Drew University College of Liberal Arts

Classification of the Performance Librarian Within the Orchestra

A Thesis in Music

by

Andrew S. Holmes

Submitted in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements
for the Degree of
Bachelor of Arts
With Specialized Honors in Music

Table of Contents

Introduction	5
Chapter 1: Specific Duties of the Performance Librarian	10
Musical Duties	10
The Bowing Process	11
Inserts	12
Page Turns	12
Editing	12
Arranging	13
Administrative Duties	14
Music Acquisition.	14
Cataloging and Storage.	16
Copying and Mailing	18
Duties That Are Both Musical and Administrative	20
Assembling Folders	20
Preparations for Auditions	20
Providing Management and the Conductor With Information	22
Touring	23
Commissions of New Works	24
Special Programs	24

Musical and Administrative Resources Used by the Performance Librarian	25
Chapter 2: The History of the Performance Librarian	28
Who Did the Job?	28
Qualifications Needed	29
Specific Duties	30
Classification	32
Chapter 3: Current State of the Profession	34
Who Does the Job?	34
How Performance Librarians are Hired	36
Who Hires the Librarian	36
Interning and Networking.	37
Industry Standards	38
Qualifications the Performance Librarian Must Have	39
Good Organizational Skills and a Good Memory	39
Flexibility and the Ability to Execute Long-range Planning	40
A Willingness to Work Long Hours	41
Excellent People Skills.	42
A Self-Generated Sense of Purpose and Motivation	43
A Wide Range of Musical Knowledge and Education	44
Related Professional Experience	46

A Love for Detective Work	46
Training Programs	47
The Influence of MOLA	49
MOLA Resources	49
Communication Among Librarians	51
Education.	52
A Unified Voice	53
The Annual MOLA Conference	54
Classification	54
As a Staff Member	55
As a Contracted Musician	57
Caught in Between	58
Chapter 4: The Future of the Performance Librarian	59
How the Job Will Change	59
The Influence of New Technology	62
The Role Librarians Will Play in Reshaping the Publishing Industry	63
The Future Role of MOLA	63
Conclusion	66
Bibliography	68
Appendix A: List of Interview Questions	70

Appendix B: American Symphony Orchestra League Meeting Group Chart	72
Appendix C: Cities Visited and the Librarians Interviewed	.73
Appendix D: Classification of the Performance Librarian	75
Appendix E: Timeline of the Move to Multiple Librarians	76
Appendix F: Staff vs. Contracted Librarians (1996)	77

Introduction

In the world of the symphony orchestra, one of the least known or understood jobs is that of the performance librarian. According to Marcia Gittinger, the Major Orchestra Librarians' Association (MOLA) defines the orchestra librarian as, "a specialist in music who works in a performance library setting. This person must be a 'musician in the widest sense of the word and also a specialist in the care and management of an orchestra's music collection'" (Gittinger). As an intern in the Philadelphia Orchestra Library during the summer of 1996, I became aware of what I have come to refer to as the "secret world of the orchestra librarian." My fascination with the profession of the orchestra librarian stems from the fact that hardly anyone (even those in the orchestra field) knows what exactly the librarian does.

One problem created by a widespread lack of knowledge about the profession of the performance librarian in the United States is the decision of how to classify the librarian within the organization. While some orchestras classify the librarian as a member of the orchestra, others classify the librarian as a member of the staff. While for some smaller orchestras the economics involved do not allow for the classification of the librarian as an orchestra member, there are those that can afford to, but do not. In an effort to bring light to this situation, this paper presents information on the current role of the librarian, what the traditional role of librarian has been, and the future direction the profession might take, as well as an attempt to denotate reasons favoring classifying

orchestra librarians as musicians. It must be noted at the outset that this paper addresses only the issues of the performance librarian in the United States, not worldwide.

As there have been several articles but no books written on the topic of the performance librarian, the information presented was gathered through personal interviews with and letters from twenty-seven performance librarians currently employed in the field. Several printed resources on the topic (such as pamphlets and newsletter articles) that were used are listed in the bibliography.

Some of the information presented here was gathered through my own personal experience working as an intern in the Philadelphia Orchestra, librarian for the Drew University Orchestra, and volunteer in the Boston University Tanglewood Institute Library at Tanglewood. This material is not directly attributed to a source because it is considered to be common knowledge within the field. When specific information on the duties of the performance librarian is cited, it should be noted that that information may pertain only to a particular orchestra or class of orchestras.

There are also several other limitations in the scope of this project that must be considered. For several reasons there is difficulty in setting down on paper a history of the position of the performance librarian. The first cause is that no one has ever compiled statistics or data on the position of the performance librarian prior to the mid 1980's. What this means is that any attempt to gather data on the development of the position comes from an oral history and results in inexact data. The challenge with this type of

data gathering is that few of the librarians currently engaged in the profession were performance librarians twenty or thirty years ago, and those few that were did not necessarily work for the orchestra that employs them today. While interviewing these librarians is a valuable way to track their individual careers, it is almost impossible within the scope of a thesis like this to track the evolution and development of specific positions within specific orchestras. Such a process would involve huge amounts of archival work to track down who was employed where and when, and even when such data was found it would not record what each librarian did and what was expected of him or her.

It is possible, however, to look at who is engaged in the job today and examine how the individual positions have changed since the current librarian has been with the orchestra. This analysis of the current state of the profession will refer to the categories of orchestras designated by the American Symphony Orchestra League (ASOL) Meeting Group classification of orchestras to consider the classification of the librarian within the

orchestra¹ as well as the survey conducted by Mary Plaine of the Baltimore Symphony².

¹Appendix B explains the ASOL Meeting Group classification system.

²Appendix D: Classification of the Performance Librarian

The other major limitation on this project was the small amount of time allowed for its completion. A more in depth study, which would have included interviews with all major orchestra librarians (not just the twenty-seven to thirty consulted for this project), would have easily taken an extra year to complete and was therefore not possible. However, the cities visited and librarians interviewed³ provided as large a data sample as was possible given the time constraints that were in place.

Throughout the process of working on this project, several topics that go beyond the scope of its objective surfaced. The most notable of these is the necessity for a handbook-style guide on how to perform the duties of the performance librarian. A resource of this kind would be invaluable not only to people currently engaged in the profession, but also in helping to establish a set of criteria that an aspiring librarian must meet before being able to do the job (the topic of the current lack of criteria will be addressed in depth later).

The objective of this project is to address the issue of respect for the librarian not only as a librarian, but also as a musician. Only by educating orchestra management, players, and (to a lesser extent) the general public to what the librarian does, can the librarian hope to receive the respect he or she deserves. While the librarian may partly serve an administrative function, he or she is a musician first and deserves to be

-

³Appendix C

recognized as such. Librarians who are classified as contracted musicians have the benefits of tenure and pension. By including the librarian in the contract, an orchestra shows an understanding of the nature of the position as well as a long-term commitment to the librarian.

While many people discuss this issue in terms of money, because many orchestras cannot afford to pay their librarians as musicians, for many librarians the issue of respect has little to do with money. To be a performance librarian one has to be a musician as well as a librarian.

Chapter 1: Specific Duties of the Performance Librarian

The duties of the librarian can be split into two categories: musical and administrative. The musical duties include such things as bowing parts and arranging pieces. The administrative duties include things like mailing parts out to players and keeping a budget. Not all duties, however, fall neatly into these categories. The duties that overlap, such as preparation of audition materials, involve many individual tasks, both administrative and musical.

Musical Duties

The strictly musical duties of the librarian are fairly straightforward and involve the preparation of the printed parts. These duties are virtually the same for each orchestra regardless of size and include bowing parts⁴, creating inserts, adding cuts⁵, proofing and editing, and arranging. Bowings are the markings added to the parts to coordinate the movement of the bows among all of the string players. While this has a visual aspect to it, an up-bow⁶ and a down-bow⁷ make a distinctly different sound.

⁵markings that tell the player to skip from one section of the music to another.

⁴printed music.

⁶when the bow is moving away from the player.

Therefore the librarian must clearly mark the bowings so that the sound from one player to the next does not vary.

THE BOWING PROCESS

Sometimes the bowing process begins with the conductor (occasionally with the assistant conductor), but most often the bowing process begins with the concertmaster.

The concertmaster will usually bow his or her individual part in consultation with the conductor to create the sought after sound. The librarian then provides copies of that part to the other string principals who bow their respective parts based on the part the concertmaster provides. If the principals are unable to provide bowings, the librarian has the task of either finding the bowings elsewhere or creating them. The librarian, using these parts as a reference, transfers the markings to all of the other printed parts needed for the rest of the section. If the particular orchestra has a full-sized string section (only found in the largest major orchestras), the librarian inserts bowings into nine first violin parts, eight second violin parts, six viola parts, six cello parts, and five bass parts.

⁷when the bow is pulled toward the player.

⁸principal first violinist.

⁹"principal" refers to the section leader (first chair player) of each section in the orchestra.

¹⁰referred to as "bowing masters."

Markings other than bowings (cuts for example) must also be transferred into all the parts, not just the string parts.

