based on Mahler's *Das Lied von der Erde*. In his *Lyrische Symphonie* (*Lyric Symphony)* Zemlinsky set seven poems by the Indian author Rabindrath Tagore, to be sung alternately by soprano and baritone. The poetry evokes the world-weariness found in the texts that Mahler used for *Das Lied*, although Zemlinsky's music resembles more the style that Schoenberg used in the first part of the cantata *Gurrelieder* than any music by Mahler.

The Norwegian Irgens-Jensen composed *Japanischer Frühling* as a nine-song cycle for soprano and piano in 1919 and orchestrated it in 1957. The texts are from a volume of Japanese poems translated into German by Hans Bethge, whose *Die chinesische Flöte* was Mahler's source for the texts he used in *Das Lied von der Erde*. The Japanese poems evoke a melancholy similar to those of *Das Lied*. Here, in translation, is the final Japanese poem, titled "Permanence in Change:"

The cherry tree blossomed. Black and young
My hair fell about my head, as I danced.
The cherry tree blossomed. Fresh and young
It shimmered, - my hair had turned gray.
Today the cherry tree blossoms again.
Heavenly young
Its blossoms smile down as always,-
My hair turning white, I stand deep in thought.[7]

These words evoke the end of *Das Lied* much more closely than does the music, which is wistfully romantic and pentatonic, like the middle songs of *Das Lied*. However, there is no analogue to Mahler's "Der Abschied" beyond the text quoted above, which requires approximately two minutes to perform – the entire cycle is about 25 minutes in duration.

Zemlinsky's Sinfonietta, Op 23 evokes the Scherzo of Mahler's Fifth Symphony in its first movement according to Adorno[8] and the Finale of

[1] Donald Mitchell's studies on Mahler, particularly *Songs and Symphonies of Life and Death*, reprinted. (Woodbridge, England: The Boydell Press, 2002) provide details on this influence, particularly pp. 604-5.

[2] James L. Zychowicz, "Gustav Mahler's Motives and Motivation in his "Resurrection" Symphony: The Apotheosis of Hans Rott," in *For the Love of Music: Festschrift in Honor of Theodore Front on his 90th Birthday*, edited by Darwin F. Scott (Lucca, Italy: LIM Antiqua, 2002), p. 137-63.

[3] Peter Franklin, *Mahler: Symphony No. 3* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991), pp. 75-76.

[4] Mieczyslaw Karłowicz, "*Rebirth*" Symphony in E minor (Krakow: Polskie Wydawnictwo Muzyczne, 1993), p. xxii-xxvi. (no translator listed)

[5] Quoted by Henry-Louis de La Grange in *Mahler, vol. 1* (Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday & Co., 1973) p. 758.

[6] La Grange, *op. cit.*, p.294.

[7] Ludvig Irgens-Jensen, *Japanischer Frühling*, Simax CD PSC 1164, translation by Thilo Reinhard.

Mahler's Fifth in its third and final movement according to A. Peter Brown.[9] However, Zeminsky seems closer to Mahler in his set of Six Songs, Op 13 (the so-called "Maeterlinck" Lieder), the last of which has been described as "heavily influenced by" Mahler's Ninth Symphony.[10] This association was seemingly recognized in the June 2004 concert of the Northwestern University Symphony Orchestra, which paired these two works.

Berg, Webern

Because Alban Berg (1885-1935) and Anton von Webern (1883-1945) are among the most studied composers of the twentieth century, my comments will only deal with subjective auditory resemblances to Mahler's music. The fourth of Webern's *Six Pieces for Orchestra* is a funeral march, which culminates in a percussion crescendo (probably the loudest moment of all of his works) very much like that representing the graves bursting open in the Finale of Mahler's "Resurrection" Symphony. (In fact, Webern's *Six Pieces for Orchestra* preceded, without intermission, Mahler's Second Symphony in a concert at the 2003 Edinburgh Festival) [11] Webern's *Langsamer Satz* is a nine-minute movement for string quartet based upon the second theme of the slow movement of Mahler's Fourth Symphony.[12]

The Mahlerian aspects in Berg's compositions are strong and varied. Berg's *Three Pieces for Orchestra*, Op 6 are based on three Mahler symphonies, respectively the first movement of the Ninth, the Scherzo of the Seventh, and the fourth movement of the Sixth.[13] The third piece, the "Marsch" includes five hammer blows, thus strengthening the resemblance to the Finale of the Sixth with its three (or later, two) hammer blows. Berg's Violin Concerto includes a chorale as an important part of its overall structure similarly to Mahler's Fifth Symphony, and that chorale concludes on "a chord that is almost certainly…a quote" [14] of the final chord of *Das Lied*, which accompanies the repeated word "ewig."

Moreover, *Wozzeck*, Berg's first opera, includes a percussion crescendo (the end of scene two of act three) like that of the "Resurrection" Symphony and Webern's *Six Pieces for Orchestra*. In act one, scene three of *Wozzeck* a military band plays on stage followed by the character Marie's singing the words of "Soldaten, Soldaten" to the same tune as the words of "Ach Bruder, ach Bruder" in Mahler's *Wunderhorn* song "Revelge," which itself contains effects that suggest a military band. Finally, the orchestral interlude before the final scene of the opera (entitled "Invention on a key") conveys the emotional feel of Mahler's music well enough to elicit the comment that "*Wozzeck* was the best opera that Gustav Mahler never wrote!"[15]

Krenek

Perhaps the best known Mahlerian connection of the composer Ernst Krenek (1900-91) was his preparation of the Adagio and "Purgatorio" movements of Mahler's Tenth Symphony for their Vienna performance of October 1924.[16] In addition, he was married to Anna Mahler between 1923 and 1926, having met her in 1922, the year in which he composed his Second and Third Symphonies. His stated goal then was "to be Gustav Mahler's successor as a symphonic composer."[17] Krenek's Second Symphony, although lacking conventional key centers, is certainly approachable as compared to post- 1945 serial pieces. It takes over an hour to perform, and its large orchestra inspired Krenek to recall that:

> For a long time I have thought this must be the loudest piece of music I have ever heard, with the exception, possibly, of Milhaud's *Orestie*. That work, however, includes a huge choir.[18]

The very end of Krenek's Symphony calls for repeated *fff* blows on the timpani, bass drum, and tam-tam which give a strong sense of finality in spite of the lack of tonality. Krenek stated that if an epithet were to be attached by an historian to his works this should be called his "Tragic" Symphony. The Finale of this work has the character of the desperate Finale of Mahler's Sixth Symphony and also alludes to, although loudly, the three note theme played by the cellos and basses just before the final outburst of the "fate"motif at the very end of Mahler's work. There is also an Adagio episode for violins in Krenek's Finale which resembles the Adagio of Mahler's Tenth Symphony.[19]

Miaskovsky

Nicolai Miaskovsky (1881-1950) composed 27 symphonies, of which the Sixth is by far the longest (about 65 minutes) and also the only one to use a chorus. It appeared in nine seasons of the Chicago Symphony Orchestra between 1927 and 1940; its popularity leading to Miaskovsky's commission to compose his Symphony no. 21 for the Fiftieth Anniversary season of the Orchestra. The closest direct Mahlerian allusion is in the second movement Scherzo, whose trio features a celesta-dominated theme very similar to the transitional theme (between the march theme and the "Alma" theme) of the first movement of Mahler's Sixth Symphony (the main theme of Miaskovsky's first movement also resembles the march theme of Mahler's first movement). However, a more compelling emotional resemblance comes near the end of Miaskovsky's Finale with a brief choral passage setting a Russian sacred chant depicting the separation of the soul from the body, with the body resting in the mother-earth while the soul ascends to the judgment of God. As Stephen E. Hefling has noted in describing *Das Lied von der Erde*, "Mahler had envisaged the moment of the soul's departure from earth in three of his earlier symphonies -- the Second, Fourth, and Eighth".[20] And it is the conclusion of *Das Lied* that the ending of Miaskovsky's Sixth Symphony calls to mind, as it shifts from the minor to the major while the violins ascend apparently toward heaven.