INSERTS

Librarians also create inserts¹¹ for reasons including the necessity of covering a part for an instrument for which the orchestra might not have a player, or correcting errors if the original part has been misprinted. The part the librarian puts in front of the player has to look as much like engraved music as possible in order to keep from interrupting the flow of the player's eyes.

PAGE TURNS

Sometimes the librarian must fix page turns in a part. A problem arises when the printed part does not allow enough time for the player to turn the page without stopping the flow of music. This is especially critical for a non-string player because he or she is the only member of the orchestra who is playing that specific part. To solve this problem, the librarian will usually make photocopies and insert them into the parts to enable a more sensible page turn.

¹¹passages in the music that the librarian has added.

EDITING

Printed orchestral music contains many errors. These errors are found in almost every set of every piece of music in the repertoire. For example, Clinton Nieweg, Principal Librarian of the Philadelphia Orchestra, reports that he has found literally thousands of errors in Ravel's ballet "Daphnis and Chloe" (Nieweg). In an effort to create a more accurate reading of the orchestral repertoire, some librarians proofread sets to find mistakes in the published parts. To do this as accurately as possible, the librarian will compare the parts to the composer's manuscript¹², if possible, to find mistakes in the parts caused by printing errors. This process is similar to that of creating inserts because the corrections must look exactly as if they were engraved. During the summer of 1996, one of the tasks that the Philadelphia Orchestra Library was engaged in was the proofing of Gustav Holst's "The Planets." Clinton Nieweg and Greg Vaught, the Principal Librarian of the San Antonio Symphony Orchestra, checked every note of the work to find discrepancies between the manuscript, scores, and parts (Nieweg). These corrections were then incorporated into a new critical edition currently available for purchase. Most often, though, the librarian who proofreads a set does not have the time to also create a new set of parts, so he or she will write down the corrections on an errata list.

¹²the composer's original notation of a piece of music.

ARRANGING

Arranging is another of the musical duties of the performance librarian. This can include arranging a piece for full orchestra or something comparatively less time demanding such as adjusting the keys of parts (in the case of vocal music). In cases such as these, the librarian either has to find a piece of vocal music in the key that the singer prefers, or create the part if it does not already exist.

Administrative Duties

Difficulties arise in classifying many of the specific duties of the librarian as solely administrative because a large amount of the administrative duties overlap with the musical side of the job. Among administrative tasks are:

- 1) Acquisition of sets¹³ (including purchase or rental)
- 2) Cataloging of sets
- 3) Organization and numbering of parts within the sets
- 4) Storage of sets within the library
- 5) Photocopying and mailing out parts (when necessary)

Each of these duties in turn involves many specific tasks.

_

¹³all of the parts required to perform a piece of music.

MUSIC ACQUISITION

Music acquisition is the most important administrative job that a librarian does. The first side to the acquisition of music is purchasing. This involves finding out which publisher prints a certain piece or edition of a piece that the music director wishes to perform and then ordering it. The purchase of music is seen as an asset because after the program has been performed, the sets belong to the orchestra and can be reused with a minimal amount of preparation. Because owning sets greatly reduces costs, many orchestras have separate capital funds devoted only to the purchase of new music.

Allocating enough money for rental fees is one of the trickiest parts of budgeting. As David Mills of the Charlotte Symphony observes, renting music is considered an expenditure, as the orchestra gains no residual value from the music because the librarian must return the sets to the publisher after the performance (Mills). The types of programs that most often require rental are modern compositions for orchestra and pops concerts. Most twentieth century compositions and pops repertoire are still under copyright and, because the publisher that holds the copyright to a piece controls its distribution, more often than not the publisher will make a piece available for rental only. Therefore, virtually every piece of the twentieth century repertoire requires rental and performance fees, which is also the case in the creation of scholarly editions of pieces in the public domain. While the original version of the piece may be in the public domain, the scholarly edition will bear the copyright of the editor.

Additionally, programming for pops concerts tends to change rapidly and at the last minute, which causes these types of programs to be more expensive to put on, because the orchestra will have already paid to prepare music for a concert that now is not going to be used. This cost is in addition to the shipping charges incurred by the necessity of rushing new sets to the orchestra as well as the money involved in last minute rehearsals and other preparations. Because of the costs involved with last-minute preparations, all librarians try to get the repertoire for these types of concerts firmed up well in advance.

The rental aspect of music acquisition can also be challenging because the librarian must engage in a certain amount of negotiation with the publishers in order for the library to remain within budgetary constraints. For example, David Frost (librarian of the Columbus Symphony) recalls when a publisher tried to charge additional money for broadcast fees. The publisher insisted that the orchestra had been charged broadcast fees all along, but Mr. Frost knew "those fees had gone out the window long ago." He then had to negotiate with the publisher to not charge the fee. That took some time away from his other library tasks and illustrates the things that a librarian has to do to help the orchestra save money (Frost).

CATALOGING AND STORAGE

The librarian also keeps accurate records of the library's holdings through the use

of a computer database or manual card catalog. At some point a librarian must assemble the card catalog, which typically includes such information as composer, title, running time, publisher, and instrumentation. Librarians must put together computer databases and update them constantly. These databases include those specifically created by the individual library (using a program such as Microsoft Access) or on the Orchestra Library Information System (OLIS)¹⁴. Regardless of the cataloging method used, the librarian must enter the data for every acquisition.

Organizing the parts within each individual set involves numbering the parts of a set when it is acquired and putting the parts back in that order before re-filing after a performance. This process allows the librarian to find missing parts by thumbing through the set and to keep track of which players have which parts. Because the parts are numbered, players who wish to borrow music simply put the instrument and number of the part on a sign out sheet, allowing the librarian to keep track of which player has borrowed which part.

¹⁴OLIS was created by orchestra librarians for orchestra librarians and contains much of the information that a detailed card catalog would, but on a computer database.

As with the cataloging of sets, there are many methods of storing sets. Some variations of filing methods include filing alphabetically by composer, filing by accession numbers, storing pops sets separate from the "standard" repertoire, and keeping the scores apart from the sets themselves. Each method has its own merits.

Filing sets alphabetically by composer eliminates the need to consult a card catalog when looking for a set of parts. The librarian just goes to the appropriate shelf and finds the set. The disadvantage is that empty space must be left on each shelf to allow for expansion.

Accession numbers function a little differently. After acquisition, each set is given a number consecutive to the number of the last set acquired. This number is entered in the catalog listing for that particular set. The disadvantage of this method is that every time a set is needed, the librarian must look up the number of the box that contains the set. The advantage is that there is no wasted space.

Storing the pops sets separate from the "standard" repertoire (such as Mozart) makes locating those particular sets easier. This separation also facilitates the filing of these sets by title instead of composer, arranger, or number.

Finally, keeping scores apart from the sets helps to save space. It keeps conductors from having to root around the storage area to find a score they need as well as making it easier for the librarian to locate a score.

COPYING AND MAILING

Other administrative duties include copying and mailing out parts to the players.

The copying of parts is a very important duty. Because string players sit two to a stand and share parts, inside string players¹⁵ need copies of parts to facilitate practicing at home. Therefore the librarian must provide copies to the players. In the case of vocal music, pianists and vocalists require copies of the piano-vocal score¹⁶ for practicing.

¹⁵the one of the two players that shares a music stand who is furthest from the audience.

¹⁶a reduction of the full orchestral score for piano that also contains the vocal part.

As Garyth Nair, conductor of the Drew University Orchestra, points out, in the case of televised performances, television crews require copies (usually purchased instead of photocopied) of the full score¹⁷. These copies of the score are required so that the principal engineers can plan camera shots before the performance and the director can call the shots from the monitors during the performance. Without a copy of the full score, none of this would be possible (Nair).

Some orchestras, in the case of programs such as children's concerts, copy entire sets for use exclusively during those types of programs, which prevents the librarian from having to add and erase cuts to the music for each different children's concert. This procedure also saves wear and tear on the parts themselves.

Although making photocopies is a primarily administrative task, it would be difficult to have a non-musician do it. A musician more readily knows what to copy and what not to copy, as well as knowing the acceptable format for the finished product.

Personal interviews with performance librarians have revealed that the mailing out of parts happens mostly in smaller orchestras (groups III and IV) that either do not have one specific rehearsal hall or a hall that also includes the library. This becomes vitally important due to the shrinking amount of rehearsal time available for orchestras. Without

¹⁷part the conductor uses to conduct. It is a compilation of every part that is used by every player in the orchestra, a sort of "road map" that lets the conductor (who in this analogy would be the driver) know where he or she is and is going.

the opportunity for the players to practice parts prior to the first service¹⁸, it would be nearly impossible for a smaller regional orchestra to properly prepare a program.

Duties That are Both Musical and Administrative

ASSEMBLING FOLDERS

The most important duty of the performance librarian, and one that includes both the musical and administrative sides, is assembling the folders containing the music for a particular performance and distributing them onstage. This involves finding the sets within the library (assuming they have already been acquired), and putting each part for each piece into the appropriate folder. All of this requires a fair amount of musical knowledge and a working knowledge of foreign languages, as publishers denote instrumentations in many languages other than English. After assembling the folders, the librarian distributes them onstage. To do so involves knowing the layout of the orchestra

¹⁸rehearsal or performance.

on the stage as well as knowing what extra instruments beyond the standard orchestra a particular concert requires. This must be done perfectly each time, as a mistake in music distribution will halt a rehearsal or performance. After the performance, the librarian must break down the folders and re-file the parts.