Shostakovich

Although most of the music by Dmitri Shostakovich (1906-75) is beyond the scope of this article, one allusion deserves mention: the horn call in the third movement of the Shostakovich Tenth Symphony, which comes close to a direct quotation of the opening horn call from *Das Lied*. This horn theme is simultaneously a musical signature for the first name of Elmira Nazirova, a composition student of Shostakovich in the early 1950s. Shostakovich wrote numerous letters to Nazirova while composing the Tenth Symphony, and they provide strong evidence for the above references. [21]

Moreover, Mahler's *Das Lied von der Erde* was special to Shostakovich, as indicated by the Polish composer Krzysztof Meyer:

---

[8] A. Peter Brown, *The Symphonic Repertoire*, vol. 4: *The Second Golden Age of the Viennese Symphony*: *Brahms, Bruckner, Dvorak, Mahler, and Selected Contemporaries* (Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University Press, 2003), p. 801.

[9] Brown, *ibid*.

[10] Derrick Puffett, "Berg, Mahler and the Three Orchestral Pieces Op. 6", pp. 111-44 in *The Cambridge Companion to Berg* edited by Anthony Pople (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997) p. 121.

[11] This concert of August 22, 2003 was reviewed in *Naturlaut*, Vol. 2, No. 3.

[12] Henry Louis de La Grange, *Gustav Mahler, vol. 3* : *Vienna: The Triumph and Disillusion (1904-1907)* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999), p. 117.

[13] Puffett, *op. cit.*, p. 121-122.

[14] Robert P. Morgan, "The Eternal Return: Retrograde and Circular Form in Berg," pp.111-40 in *Alban Berg: Historical and Analytical Perspectives*, ed by David Gable and Robert P. Morgan (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991).

[15] John Rea, "*Wozzeck* – Alban Berg's Masterful Operatic", *La Scena Musicale*, 8 (May 2000), www.scena.org/lsm/sm5-8/wozeck-en.htm.

[16] Ernst Krenek, Symphony No. 2, (Vienna: Universal Edition, 2002), Christoph Schlüren, Preface to the score, no pagination.

[17] Christoph Schlüren, *op. cit*.

[18] Christoph Schlüren, *op. cit*.

[19] Claudia Zenck, "The Historical Place of Krenek's Second Symphony", unpublished paper, 1978) quoted by John Stewart, *Ernst Krenek: The Man and His Music* (Berkeley, California: University of California Press, 1991), p. 401.

[20] Stephen E. Hefling,, "Das Lied von der Erde" pp.438-66 in *The Mahler Companion*, ed. by Donald Mitchell and Andrew Nicholson (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999), p. 441.

[21] Nelly Kravetz, "A New Insight into the Tenth Symphony of Dmitry Shostakovich" in *Shostakovich in Context,* ed. by Rosamund Bartlett (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), p. 159-74.

He always raved about Mahler.When I asked him which of his symphonies he rated highest, he hesitated and answered: "The First, to be sure, also the Second…and the Third…and also the Fourth, Fifth, Sixth, and Seventh…and the Eighth is marvellous…and the Ninth! And also the Tenth! But if someone told me that I had only one more hour to live, I would want to listen to the last movement of *The Song of the Earth*."[22]

Similarly, the great Mahler conductor Jascha Horenstein said "one of the saddest things about leaving this world is not to hear *Das Lied von der Erde* any more."[23]

Berio, Crumb

The *Sinfonia* (1968) of Luciano Berio (1925-2004) is possibly the most complex assemblage of musical quotations and allusions in Western music. A listing of these for the twelve minute third (middle) movement of this half hour piece requires 14 pages.[24] The tempo marking for this movement is *In ruhig fliessender Bewegung*, the same tempo indication that Mahler used for the third movement of his Second Symphony, which, through its almost complete quotation, provides the musical skeleton for Berio's movement. Additionally, Berio begins the fourth movement of his *Sinfonia* with the same first two notes that Mahler used to begin the fourth movement of his Second Symphony ("Urlicht"). Berio referred to his third movement as a "hommage, this time to Gustav Mahler (whose work seems to bear within it the weight of the entire history of music)".[25] Other easily discernible quotations include Debussy's *La Mer*, Ravel's *La Valse*, Strauss' *Der Rosenkavalier*, and Stravinsky's *Rite of Spring*.