PREPARATIONS FOR AUDITIONS

Another of the duties a librarian has that overlaps both the musical and administrative aspects of the job is the preparation of materials for an audition for a vacant position in the orchestra. The tasks involved with this include 1) dealing with the repertoire list¹⁹, 2) making copies, and 3) in some cases being in the building on call during the audition.

The first of the librarian's audition responsibilities is to acquire the repertoire list.

Managements often call upon the librarian to help edit the list for accuracy and clarity (so auditionees will prepare the correct excerpt). In order to fulfill his or her duties the

¹⁹the list of the musical excerpts that each auditionee is responsible for preparing for the audition.

librarian must have all the knowledge that someone auditioning would need plus the administrative skills to coordinate the assembling of the materials.

Once the repertoire list has been decided on, the librarian must make copies of the audition material for each member of the audition committee²⁰. Additionally he or she needs to provide a copy of the material²¹ onstage for the auditionee. The librarian typically binds the material or puts it into a three ring binder. The norm is for the librarian to copy only the specific excerpts that will be used for the audition. Sometimes, though, the committee is slow in deciding which specific parts of a piece they wish to use. As David Mills of the Charlotte Symphony said "in frustration I will copy the entire Beethoven symphony and put that in the book, just so I can get it done" (Mills). Some organizations (like the Houston Grand Opera) send every auditionee copies of the materials they must prepare for the audition, mainly because the materials are nonstandard repertoire for the average orchestral player (Sloniger). In most cases, however, the librarian will not provide materials to an auditionee unless necessitated by extenuating circumstances (such as the auditionee being in another country that does not have the material readily available).

Some librarians (such as Ron Whitaker of the Cleveland Orchestra) are also on call

²⁰the group of people who decide which auditionee will fill the position

²¹referred to as the "audition book."

in the building during auditions, primarily so that they can provide sight-reading material to break a tie if the committee is undecided between two candidates, or deal with any unforeseen problems that may arise during the course of the audition process (Whitaker).

PROVIDING MANAGEMENT AND THE CONDUCTOR WITH INFORMATION

Managements also expect the librarian to provide accurate program information²² for each concert to alert the personnel manager of any special instrumentation requirements beyond the standard orchestra. A standard orchestra includes two each of flutes, oboes, clarinets, and bassoons, four French horns, two trumpets, three trombones, one tuba, percussion, and strings. If additional players are needed for a piece, the librarian must inform the personnel manager of that need. If the personnel manager is aware that performing a particular piece will be too expensive, the piece may not be performed. Therefore it is vital for the personnel manager to have accurate program information, which is provided by the librarian.

Librarians also provide conductors with information about which editions of

²²information such as instrumentation or length of a piece.

certain pieces will best suit the orchestra's needs. The standard procedure is for the conductor to tell the librarian what piece he or she wishes to perform and then ask the librarian for the pros and cons of each existing edition of that piece. The librarian's function then is to provide information about artistic concerns to the conductor, consider the budgetary impact to the library, and then offer advice on things of a mechanical nature, such as measure numbers. Preference for different editions can also involve critical sets that have been created, because buying sets that have been corrected is more costeffective than having the librarian proof the set or make the changes from an errata list.

Shelley Friedman of the Nashville Symphony points out that some librarians also act as institutional historians. They do this by taking timings²³ during performances and keeping the program records for the orchestra (in the case of orchestras that do not have archives). In this way a librarian leaves his or her mark on the orchestra, providing a resource that can be used in the future (Friedman). An orchestra's own archives provide the best resource for knowing the group's repertoire, the correct instrumentation, and the length of a piece.

²³measuring the performance time of a piece.

TOURING

When touring, the entire orchestra has to put on a performance with minimal preparation and in a new place. The librarian, however, has the task of not only preparing all the materials for the entire tour well in advance, but also of solving any additional library problems as they arise (such as adding cuts or making copies). In addition, the city the performance takes place in may not be familiar to the librarian, or in a country that speaks the same language. In cases such as these, an experienced librarian proves his or her worth when touring.

COMMISSIONS OF NEW WORKS

The performance librarian can save a lot of aggravation during rehearsals of newly commissioned works when allowed enough time to examine the piece before rehearsals begin. The librarian, with his or her musical training, can see pitfalls before an unsuspecting performer walks into them. David Frost points out that if done right, the player will never know that the librarian did anything. If a part is illegible, the page turns difficult, or the composer's intentions unclear, the librarian can (and does) address those issues well before the performers see the music, when given enough time in advance (Frost).

SPECIAL PROGRAMS

The final way that a librarian proves his or her versatility is in the handling of programs or special events that go beyond the regular subscription series. These events include special one-time performances, educational programs, Christmas concerts, and other holiday concerts. For example, Mary McGillen of the Louisville Orchestra described a special program that her orchestra performed in conjunction with a local grocery store when the Men in Black video came out. The store asked the Louisville Orchestra to do a concert with space music and some of the music from the movie to help promote the video. The difficulty was that Danny Elfman did the music for the movie and none of it is available. McGillen initially said that it couldn't be done for orchestra, but finally they took the main theme, "Forget Me Nots," and called the copyright holder and asked if the parts used in recording the song could be found and if the orchestra could have permission to orchestrate it. Eventually it worked out that someone in the orchestra was able to orchestrate it at the last minute on his computer (McGillen).

In the case of the Atlanta Symphony, a recent special program was the 1996 Summer Olympics. The main challenge was preparing all the material months in advance, as everything performed for the opening and closing ceremonies was pre-recorded. The other challenge was making judicious cuts to the national anthems (all of which had to meet a time limit of one minute and thirty seconds) without offending anyone (O'Brien).

Musical and Administrative Resources Used by the Performance Librarian

The performance librarian employs a wide array of resources on a daily basis.

Some of these include (but are not limited to):

- 1) the Farrish and Daniels books²⁴
- 2) Educational Music Service (EMS) database
- 3) the Kalmus and Luck²⁵ catalogs
- 4) The OLIS system
- 5) The BBC catalog²⁶
- 6) The Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians and Baker's Biographical

²⁴ for instrumentation and timings.

²⁵both publishers of music. These catalogs are valuable for ordering music as well as giving fairly accurate instrumentations.

²⁶lists everything that the BBC orchestra has ever played, which can be useful in trying to track down some hard to find sets of parts.

Dictionary²⁷

- 7) The catalog of the Fleisher Collection²⁸
- 8) The Internet

While all of the above resources encompass a wealth of information, performance librarians tend to rely on their colleagues most of all as their best resource. Librarians today share almost any information at their disposal. In contrast to some professions, there are almost no trade secrets in the performance librarian world. All of these resources are tools of the performance librarian trade. Individually and collectively, librarians constantly hone and refine their craft, much in the same way that a performer practices when not in rehearsal.

²⁷both of which can be helpful in finding out information about certain composers.

²⁸the collection is located in the Free Library of Philadelphia. The Fleisher catalog is valuable in locating hard to find or out of print sets of music that that collection may contain.

Chapter 2: The History of the Performance Librarian

Keeping in mind the current duties of a performance librarian, one must examine the history of the profession in order to understand why the librarian should be a contracted musician. As explained earlier, the history of the performance librarian is an oral history, so in some instances exact dates or numbers cannot be given. The history provided here includes not only what kind of person would have been engaged in the profession, but also what qualifications he or she required and what duties he or she performed. This historical perspective is crucial to understanding that the performance librarian has always been a musician and should be respected as such today.

Who Did the Job?

Until the 1970's, in all but the largest orchestras the librarian had a playing position in the orchestra and engaged in part time library work to supplement his or her income. In other cases the librarian had retired from playing and still wished to remain a part of the orchestra. A survey at the 1998 MOLA annual conference revealed that in some smaller orchestras (such as the Kansas City Symphony), the library position had remained part-time for the most part until the mid 1980's to early 1990's (Holmes).

Interviews with MOLA members reveal that generally the librarian is a string player, as he or she would have intimate knowledge of bowings; however, some occupied

other sections of the orchestra. For example, the former principal librarian for the Pittsburgh Symphony was also a French horn player (Vosburgh). In a case such as this, managements treated the librarian as an orchestra member because he or she was already contracted as a player in the orchestra before taking on the library work. Ray Clark of the Toledo Symphony points out that in some cases (usually smaller regional orchestras), the librarian was an extra member of the staff (a practice which can still be found in some small orchestras today, such as the Toledo Symphony) (Clark). In the Harrisburg Symphony, for example, the librarian was also the stage and personnel managers (Farrel).

Qualifications Needed

There has never been a set criteria for qualification as a performance librarian. As Marcia Farabee of the National Symphony said, "It used to be whoever had a station wagon and could lug the music around to the gigs was the librarian, and they really did just throw it out there and pick it up" (Farabee). For example, the performance librarians for the Cleveland Orchestra and the Columbus Symphony were not required to do bowings. Prior to this change, most markings were added to the parts by the musicians during rehearsal, thereby avoiding the necessity of the librarian adding the markings. As Karen Schnackenberg of the Dallas Symphony points out, that is not feasible today due to the decreased amount of rehearsal time and the enormous costs involved with paying musicians overtime to sit and mark parts (Schnackenberg). A defining moment for the

Muti told Clinton Nieweg of the Philadelphia Orchestra that he "didn't want to see any wrong notes." Within the next few years, editing grew in popularity to the point that today many librarians consider it to be a standard part of the job (Nieweg). Thus the role of the performance librarian has evolved from that of someone who just obtained the music, did minimal preparations, and put it on the stands to someone who has a hand in the artistic quality of the performance.

Specific Duties

After putting markings such as bowings into the parts became an accepted part of the position, the amount of work started to snowball to the point that today the duties of the librarian include adding cuts, adding measure numbers, fixing page turns, and handwriting legible parts for the players if the publishers cannot provide them, which, according to Karen Schnackenberg, caused orchestras with one part-time librarian to hire two or three full-time librarians, which in turn created a hierarchy of librarians (Schnackenberg).

With the move to multiple librarians, positions became designated not unlike those of playing members of the orchestra. This division has occurred differently in each orchestra depending on when the group grew enough to require multiple librarians to prepare parts for concerts. In the larger orchestras (the Philadelphia Orchestra, for

example) this change occurred during the 1970's, but for the small groups (such as the New Jersey Symphony) it came about from the mid 1980's to 90's²⁹ (Nieweg, Kossakowski).

In orchestras with multiple librarians the librarian in charge of all the library activities was often given the title "principal"³⁰ librarian. Karen Schnackenberg outlined the hierarchy of librarians (in its strictest form) as follows. The principal librarian usually deals with the "serious" concerts, including the standard classical repertoire such as Beethoven and Mozart. He or she deals directly with the music director and does what some librarians consider the more "enjoyable" library activities such as putting together the folders or putting the folders onstage. The assistant librarian does the less serious programs such as pops concerts. He or she usually does not deal directly with the music director, instead working with the assistant conductor. The assistant librarian also, more often than not, has the responsibility of doing most, if not all, of the bowings (Schnackenberg). Richard Gardiner of the Toledo Symphony notes that this arrangement

²⁹see Appendix E: Timeline of the Move to Multiple Librarians.

³⁰the same designation given to a player who is in charge of his or her section in the orchestra.

remains somewhat intact today, with the principal librarian doing about 70% of the administrative work and the assistant(s) doing about 70% of the music preparation (Gardiner).

Classification

When we consider the duties that the librarian traditionally performed, his or her classification as an orchestra member seems natural. Aside from generally having already been a playing member of the orchestra, the vast majority of the librarian's duties were musical in nature. It would be difficult to expect someone with no prior musical training to hand-write a legible orchestra part, for example.

As time went on, the role of the librarian expanded to encompass more administrative duties. Clinton Nieweg observes that the expansion of duties mirrors the growth of each individual orchestra. As each orchestra got bigger, the librarian was expected to serve a more administrative function as well as continuing to perform the musical duties of the job. The most notable of these added administrative duties (in his case) include keeping a budget and dealing with publishers. While the administrative side of the job expanded, the musical side did not diminish (Nieweg). For the most part, the larger orchestras continued to classify the librarian as a contracted musician, a practice

that continues today in most of those organizations³¹.

Then why would anyone even think to classify the librarian as a staff member? Bob O'Brien says that his orchestra, the Atlanta Symphony, has historically done it that way (O'Brien). From the beginning they have seen the librarian more as an administrator than a musician, and the classification followed accordingly. Aside from cases where the librarian has historically been a staff member, though, the one word answer is money. As noted by David Frost, classifying the librarian as a staff member saves the orchestra salary and benefits because the players of the orchestra fall under a collective bargaining agreement (Frost). The collective bargaining agreement serves to protect them by granting tenure (typically after two seasons with the organization) and guaranteeing a pension after retirement, as well as setting the minimum compensation levels for orchestra members. Classifying the librarian as a contracted musician gives him or her the same benefits that the players have. Most managements that classify the librarian as staff do not see him or her as a musician because he or she does not perform onstage. This limited interpretation allows them to not only not give the librarian monetary compensation for

³¹see Appendix F: Staff vs. Contracted Librarians (1996)

being a musician, but in many cases also to not even acknowledge that the librarian *is* a musician.

As Karen Schnackenberg said "You can't be an orchestra librarian without being a professional musician" (Schnackenberg). As previously stated, the librarian has tended to be a player first, becoming a librarian later in his or her career. Just because the job developed more administrative duties does not give management the right to deny the librarian the respect that he or she earned and deserves as a musician. In the opinion of Stu Serio of the Naples Philharmonic, managements in essence penalize librarians for learning more than the average musician (Serio).

Chapter 3: Current State of the Profession

Knowledge of the duties the librarian performs and the history of the position of the performance librarian provides a good starting point from which to examine the current state of the profession. As with the historical analysis of the profession, the most logical place to start is with who does the job, how he or she got the job, and what qualifications are needed. As the role of the librarian becomes more and more varied, the need for a training program that will serve to certify someone as a librarian increases. Historically that issue has not created a problem, but is one of the most debatable topics within the profession today. Finally, any analysis of the profession of the performance librarian must also mention MOLA and the role it has played within the music world.

Who Does the Job?

There is a great diversity as to what professional position a librarian had before becoming a librarian. At lower ASOL classification levels (especially groups III and IV), the librarian must serve many functions within the orchestra. For example, Ray Clark of the Toledo Symphony Orchestra was the stage manager for that organization. Today he serves not only as the stage manager but also as the principal librarian (Clark). Becky Scanlon of the Richmond Symphony found herself in a similar situation. She was the stage manager, personnel manager and librarian for the orchestra. In addition to that, she

also played percussion for the group. Today her sole job is librarian (Scanlon). Both of these examples show the versatility required of a librarian in a smaller regional orchestra. A librarian of smaller orchestras such as these typically serves a more staff-like function in addition to performing the duties of a librarian. In fact, in 1996 all six group III and IV librarians who were MOLA members were classified as staff members (Appendix F). But what about performers who become librarians?

Currently a very musically diverse group of people is employed as performance librarians for group I-IV orchestras. From the data gathered through personal interviews, it was revealed that their instrumental expertise include the violin, double bass, flute, oboe, clarinet, bassoon, French horn, trumpet, trombone, tuba, percussion, piano, and harp. This was in addition to the copyists and composers who also have chosen orchestra librarianship as their profession.

There has been a definite shift from the kind of person who historically filled the job to the kind who does it today. The Major Orchestra Librarians' Association (MOLA) states:

In the past it was not uncommon for librarians to be playing members of the orchestra or to retire from the ranks of the orchestra into the library; today some musicians choose the profession as a first career. And while some librarians are still players in their orchestras, the library position is usually a non-playing one at the major orchestra level ("What is MOLA?" 3).

It is typically only in the smaller orchestras (such as groups III or IV) that the librarian can also be a performer because, as shown before with the listing of the duties the librarian performs, the role of the librarian has expanded well beyond that of a full-time player and a part-time librarian.

How Performance Librarians are Hired

WHO HIRES THE LIBRARIAN

How does one go about getting a position as a performance librarian? There is no set formula for getting a job. A large number of librarians are hired by the administrative staff, including the general manager, executive director, operations manager, and/or orchestra manager. This practice is followed almost exclusively by group I orchestras including Baltimore, New York, Philadelphia, and Atlanta (Holmes). Librarians in each of these orchestras have been hired in consultation with the artistic administrator, conductor, or a committee that included artistic personnel. However, in some orchestras in groups I, II, III, and IV the practice has been for the general manager or executive director to hire the librarian without consulting any of the artistic personnel (Holmes). In a survey conducted at the 1998 MOLA annual conference in Houston, I discovered that six of the fourteen group I librarians responding were hired without consultation with any artistic staff (five of those six are staff positions) (Holmes). Orchestras would never hire a

player without input from the artistic staff, and yet librarians are often hired without input from artistic personnel who are generally held accountable for the artistic standards of the orchestra.

INTERNING AND NETWORKING

Aside from knowing someone in the administration, there are many ways to go about getting a job as a performance librarian. One of these ways is to work for a summer festival as an intern at somewhere like Tanglewood, Aspen, or the Grant Park Symphony Orchestra. It is generally known within the profession that these places provide a good working atmosphere and a place to get an idea of what the librarian does, as well as help aspiring performance librarians make valuable contacts from which job offers may arise.

Another way to gain employment as a performance librarian is by networking and getting to know the current librarian of an orchestra. This method of networking is useful for gaining employment in any orchestra, regardless of classification. Personal interviews with orchestra librarians revealed that the vast majority of librarians with assistants have a large say in who gets hired for that position. For the most part, managements trust that the librarian will hire someone competent that he or she can work with. A good way to get to know the librarian is to offer to help in the library as a volunteer.