The American composer George Crumb (b. 1929) juxtaposes flamenco and Bach along with a quotation from "Der Abschied" in his *Ancient Voices of Children* (1970). Mahler is a less significant component of quotation here than in Berio's *Sinfonia.*[26]

Rochberg

George Rochberg (b. 1918) antedated Berio's *Sinfonia* by three years in this "collage" technique of multiple quotations with his *Music for the Magic Theater*. Rochberg includes significant portions, although arranged for a chamber ensemble of 15 players, from the first and fourth Movements of Mahler's Ninth Symphony, along with Mozart's Divertimento, K.287, Beethoven's String Quartet, op. 130, and various quotations from Webern, Varese, Stockhausen and others. Rochberg's *Caprice Variations* (1970) continue the collage technique with variations devoted to Beethoven, Brahms, Schubert, and the Third Movement of Mahler's Fifth Symphony, all within the context of Paganini's famous Caprice no. 24.

In his Third String Quartet (1972) Rochberg moved from quotation and collage to including lengthy passages composed in the style of past composers. Its five movements encompass the styles of Bartok, late Beethoven, and Mahler along with the dissonance of Rochberg's own earlier serial style. Its most Mahlerian section is its fifth movement Finale: Scherzos and Serenades, in which I hear the third movement of Mahler's Fourth (the first variation of the principal theme beginning at m. 107) and the fifth movement of Mahler's Fifth Symphony (the first string fugato beginning in m. 55). However, for others this same Rochberg movement can evoke some aspects of Mahler's Ninth Symphony:

In this section of the quartet, then, Rochberg does not merely write in the language of late romanticism, or imitate the general style of Mahler, but rather he goes further, to create the specific ambience of the Mahler Ninth Symphony, which evokes, in a very Proustian sense, the listener's psychological experiences of this work.[27]

The third movement of the quartet, a set of variations was arranged by Rochberg into the 18 minute *Transcendental Variations* for string orchestra. The fourth movement of Mahler's Ninth Symphony is present near the very end of the *Variations*, although late Beethoven is heard by some listeners as the major inspiration of the movement taken as a whole. [28] However, the Quartet as a whole has been summarized as "a quartet…which sounded like the one that Mahler might have written".[29]

Similarly, when Rochberg's Violin Concerto was premiered in 1975, the Chicago *Tribune* review began with the question to the critic from a fellow attendee: "How did you like Mahler's Violin Concerto?" I would agree with that sentiment, particularly for the original version just recently issued on a Naxos CD.[30] Rochberg's Fifth Symphony, commissioned and premiered by the Chicago Symphony Orchestra, includes close allusions to Mahler's Ninth Symphony (this is one of at least three Rochberg pieces to reference the Ninth).

Gorecki

Those familiar with the Third Symphony of Henryk Gorecki (b. 1933) may wonder what connection it could possibly have with Mahler. Providing a brief background for those less familiar with the work will then lead to my view of a structural resemblance. Gorecki's Third Symphony, subtitled the *Symphony of Sorrowful Songs*, is comprised of three movements for soprano and orchestra requiring a little less than an hour to perform. The texts, sung in Polish, include a fifteenth-century lamentation, a brief prayer written on the walls of a Gestapo cell by an eighteen-year-old Polish girl in 1944, and a folk song portraying a mother's grief for her dead son. The musical textures are string dominated, tempi are uniformly slow, and dynamics reach fortissimo in only a few measures. There is also enough repetition and lack of harmonic change in each movement to cause many to classify the symphony as a "minimalist" work.

Despite -- or because of -- the above characteristics the Symphony has been recorded at least 13 times since its 1976 premiere, with the performance by Dawn Upshaw and conducted by David Zinman having already sold well over one million copies. It is almost certain that this CD has had more sales than all of the recordings ever made of all of the other 32 pieces on my list. More detail on the popularity of Gorecki's Third Symphony can be found in Michael Steinberg's *The Symphony*.[31] The third and final song of Gorecki's Third Symphony contains three verses (about half of the movement's duration) in A minor in which the mother laments the loss of her son, with these concluding words

> Perhaps the poor child
> Lies in a rough ditch,
> And instead, he could have been
> Lying in his warm bed.