An additional way to gain an entry-level position in this field is to work in a music rental library, a profession similar to performance librarian because one must have musical

knowledge in order to effectively do the job. Experience in a rental library is invaluable for knowing repertoire and budgeting.

While all of these methods of making contacts are helpful, getting a position as a performance librarian usually involves finding oneself in the right place at the right time. This may include either knowing the right people, seeing that a library job in a local orchestra will open soon, seeing a job opening listed in *Marcato* (the quarterly newsletter of MOLA), or being a member of an orchestra looking to hire an assistant librarian from within the ranks of the players.

INDUSTRY STANDARDS

No set of industry standards is in place to control who gets a position as a performance librarian. Playing members of orchestras have to go through a series of rigorous auditions before being offered a playing job in an orchestra. Marcia Farabee explains that today some orchestras have adopted a similar audition process for librarians. These "librarian auditions" involve interviews as well as written tests which ask questions to which a qualified candidate should know the answers (Farabee). Inclusion of the librarian in the collective bargaining agreement will virtually assure that managements (in consultation with the artistic staff) take a more active role in the hiring of the librarian and apply a high standard of performance to the librarian hired, which was shown in the 1998 MOLA conference survey. Of the fourteen group I respondents, six of the seven

that are included in the collective bargaining agreement were hired in consultation with artistic staff while five of the seven respondents who fill staff positions were not.

Artistic staffs should be involved in the hiring of the librarian because, after all, once tenured he or she has the position for as long as he or she wishes.

Qualifications the Performance Librarian Must Have

There are a lot of important qualities that a librarian must have in some form or another. These include:

- 1) Good organizational skills and a good memory
- 2) Flexibility and the ability to execute long-range planning
- 3) The willingness to work long hours
- 4) Excellent people skills
- 5) A self-generated sense of purpose and motivation
- 6) A wide range of musical knowledge and education
- 7) Related professional experience
- 8) A love for detective work

GOOD ORGANIZATIONAL SKILLS AND A GOOD MEMORY

David Frost of the Columbus Symphony points out that the librarian has to do many tasks at once while keeping them all straight in his or her head. A good memory is

also essential, as the efficient librarian cannot waste time repeatedly looking for the same information (Frost).

FLEXIBILITY AND THE ABILITY TO EXECUTE LONG-RANGE PLANNING

The nature of the job demands that the librarian put in long hours at odd times of the day, because the librarian not only works during the day in the office, but also must be present for evening or matinee performances during the week and weekends. In order to do the job, the librarian must work an irregular schedule. The ability to plan for the long range relates to working odd hours because the better that the librarian plans, the fewer the hours required to complete a task. Planning well in advance still does not prevent last minute emergencies from occurring, but it does allow more time in which to deal with such problems should they arise.

The necessity for long range planning is also the reason that few major orchestra librarians have any real down time³² during the year. During such time the players in the orchestra have no services, so they have free time, which almost never happens in the library. Greg Vaught points out, for example, that if the orchestra does not have a summer series, the players will have those months to relax and get refreshed for when the orchestra resumes in September. When they return for the first day back on the job, there

³²used to describe days or weeks that the orchestra does not rehearse or perform.

will be parts waiting for them ready for use in rehearsal due to the efforts of the librarian during the summer months ordering and preparing the music for the players. An orchestra cannot function without the librarian working that far in advance (typically 4-7 weeks) (Vaught). Given the way long range planning takes away personal time from the librarian, he or she should at the very least be given a more flexible schedule during the season to compensate for vacation time he or she is unable to take.

A WILLINGNESS TO WORK LONG HOURS

Within the season, the number of hours that the performance librarian puts in are greater than those required of the performing members of the orchestra. While the players are contracted on a per-service basis, the librarian has no real limits placed on the number of working hours required of him or her. The exception to this being the cases, such as the Naples Philharmonic, where management requires the librarian to keep regular office hours in addition to attending every service. Stu Serio of the Naples Philharmonic reports that during his first year working for that organization, the management required him to keep regular 9-5 office hours during the week in addition to working each service (Serio). When kept to a bare minimum, having the librarian work mandatory office hours can be valuable to the players. When management uses it to require the librarian to work longer hours (as was the case in Naples) it is unjustifiable. Everybody needs some time away from work and no good reason can be provided for a management to make a librarian

choose between a career and a personal life. The difficulty one has in comprehending this practice of requiring the librarian to work all day and then in the evening stems from the fact that the average librarian works a minimum of forty hours a week. In reality the very nature of the job demands that the average performance librarian usually work between forty and sixty hours a week. Generally speaking, the librarian does whatever it takes to get the job done in a timely fashion, regardless of the number of hours required. To require a librarian's presence in the office all day and then to make him or her come back that night to work a concert shows that the organization does not view him or her as a musician or as a person.

EXCELLENT PEOPLE SKILLS

Tim Tull of the Houston Ballet observes that the performance librarian needs to have excellent people skills. The very nature of the job requires the librarian to deal with a wide range of personality types, varying from musicians who may not understand the financial considerations of running an orchestra, to the management who may not have a firm grasp on the needs of the musicians (Tull). As usual, the librarian finds him or herself caught in the middle, being thought of as a little of both. As stated by Mark Wilson of the Dallas Symphony, the bottom line is an orchestra is a service profession and, because of this, the librarian must have good people skills (Wilson). When asked in personal interviews what qualities they look for in hiring assistants, the responses almost

every librarian gave were a good temperament and a sense of humor. The very nature of the profession necessitates these qualities.

A SELF-GENERATED SENSE OF PURPOSE AND MOTIVATION

Performance librarians need a self-generated sense of purpose. They have to feel that the job they do will make a difference, even if no one acknowledges it. As David Mills of the Charlotte Symphony Orchestra said:

What I equate the orchestra to is an iceberg. The players, though they don't know it, are the penguins on top and they get sunshine. But those of us that are under the water supporting that iceberg, we're under the water doing all the stuff that has to be done; just a tremendous amount of work that so that these players can go out onstage and put on a performance. It's scary to think how much goes into it with marketing, and the library. Everyday mundane stuff. It takes hard work and dedication and there are lots of better ways to make a living (Mills).

Stu Serio observes that orchestra librarianship is a very humble occupation. A librarian cannot be looking for glory or recognition, because that is not the nature of the profession (Serio). Keeping that in mind, performance librarians need a real love for music, which must manifest itself both on the aural level as well as the tactile level. The librarian deals with the printed page so much that he or she must have a real appreciation for the beauty of printed music. The librarian needs a real enjoyment for the work.

The love a librarian has for the work shows itself in his or her self-motivation and

willingness to engage in tedious activities. Given the thanklessness of the occupation, David Frost observes that the librarian must have an "internally generated sense of pride and craftsmanship" (Frost). The willingness to engage in tedious activities comes with the territory. Sitting down and putting markings into a full set of parts is a time consuming process. John Rosenkrans of the Austin Symphony has on occasion marked parts for 12 hours straight, taking brief breaks to eat when his wife brought him meals (Rosenkrans). And the reward? If the librarian does the job perfectly, members of the orchestra applaud him or her with silence.

A WIDE RANGE OF MUSICAL KNOWLEDGE AND EDUCATION

The librarian requires a wide range of musical knowledge to even attempt the job.

According to MOLA:

Training for orchestra librarianship should include as broad an education as possible in all aspects of music and the liberal arts ("The Orchestra Librarian: a Career Introduction" 5).

The ideal performance librarian would perhaps have a working knowledge of how to play all the instruments in the orchestra. While it is a daunting task to learn every instrument, the librarian must be able to deal with different issues such as transpositions³³ and

³³A couple scenarios necessitate transpositions. To make some music playable, certain instruments must be written in keys other than that of the composition (ex. the French

doublings³⁴, should they arise. A performance background, regardless of instrument, is also a vital qualification for a librarian. It stands to reason that someone who has been a performer will have a more acute understanding of what the players expect to see. For example, knowledge of how to play a string instrument is valuable, as the majority of the markings that the librarian does involve bowings.

Formal education can also provide the qualities that a successful librarian should have. Examples of this education could include:

- 1) Advanced degrees (bachelors, masters, and doctorate)
- 2) Language proficiency
- 3) Knowledge of music history, theory, and composition

Many librarians (in groups I, II, III, and IV) have bachelors degrees in performance or education and some have pursued masters degrees. Tom Takaro of the Florida

horn is in the key of F). Prior to our current era, instruments came in all keys (each instrument was built to play in a certain pitch range well).

³⁴doubling is when two instruments play the same part at the same pitch or octave.

This is used to bolster an instrument's sound that might otherwise not be heard.

Philharmonic even has a doctorate in composition (Takaro).

The position of performance librarian also demands a fairly high level of language proficiency. MOLA advises that "a reading knowledge of German and at least one Romance language is helpful in accomplishing basic bibliographic research and cataloging" (Career Introduction 5).

Generally speaking, essentials for the daily tasks of the librarian (on all levels) include knowledge of music history, music theory, and composition. A history background gives the librarian a working knowledge of the repertoire that he or she will encounter over the course of the year. The librarian can deal with any special problems in advance if he or she already knows the piece. Knowledge of music theory and composition allows the librarian to either recreate missing parts from the conductor's score, transpose an aria to better fit a vocalist's range, or create arrangements for the orchestra from specifications given by the conductor. The librarian puts this knowledge to use on a daily basis.