At this point the key changes to an "unsullied diatonic A major"[32] to accompany the ecstatic final stanza

[22] Quoted in Elizabeth Wilson, Shostakovich: *A Life Remembered* (Princeton,N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1994) p. 465.

[23] Gustav Mahler, Symphony No. 9, Music & Arts CD 235, 1986, notes by Tanya Buchdahl.

[24] David Osmond-Smith, *Playing on Words: A Guide to Luciano Berio's Sinfonia (Royal Musical Association Monographs, No. 1)* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987), p. 95.

[25] John Webb, "Schnittke in Context", *Tempo* 182 (1992): 20.

[26] Crumb's *Songs, Drones, and Refrains of Death* (1968) is also reminiscent of Mahler according to Steven M. Bruns "'In stilo Mahleriano' Quotation and Allusion in the Music of George Crumb", *The American Music Research Center Journal* 3, (1993): 9-39.

[27] Jay Reise, "Rochberg the Progressive", Perspectives of New Music, 19 (February 1981), p. 395-407.

[28] Raymond Tuttle, review of Naxos CD 8.559115, 2003, www.classical.net/music/recs/reviews/n/nxs59115a.html.

[29] Peter Graeme Woolf, review of Naxos CD 8.559115, April 2004, www.musicalpointers.co.uk/reviews/cddvd/ROCHBERGViolinConcerto.htm.

[30] The original version is over 50 minutes in length. Isaac Stern requested cuts prior to the premiere which reduced the Concerto to about 35 minutes, to the particular detriment of the last movement

[31] Michael Steinberg, *The Symphony* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995), pp.169-77.

Oh sing for him,
God's little song-birds,
Since his mother cannot find him.
And you, God's little flowers,
May you blossom all around
So that my son may sleep a happy sleep.[33]

There is a brief return of A-minor material before an orchestral postlude in A major. A clear Mahlerian analogue for this song is "In Diesem Wetter", the fifth and final song of the *Kindertotenlieder*. The first half of the song in duration (four stanzas) is in the minor key (D Minor) and expresses the parent's anguish over the loss of the children. The final stanza moves to D major, supporting the consolation of the parent's "broad, lyrical, diatonic melody"[34] :

Sheltered by God's hand,
They are resting, as if in their mother's house.[35]

As in Gorecki's ending, there is an extensive orchestral postlude in the tonic major. The similarities of textual imagery between the two composers' texts are also striking.

As further support for a Mahlerian connection, Luke Howard has surveyed the many citations of influence on the Gorecki Third.[36] "But perhaps more surprising is the composer conspicuous by his absence from these lists: Gustav Mahler. Cited often by Gorecki as one of his most important influences, Mahler set crucial musical precedents that emerge in Gorecki's Third Symphony. In works such as *Das klagende Lied*, *Kindertotenlieder*, *Das Lied von der Erde*, and the Second, Fourth, and Eighth Symphonies, Mahler also explored in the vocal-orchestral medium the same themes that inform Gorecki's Third: death and heaven, child-like innocence, grief and redemption."[37]

Silvestrov, Korndorff

The three works of the Ukrainian Valentin Silvestrov (1937-) identified here share the characteristics of length, slow tempi, low dynamics, and nostalgic beauty. The Fifth Symphony has been "nominated" by Soviet Russian music expert David Fanning "as the finest symphony composed in the former Soviet Union since the death of Shostakovich".[38] The Adagietto from Mahler's Fifth Symphony, a portion of which is expanded upon and eventually recapitulated, plays a crucial role in Silvestrov's long single movement. *Dedication*, a symphony for violin and orchestra, was written for Gidon Kremer, who when listening to his recording "spontaneously shouted out 'Death in Venice'. And after a moment, then closer to the truth, 'Death in Kiev'."[39] (It is Mahler's Ninth Symphony alluded to, however, rather than the Fifth Symphony as implied by Kremer's comment.) *Stufen* is a cycle of eleven songs for soprano and piano which take about an hour to perform. As Fanning states in his review of the work: "Elegy and world-weariness are the prevailing tones, as though Silvestrov had somehow climbed inside Mahler's 'Ich bin der Welt abhanden gekommen' and miraculously discovered a twin planet."[40]