RELATED PROFESSIONAL EXPERIENCE

Other useful experiences for performance librarians include having worked as either a rental librarian or copyist. Experience in a rental library gives vast knowledge not only of the repertoire, but also of the costs involved with rental music. Someone with experience working for a rental agent is much better equipped to make cost-effective

choices for the library than someone without such experience. Working as a copyist gives the librarian valuable knowledge as to what the musicians expect, so that the parts a librarian with this experience creates will meet the most exacting standards of the players in the orchestra.

A Love for Detective Work

When asked what criteria were used in selecting librarians, Kristi Sloniger of the Houston Grand Opera said that when she was hired, the management was looking for "someone who liked puzzles" (Sloniger). The performance librarian has to do a lot of tracking down sets of music in an effort to not only find the best quality parts, but also sometimes to even find the music at all. In spite of all the previously mentioned qualifications that a librarian should have, formal training in the field of orchestra librarianship is not among them.

Training Programs

As of May, 1998, there exists no formal certification program to train performance librarians. There is no special school, conservatory program, or even class in the country that will teach someone how to perform the duties of the librarian. However, there are several informal ways that someone interested in the field can go about getting trained in the profession.

As mentioned previously, one of the few ways to become trained as a performance librarian is by interning in a major orchestra library. As Greg Vaught stated, under a MOLA bylaw, any MOLA librarian can take someone interested in the field under his or her wing and show them how to perform the duties of a performance librarian (Vaught). In this way MOLA takes an active part in the training of the next generation of orchestra librarians. Most professional performance librarians agree that interning for a major orchestra is by far the best way to learn the profession. On a fairly regular basis. the libraries of the New York Philharmonic and the Philadelphia Orchestra accept interns. As pointed out by Clinton Nieweg, these orchestras expect interns to meet the same professional standards that any librarian in a major orchestra would be held to (Nieweg).

Another orchestra that teaches the profession of the performance librarian is the New World Symphony in Miami Beach, Florida. As Martha Levine (head librarian for the New World Symphony) explains, the orchestra itself is a teaching facility and gives its members fellowships good for up to 3 years. During that time not only do they play in the orchestra, but also audition with other orchestras (with the eventual goal of getting a professional job). The library program there works in the same way, with one library apprentice taking part in the program (Levine). This example shows a management acknowledging the fact that the training involved in becoming a librarian is very much akin to that of a musician. Because there are no books or substantial printed resources on the topic, the librarian has to learn his or her craft through personal instruction, the same

manner in which the performing members of the orchestra learned their profession.

These are the training methods currently in place. As mentioned already, there is no formal program that someone interested in the field can participate in that will train him or her for this profession, due, in part, to the unique nature of the job. The general consensus within the profession seems to be that opposition to creating a certification program at a conservatory stems from a fear of creating an over supply of qualified librarians in the world. There simply are not enough full-time positions in the country to support a yearly influx of trained performance librarians. Because of this, the next logical step would be to have required course work for performance and education majors that taught the very basics of what it takes to perform the duties of a librarian. Marcia Farabee of the National Symphony sees value in a course in librarianship that would teach practical things such as copyright law and bowings. This sort of class would be comparable to a lab course for science majors (Farabee). Even this sort of program does not yet exist. The bottom line is that someone who, for whatever reason, has an interest in a career in orchestra librarianship needs a definitive source to turn to for information and training.

The Influence of MOLA

The Major Orchestra Librarians' Association (MOLA) is a tool available to all

orchestra librarians. The purpose of MOLA is:

- 1) To help make the librarian's job easier
- 2) To educate players, management, and the general public as to what the performance librarian does.

MOLA RESOURCES

MOLA makes the librarian's job easier by providing a wide range of resources to the librarian that are not readily available anywhere else. For example, MOLA makes bowings and markings available to librarians. This service can save a lot of time for a librarian who otherwise would have had to create the markings. As David Frost explains, MOLA also has the Choral Music Union Catalog, which works as follows: each librarian who wishes to participate in the exchange submits a list of choral parts that his or her orchestra owns and would be willing to loan out to other organizations. These lists are compiled into one catalog, made available to the MOLA membership. When an orchestra decides to perform a piece listed in the catalog, the librarian of the orchestra performing it can call the librarian who has the parts and ask to borrow them. While the music is not loaned out for free, orchestras save a huge amount of money by borrowing the parts through the Choral Music Union (as opposed to buying or renting from the publisher) (Frost).

Other MOLA resources include errata lists that librarians have created. These

lists are created by comparing the score (or manuscript if possible) of a piece to the parts in an effort to find errors. Correcting these errors helps to improve the overall quality of a performance. MOLA allows easy circulation of these material by having a central storage location for the lists, located in the Philadelphia Orchestra Library. MOLA has also made itself a great resource for changes in copyright law, with an entire committee devoted entirely to that subject. Finally, MOLA publishes a quarterly newsletter called *Marcato* which gives updates for copyright law, job openings, and new available resources (books, errata lists, etc.), as well as providing profiles of librarians from various orchestras. The greatest MOLA resource, however, is the MOLA members themselves. *Communication Among Librarians*

The field of the performance librarian is so specialized that each city with a major orchestra has within it maybe only two or three people who have a hint of an idea as to what the job entails. Therefore, librarians need to communicate with other librarians. As Greg Vaught, current MOLA president and principal librarian of the San Antonio Symphony Orchestra, said:

I tell my assistant, if someone calls for me, take a message. If it's a MOLA librarian, call me. I'll drop anything. These people are my first priority because these people in turn drop everything to help me (Vaught).

MOLA really is like a family and a support group, willing to help each other out in any situation. To help facilitate this network, MOLA also prints a phone list which includes

phone and fax numbers (and e-mail addresses when available) for every MOLA librarian.

The network that has been created by MOLA has increased the collective knowledge of the profession tremendously. By setting an industry standard and then continually raising it, MOLA has helped to standardize the profession of the performance librarian. This establishment of standards has helped to keep each librarian from having to "re-invent the wheel" every time someone new takes over a vacant position, which has the effect of keeping management and players happy.

EDUCATION

Aside from the network aspect of MOLA, the group also has educational goals.

John Rosenkrans explains that MOLA exists to help teach librarians about available resources, including printed resources and other people. It is a source of information on library procedures (how to do things) and supplies (what equipment works the best). In this way MOLA enables the librarian to help his or her organization save money (Rosenkrans).

MOLA also allows librarians to keep track of industry-wide working conditions through communication with other librarians. If a performance librarian feels that an orchestra places unreasonable demands on the him or her, MOLA makes it possible for that librarian to check what the standard is in other orchestras through surveys of the

MOLA membership. This knowledge of other libraries can be extremely helpful for contracted librarians during negotiations. MOLA tries to educate the players and management of an orchestra as to what the job of the performance librarian entails by publishing pamphlets such as "What is MOLA?" and "The Orchestra Librarian: a Career Introduction."

Clinton Nieweg points out that MOLA also, to a lesser extent, educates the general public about the profession through talks given by individual librarians. Some members also help to educate the public by allowing volunteers to work within their library (Nieweg). With these educational efforts, MOLA hopes to help the general public, orchestra players, and especially management to understand that the librarian is a musician first.

A Unified Voice

MOLA also helps give librarians a unified voice when dealing with orchestra management. As Ella Fredrickson stated, for example, when a librarian can go to his or her management and say that no other orchestra in the country requires the librarian to provide practice copies of every part for every player for every concert, that is power (Fredrickson). Having such information not only gives a solitary librarian some clout when it comes to dealing with his or her management, but also a unified voice in dealing with publishers, which in turn can help to break down the adversarial relationship with rental agents and make them realize that everyone is trying to accomplish the same goal

(putting on a concert). A unified voice can also be useful when a publisher who has a monopoly on a piece charges too much for its rental. According to Mike Runyan, when librarian calls up a publisher and says that the price is too high, and that one hundred other librarians across the country agree with him or her, that publisher takes the librarian's complaint seriously. A unified voice also enables the librarian to better meet the needs of the musician. If one librarian says that the parts to a certain piece are poor quality, the rental agent may be somewhat concerned. However, if between seventy and one hundred librarians say that, the rental agent will take notice (Runyan). Through collective actions like these MOLA has also helped raise the industry standard of performance library work.

THE ANNUAL MOLA CONFERENCE

Nearly all of the librarians interviewed said that virtually every member of MOLA looks forward to the annual conference, which gives the membership an opportunity to meet face to face, share ideas, and talk shop. The original intent of MOLA was to facilitate this communication among librarians. The sharing of information about equipment, procedures, publishers and certain conductors is tremendous, especially during the many informational seminars scheduled throughout the weekend of the conference. The annual conference also provides valuable information about job openings. Stu Serio of the Naples Philharmonic says that he found out about his job at a MOLA

conference. Without the conference he would not be in that position (Serio). Socializing with colleagues is the other valuable aspect of the conference. It provides librarians an opportunity to meet each other in person and to talk with people who understand the job. Personal contact, in turn, makes it easier to call someone and ask for information. In this way MOLA acts as a support group and the people who attend the conference report that they come away feeling refreshed and ready to continue working.

Classification

Why do some managements still classify the librarian as a staff member and not a contracted musician? The answer to that question varies greatly depending on the organization in question. Larger group I orchestras tend to classify the librarian as a contracted musician³⁵.

AS A STAFF MEMBER

The smaller group II, III or IV orchestras tend to classify the librarian as a staff member. Some of these orchestras perceive the role of the librarian as more administrative, due to the fact that smaller orchestras have smaller staffs and each member of the staff must perform many different functions. Three larger (groups I and II)

³⁵see Appendix D: Classification of the Performance Librarian

orchestras also classify the librarian as staff. Kristi Sloniger explains that the Houston Grand Opera (group I) classifies her as staff because it does not have an in-house orchestra of which she could be considered a part (Sloniger). The New World Symphony (group II) classifies its performance librarian as staff because the orchestra is a teaching facility that gives all of the orchestra members fellowships, so the orchestra has no contract (Levine). In the case of the Atlanta Symphony (group I), the organization was a youth orchestra until the early sixties, so the librarian was traditionally a staff member, a classification that survives to this day (O'Brien). These are all valid reasons as to why the librarian should be considered a staff member, however these cases present the exception and not the norm.

For the most part, classification as a staff member is motivated by money.

Orchestras see keeping the librarian out of the contract as a way to save on salary and benefits. While this may help the bottom line of the orchestra a little, what it does to the morale of the librarian hurts the organization a lot. Stu Serio of the Naples Philharmonic (group II) had this to say about a conversation with the CEO of his orchestra:

In a 1-year review I sat there and explained to her why the librarian is a musician first and foremost. I said "I am a playing musician by training and have trained to become a librarian since then," and that "salary-wise and compensation-wise my salary should be commensurate with that of a musician." She quickly turned around and said "I acknowledge that a musician has to be doing this job; you

cannot have a non-musician do it. But to think that you would ever be paid commensurate to what a musician would be paid in this organization, that will never happen" (Serio).

There are some cases where the librarian does better as a staff member than he or she would as a contracted member of the orchestra. These apply only in the special cases presented by small orchestras. For example, Doug Adams of the Dayton Philharmonic Orchestra (group III) makes more money as librarian for the orchestra than he does as a violinist (he also plays in the group) (Adams). John Rosenkrans of the Austin Symphony Orchestra (group III) also makes more money as staff than he would as a player in the group, and additionally gets special insurance benefits that the orchestra at large does not. In these two cases, the reason for the classification is that due to the small size of the orchestra, the pay for a playing member is not enough to live on. The managements of those orchestras are educated enough about what the librarian does to realize that the position of performance librarian really is a full time job (Rosenkrans).

AS A CONTRACTED MUSICIAN

Two of the major advantages for performance librarians who are classified as contracted musicians and not staff members are tenure and pension. According to the Mary Plaine Survey, after two seasons with an orchestra, a contracted librarian typically becomes tenured, thus assuring the job for as long as he or she wants it (Plaine). This

kind of security and peace of mind is invaluable in the hectic, ever changing-world of the performance librarian. Additionally, most orchestras guarantee every orchestra member a pension upon retirement. This shows a clear long term commitment by the orchestra to attract the best musicians it can, by assuring them that the organization will be there for them even after they retire. Affording the same to the librarian shows a similar commitment.

The most important advantage to the librarian who is contracted is parity with the performing members of the orchestra. This manifests itself in two ways: money and respect. Contracted performance librarians tend to make more than their staff member counterparts. The bigger issue, however, is respect from players and management.

Marcia Farabee of the National Symphony says, "To know that these 104 people think of me as a musician first and an administrator second is worth more to me than money" (Farabee). Putting the librarian under the same contract as the orchestra members clearly states that the entire organization considers him or her a musician first.

CAUGHT IN BETWEEN

Librarians continually walk the fence between the administrative and musical side of the orchestra world. As Joann Vosburgh of the Pittsburgh Symphony (group I) observes, "I don't really have a job description" (Vosburgh). Most performance librarians interviewed agreed with that statement. Ella Fredrickson observed that the tendency is to

consider the librarian whatever is considered most cost effective at that time (Fredrickson). Even when the librarian fights for inclusion in the contract (which would give him or her recognition as a musician), inclusion seldom happens because the players of the orchestra do not consider the librarians' inclusion in the contract a strike issue. The players are not to be faulted for this, as contract negotiations are meant to improve the position of everyone included in the contract, so the fight of the librarian seeking inclusion does not directly concern someone who is already a part of the contract. However, excluding the librarian from the contract ultimately weakens the contention that he or she is first and foremost a musician.

Chapter 4: The Future of the Performance Librarian

How will the future roles of the performance librarian change from today? Due to the nature of the job, it will continue to change dramatically in the future. Because of the directions the job itself is going in and how technology will alter the roles of the librarian, the publishers, and MOLA, the importance of classifying the librarian as a contracted musician is greater than ever.

How the Job Will Change

Ron Whitaker of the Cleveland Orchestra theorizes that the profession of the performance librarian will become more administrative in the future. He believes that the job may even continue to become more specialized, with one person in charge of the administrative side of things and another overseeing the preparation of the music (Whitaker). While that may end up being the case, the people engaged in these activities will still need a strong musical background because, as discussed earlier, even the administrative side of the activities of a performance librarian still involves musical knowledge. The profession may change in the future, but it will still engage the librarian in doing the same activities done today.

There are also a greater number of people engaged in orchestra librarianship as a first and primary career. This trend will most likely continue in the future as more and

more people who love music and want to work within the industry but do not wish to pursue careers as performers find out about this little niche. The industry standard for qualifications that a librarian requires needs definition now so that in the future there are set criteria that one has to meet for consideration for the position.

The position of the librarian is, of course, tied directly to the future of the orchestral art form. As Stu Serio put it:

As far as the future of the job and profession, sadly, a lot of that depends on the commitment to the arts by the community. We've proven that a lot of the great leaders throughout history have had their intellect broadened by the arts. Whether it's music or dance or whatever it is, it makes a better-rounded individual. We need to make that commitment as a country or as a world that we don't want to let the arts die. We need to perpetuate that. Nothing can recreate the experience of sitting in a concert hall.

The job of each orchestra librarian depends on the commitment to the arts by the community of which the orchestra is a part. That community must deem the arts important, and this requires its members to be educated about the music. This education can be provided in a variety of ways, but the ones that the librarian can directly engage in include presenting talks to community members on topics ranging from what the position of performance librarian entails and how it relates to the overall music field, to general information about orchestras (because the performance librarian has a broad sense of how

the orchestra works). As Garyth Nair points out, one of the most effective ways to inform the general public of what the performance librarian does is to include a biography of him or her in the concert program (Nair). In this way the orchestra would guarantee that the message was reaching its intended audience. The performance librarian can also to write and edit the program notes for each concert (which some do already). These kinds of educational activities are as crucial to each individual orchestra as putting on concerts. In this respect, by engaging in educational activities, the librarian has just as much value to his or her organization as any playing member of the orchestra does.

The role of the librarian will also most likely continue to expand due to an increase in the number of pops concerts that orchestras perform. This expansion of role will mean that the librarian will need to acquire an even broader range of knowledge. The necessary knowledge of the orchestral music field in general will also broaden as new compositions continue to expand the repertoire and artistic staffs look to put on more programs with greater variety of music. All of these developments will increase the qualifications needed and expand the knowledge required for the librarian to perform his or her job. Couple this with the ever-increasing standards that the profession as a whole imposes upon itself, and the qualifications that a librarian in the future will need will be greatly expanded. And the proverbial pot of gold at the end of the performance librarian rainbow? In many cases a non-tenured staff position in which, with luck, the librarian can expect treatment as a musician first and an administrator second.

The Influence of New Technology

Computers are currently being used in many libraries to keep a database of that library's holdings. This, however, only scratches the surface of what computers can do for the performance librarian. There exists now the beginning stages of a technology that may someday cause a shift from music printed on paper to a computer screen on a special electronic music stand. While this technology is currently in its infancy, it may take the place of the paper and pencil within the next twenty years. This will be a radical shift in the music industry. Karen Schnackenberg asserts that the performance librarian will help play an instrumental role in the inception of this technology by helping to teach its developers what the electronic page has to look like. This will not be easy and the technology will have to go through a transition stage before everything becomes entirely computerized (Schnackenberg).

That transition stage will involve orchestral repertoire being scanned into a computer and the individual library printing out its own sets of parts. Such a development will revolutionize the publishing industry, as it will save the publishers a tremendous amount in printing costs. It will also allow the publisher to either mail the CD containing the music to the orchestra, or everything could be available to the orchestra on the publisher's own web site ready for downloading. Having the music computerized will also allow the librarian to insert markings and edit the parts on the computer screen

before printing the music. However, if a transition to computerized music stands ever occurs, librarians will have to assist every step of the way.