Nikolai Korndorf (1947- 2001) composed three hymns for orchestra, of which the third was commissioned in honor of Gustav Mahler. Its 35 minutes of stable tonality do not contain a single accidental. Korndorf identifies the Mahlerian elements to include the "pure, celestial timbre of the soprano solo" (as in Mahler's Fourth Symphony) and his use of off-stage trumpets.[41]

Schnittke

Until last November, I was unaware of any particular Mahlerian associations in the music of Alfred Schnittke (1934-98). My awakening was an overwhelming performance of Schnittke's Concerto Grosso 4/Symphony 5 conducted by Cliff Colnot and the Civic Orchestra of Chicago (the training orchestra for the Chicago Symphony Orchestra). The sheer physical impact of this music requires live performance, which is also true for Mahler's symphonies. At the conclusion of the piece's four movements, my initial response was that the movement was a worthy successor to the Finale of Mahler's Sixth. And this was after having heard, in the second movement, fragments of Mahler's Piano Quartet of 1876.

The explanation for the presence of the Piano Quartet is that Mahler completed only one movement of the quartet and left only a few sketches for a second movement. Schnittke, in 1988, composed a second movement based on Mahler's sketches and thus created a Mahler/Schnittke Piano Quartet. Also in 1988, the Royal Concertgebouw Orchestra of Amsterdam commissioned for its centenary a symphony from Schnittke, which he fulfilled with two movements of "Concerto Grosso", the second of which is an orchestration of his new piano quartet movement, and two further movements of "Symphony". According to Ronald Weitzman, Schnittke's piece is "surely modeled on Mahler's Second", although "any hint of resurrection is resolutely crushed."[42] He describes the fourth and final movement as "a funeral march of stark originality, ferocious even by Schnittke's standards, where the hammer – blows make those in Mahler's Sixth sound as timid taps by comparison." In fact, Schnittke's score, unlike Mahler's Sixth and Berg's *Three Pieces for Orchestra*, Op. 6, does not include the hammer as an instrument. However, the spirit of Weitzman's comments is correct based on the ferocity of what I heard the Civic Orchestra produce in Orchestra Hall.

Schnittke has also incorporated Mahler using the collage technique, for example in the final movement of the Third String Quartet, where an allusion to "Der Tamboursg'sell" from *Des Knaben Wunderhorn* is joined with references to Lassus, Beethoven's Grosse Fuge, and the "DSCH" motif. [43]

Upon further investigation, it seems that Schnittke is second only to Shostakovich in being influenced by Mahler. Since there is also a clear Shostakovich influence in many of Schnittke's works, any further distinctions are all but impossible to determine. Even so, Schnittke's First Cello Concerto rivals only the Fifth Symphony in Schnittke's ouevre for Mahlerian emotional feel. The importance of the concerto genre for Schnittke has been highlighted by the musicologist Richard Taruskin:

> With a bluntness and immodesty practically unseen since the days of Mahler, Schnittke tackles life-against-death, love-against-hate, good-against-evil, freedom-against-tyranny, and (especially in the concertos) I-against-the-world.[44]

Schnittke was composing his First Cello Concerto for Natalia Gutman in 1985 when he suffered a stroke so severe that he was pronounced clinically dead three times. While recovering, he discovered that he had forgotten all that he sketched out in his head, so he had to start over.[45] The originally planned three movements, with a short fast

[32] Wilfred Mellers, Round and About Gorecki's Symphony No. 3, *Tempo* 168 (1989): 22-24.

[33] Steinberg, *op. cit*., p. 176-77.

[34] Peter Russell, *Light in Battle with Darkness: Mahler's Kindertotenlieder*, (Bern: Peter Lang, 1991) p. 109.

[35] Gustav Mahler, *Kindertotenlieder*, DG CD 431 682-2, 1991.

[36] Luke B. Howard, "Motherhood, `Billboard,' and the Holocaust: Perceptions and Receptions of Gorecki's Symphony No. 3," *The Musical Quarterly* 82 (Spring 1998): 131-59.

[37] Howard, *op. cit*.

[38] David Fanning, review of Silvestrov Symphony No. 5, Sony Classical SK 66 825, *Gramophone Magazine* 74 (October 1996): 65.

[39] Valentin Silvestrov, Dedication, Teldec CD 4509-99206. Note by Gidon Kremer.

[40] David Fanning, review of Silvestrov *Stufen*, Megadisc MDC 7832. *Gramophone Magazine* (2003): 69.

[41] Nikolai Korndorf , A New Heaven: Hymn II, Hymn III, Sony Classical SK 66 824, 1996. Interview of Nikolai Korndorf by Ted Levin.

[42] Ronald Wieitzman, *Tempo* 182 (September 1992):49.

[43] John Warnaby, *Tempo* 176 (March 1991): 38.

[44] Richard Taruskin, *Defining Russia Musically*, (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1997), p. 101.

[45] Alexander Ivashkin, *Alfred Schnittke*, (London: Phaidon, 1996) p. 190-91.

Finale, became four movements with the addition of a new Finale – a slow hymn or prayer of extraordinary intensity (the cello is also amplified). The transcendental power of the work as a whole, and this movement in particular, makes this for me the cello concerto that Mahler never composed.

Bell, Adams

Mahler in Blue Light by the American composer Larry Bell (b. 1952) is a 24-minute piece in four movements for alto saxophone, cello and piano (the "blue" refers to the color connotations of the use of the saxophone). All four movements are based on an instrumental fragment from "Der Abschied". Auditory recognition of the Mahler theme can be difficult, but is easiest in the third movement, which is titled "Variations on a Theme by Mahler". Excerpts from all four movements may be heard at www.larrybellmusic.com.

The Mahlerian associations in the *Harmonielehre* by John Adams begin with its title, which is taken from Arnold Schönberg's treatise of the same name, published in 1911 and dedicated to Gustav Mahler. The musical allusions in Adams' 40-minute, three movement "symphony" are much more tangible, however, with the most immediately striking occurring as the climax of the slow second movement. Adams quotes almost exactly the searing nine-note dissonant chord which serves as the climax of the first movement of Mahler's Tenth Symphony, and refers to his allusion as "an obvious hommage to Mahler's last unfinished symphony."[46] There is another possible allusion to Mahler's Tenth Symphony, to the third or "Purgatorio" movement. The title of Adams' second movement is "The Anfortas Wound," which is meant to refer to the medieval king directly, rather than to the character of "Amfortas" in Wagner's *Parsifal*, who was based upon the same king whose wounds can not heal. Wagner's Amfortas sings the word "Erbarmen" (have mercy) as the climax of his first-act monologue, and Mahler inserted this word in the manuscript of the "Purgatorio" movement, probably as a response to his relationship at the time with his wife, Alma. The point of the "Erbarmen" reference is that the music in this passage of Mahler's third movement contains "the origin of the nine - note dissonance."[47] Adams' title of his second movement may thus be a further, albeit secondary, reference to Mahler's nine- note dissonance, via the "Purgatorio" movement.

Adams' Finale is titled "Meister Eckhardt and Quackie", referring to both a medieval mystic and to Adams' baby daughter Emily, nicknamed "Quackie." Adams composed to the image of a baby whispering the secrets of grace into the ear of Meister Eckhardt. As Adams explains:

The third movement is definitely a gloss on the conclusion of Mahler's Fourth Symphony, a child speaking of heaven, in a purely endowed state of grace, of innocence.[48]

The first part of this third movement fits with Adams' "gloss" description. However, the next few minutes constitute a "tremendous harmonic struggle"in which "finally, E-flat wins through its strength, and this moment seems like an epiphany."[49] Approximately two minutes after the E-flat "epiphany" Adams concludes his *Harmonielehre* in a blaze of brass and pounding percussion that David Robertson recently characterized as "probably the most exciting sound that a symphony orchestra can make."[50] The end of the Finale with its fast tempo, evokes Mahler's quickest Finale, that of the Fifth Symphony.

Further support for the Mahler Tenth Symphony associations may be found in the ways in which this work is found in concert programs. The Melbourne (Australia) Symphony Orchestra paired extended excerpts from Wagner's *Parsifal*, including the Amfortas "Erbarmen" with *Harmonielehre* in April 2004. The Bundesjugendorchester have announced a future program of the Adagio from Mahler's Tenth, Turnage's Viola Concerto, and Adams' *Harmonielehre*, which always tends to be found at the end of a program (as often occurs with any of Mahler's completed symphonies).

[Harmonielehre is available in its entirety for listening over the internet (at http://musicmavericks.publicradio.org/listening/). The performance, conducted by Michael Tilson-Thomas with the San Francisco Symphony, is the best I've heard, vastly superior to the Rattle or DeWaart readings on CD.]

Conclusion

Prior to writing this article, the one conclusion I foresaw was that Mahler has influenced many composers, and that no composer comes to mind who has inspired an equal amount of quotation, allusion, or emotional resemblance. I still believe this conclusion is true. After assembling the historical summary table, I have noticed several other points of particular interest. (These points are related to this specific list; a different list generated by a different set of ears might very well come to other conclusions). The chronology shows a major gap between 1935 (when Berg died) and 1965 (when Rochberg started collage quotation) broken only by the Shostakovich Tenth Symphony in 1953 (after Stalin died). The multiple composer quotation/collage works cluster between 1965 and 1970, with the exception of the Schnittke Third Quartet of 1983. The gap between 1935 and 1965 seems related to some combination of the rise of the Nazis in Germany, World War II, and post-war trends in musical fashion (serialism).

A geographic watershed seems to have also occurred in 1935. Most of the works cited until then are by Austro-German and Central European composers. After that date all but one composition is by Americans or Russians, with the Italian Berio being the exception. A partial explanation of this large scale geographic shift is provided by John Webb in discussing Schnittke:

> …the Russian traditions allowed the Mahlerian aesthetic to continue as a living force in a way that Western tradition did not….The irony is that if Schnittke had been born in Germany, he too would have been distanced from the aspects of Mahler's music which now form such a strong part of his own. It is only through the Russian tradition that he has found a link to Mahlerian polystylism.[51]

Turning to the works by Mahler, the most influential pieces would appear to be *Das Lied von der Erde*, the Sixth Symphony, and the Ninth Symphony, with the Fifth, Fourth, and Second Symphonies in a secondary group of influence. Of the works discussed, the First, Third, and Eighth Symphonies seem to have had no direct influence. In addition, specific movements account for many of the quotations and allusions, notably "Der Abschied" from *Das Lied von der Erde*, the Finale of the Sixth, the Adagietto of the Fifth, and the two outer movements of the Ninth Symphony. Mahler's triumphant Finale movements have apparently not been a significant source of influence.

Returning to the list of works influenced by Mahler, it is hard to find affirmative Finales. If "affirmative" is defined as ending loudly and in a major key only four of the 33 works cited qualify as affirmative. Two of these four (the Karłowicz and Foerster symphonies) were composed while Mahler was still alive and before his composition of the Sixth and Ninth Symphonies and *Das Lied von der Erde*, leaving only Shostakovich's Tenth Symphony and Adams' *Harmonielehre* as post-Mahlerian works with triumphant Finales. Possibly the degree of triumph expressed in Mahler's affirmative Finales exerts an "anxiety of influence" [52] on subsequent composers such that they are reluctant to try to match them. And for those who particularly admire affirmative endings, a final conclusion may be that Mahler remains unsurpassable in this area of musical expression.

---

[46] John Adams notes on *Harmonielehre* at www.earbox.com. 1999.

[47] David Matthews, "Wagner, Lipiner, and the 'Purgatorio' ", in *The Mahler Companion*, edited by Donald Mitchell and Andrew Nicholson (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999) p. 508-56. Stuart Feder also refers to Matthews' explanation of "Erbarmen" in *Gustav Mahler- A Life in Crisis*, (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2004), p. 198.

[48] Interview with Edward Strickland *American Composers: Dialogues on Contemporary Music*, (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1991), p. 194.

[49] John Adams, *Harmonielehre*, Nonesuch Records 9 79115-2, 1985. John Adams interview with Jonathan Cott.

[50] Quoted by Chris Freud, *Colorado Daily* l (Vail), 28 June 2004.

[51] John Webb, "Schnittke in Context", *Tempo* 182 (1992): 22.

[52] Harold Bloom, *The Anxiety of Influence: A Theory of Poetry* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1973).