The Role Librarians Will Play in Reshaping the Publishing Industry

The future of publishers is tied both to technology and the librarians as well. As already mentioned, computers presently have a huge impact on the publishing industry. Librarians will have an immense impact on that industry as well. As a unified voice through MOLA, they are already used to keeping publishers informed of what is acceptable for their orchestras. This in turn has raised the industry standard for publishing.

The Future Role of MOLA

As the role of the individual librarian continues to broaden, so does the role of MOLA. MOLA has already progressed by leaps and bounds to establish itself as a professional entity. The most recent effort in this direction has been the establishment of MOLA as a non-profit organization in 1997. This solidifies its role as an educational organization and gives it tax-exempt status. Additionally, this also allows for solicitation of donations so that MOLA can continue to help set and raise the standard for performance librarians in the future. But most importantly, establishment as a non-profit organization has increased the professional respect for MOLA.

MOLA tries to encourage more participation in its various committees from all of its membership, but librarians with full time jobs have a hard enough time just accomplishing those tasks, let alone doing volunteer work for MOLA as well (MOLA does not pay people to serve on committees or the executive board). Technology, however, allows more efficient interaction within the group in the form of e-mail lists. In addition, a MOLA web site, created and maintained by Stu Serio and Patrick Zwick (Utah Symphony), is up and running as of March, 1998 (Serio).

David Frost believes that in the future, MOLA will develop even more resources for its membership. As the number of pops concerts increase, the need for a central pops resource increases even more. This could include information such as where to find certain pieces, what pitfalls to look for, or what expectations certain guest conductors might have (Frost). The end result of this will probably be similar to that of the Choral Union in that it will save the librarian time and the individual orchestra money.

Finally, according to David Frost, MOLA is also expanding its ranks to include more international orchestras as well as more orchestras not at the "major" level, serving to greatly increase the pool of knowledge that the group as a whole has at its disposal (Frost). In addition to that it also helps MOLA to reach a broader audience to further educate other people and organizations as to what the performance librarian does and about the orchestral music field in general, done, in part, through dissemination of pamphlets that MOLA produces and through articles written by MOLA members.

Expansion of MOLA's membership also will have the added bonus of finding more potential future librarians who may only be involved in a small way with a smaller orchestra. By educating these aspiring librarians as to what kinds of training MOLA has to offer and informing them of the industry standard and how it will continue to improve, MOLA will help to recruit and train the next generation of orchestra librarians. If this happens, MOLA will truly set the industry standard as to what an orchestra can expect from a performance librarian. But MOLA can only do so much; it is up to individual orchestras to acknowledge this standard.

Conclusion

Performance librarianship is not a glamorous profession. At best, when everything runs perfectly, the librarian can expect no one to notice that they were ever there. So, then, why would anyone ever want to pursue this profession as a career?

The simple answer: love. Performance librarians love music on every level. They love to listen to it and they love looking at the printed page as a work of art. Performance librarians have a true commitment to their art form and pursue it at the expense of many things, including free time and, in some cases, a personal life. So then why do some orchestras not afford the librarian respect as a musician and as a librarian?

This thesis has presented evidence to show that to successfully do the job of a performance librarian, the person should be a trained musician and able to handle administrative tasks. Librarians have more extensive knowledge than the average player in the orchestra and yet few orchestra managements acknowledge them for it. This practice has gone on long enough and needs remediation as soon as possible.

Librarians are an invaluable part of the orchestra. They can be counted on to do whatever it takes to make sure that a show goes on, even at the expense of their own personal time. They consistently raise the standards of their own work and educate and improve the field as a whole.

The economics involved in contracting the librarian do not make it a viable option for some orchestras (especially group III and IV), but reducing the situation to dollars and

cents misses the real issue. Almost every librarian interviewed was able to cite a case where someone in their organization (both performers and management) made comments to the effect of "I knew you were the librarian, but I didn't know you are also a musician." The real issue is respect and understanding for what the librarian does. One way to show this respect is for management to contract the librarian in cases where it is economically viable. Those orchestras that cannot afford to do so need to show this respect in any way that is economically possible, including things such as extra vacation time, a flexible schedule during the subscription season, or, as mentioned by Nair, a biography in the program book (Nair). This will show respect and allow the librarian to do the job on his or her own terms.

In the past, the librarian was first a player in the orchestra and seen as a musician.

The musical demands of the job have not diminished and will not lessen in the future.

Therefore the standard must be set now that the librarian is a musician now and will always be thought of as one in the future.

Bibliography

Adams, Douglas. Personal interview. 7 Jan. 1998.

Clark, Ray. Personal interview. 6 Jan. 1998.

Conover, Peter. Personal interview. 17 Jan. 1998.

Del Mar, Norman. "Librarian." Marcato 5.2 (1990): 4-5.

Farabee, Marcia. Personal interview. 30 Jan. 1998.

Farrel, Linda. Personal interview. 2 Jan. 1998.

Fredrickson, Ella. Personal interview. 26 Jan. 1998.

Friedman, Shelley. Personal interview. 10 Jan. 1998.

Frost, David. Personal interview. 7 Jan. 1998.

Gardiner, Richard. Personal interview. 6 Jan. 1998.

Gittinger, Marcia. "Getting the Most from Your Orchestra Librarian." <u>Progressions</u> (pub. ASOL).

Holmes, Andrew. Survey Data. MOLA annual conference. Houston, 1998.

Kossakowski, Cass. Personal correspondence. April-May 1998.

Major Orchestra Librarian's Association. What is MOLA?. 1997.

Major Orchestra Librarian's Association. <u>The Orchestra Librarian: A career Introduction</u>. 1992.

McGillen, Mary. Personal interview. 9 Jan. 1998.

Mills, David. Personal interview. 29 Jan. 1998.

Nair, Garyth. Personal correspondence. May 1998.

Nieweg, Clinton. Personal correspondence. 1996-1998.

O'Brien, Robert. Personal interview. 28 Jan. 1998.

Plaine, Mary. MOLA survey data. 1996.

Rosenkrans, John. Personal interview. 15 Jan. 1998.

Runyan, Michael. Personal interview. 8 Jan. 1998.

Scanlon, Rebecca. Personal interview. 29 Jan. 1998.

Schnackenberg, Karen. Personal interview. 14 Jan. 1998.

Serio, Stuart. Personal interview. 24 Jan. 1998.

Sloniger, Kristi. Personal interview. 17 Jan. 1998.

Takaro, Thomas. Personal interview. 23 Jan. 1998.

Tarlow, Lawrence. Letter to the author. 23 March 1998.

Tull, Tim. Personal interview. 17 Jan. 1998.

Vosburgh, Joann. Personal interview. 18 Feb. 1998.

Whitaker, Ron. Personal interview. 5 Jan. 1998.

Wilson, Mark. Personal interview. 14 Jan. 1998.

Appendix A: List of Interview Questions

How and why did you become a performance librarian (including education and experience)?

How many weeks out of the year does the orchestra play and what do you do during "down time"?

What are your specific duties within the library?

How does the librarian affect the musical quality of a performance (in what ways do they affect the product put out on stage)?

In a typical week, how many hours do you work and how is it divided (between rehearsal and performance for example)?

Who decides on the scheduling of librarians for performance and rehearsal duty and why is it split up that way?

What resources do you rely on the most and what purpose do they serve? (this question is meant to be broad so as to not limit the response to specific books or computer programs, etc.)

What extra problems do special programs that you do during the year create for the library (ex. kiddie concerts, summer series, and touring, etc.)?

What is your role during auditions for vacant seats?

What kind of filing system is used for music cataloging, how was that decided on, and how long has it been in use? (ex. card catalog, computer; alphabetical, acquisition, etc.)

In your organization, who hires the principal and assistant librarians and what criteria are used in selecting them?

Does your management classify the librarian as a contract musician or a staff member, and what is the reason for this classification?

What classification is your orchestra?

What is the size and budget of your orchestra?

What is the budget for your library and how are those funds allocated?

What is your concept of MOLA and what are its goals?

How has MOLA affected your job?

What MOLA resources do you use?

How has the annual conference affected your job, and how many have you been to?

What more could MOLA do to assist you in your job?

What training programs are you aware of that are now available for people looking to get into this line of work and what is their value for this type of a career?

What advice would you offer to someone looking to get into this field?

What lasting effect do librarians have (how do they make their mark on the music world)?

How has the role of the librarian changed (as far back as you can remember or know about) and how will it continue to change in the future?

Appendix B: American Symphony Orchestra League Meeting Group Chart³⁶

Several years ago, the League discontinued its classification system of orchestras as Major, Regional, Metropolitan, Urban, or Community. Now, orchestras are members of one of ten Meeting Groups. The Meeting Groups were established to create more effective meetings of managers from similar orchestras. The total artistic personnel expenses and total expenses of the orchestras define the orchestra managers' Meeting Groups. The managers' Meeting Groups are:

Artistic Personnel Expenses	Total Expenses
\$6,000,000 +	\$10,500,000 +
2,500,000 - 6,000,000	3,750,000 - 10,500,000
1,100,000 - 2,500,000	2,250,000 - 3,750,000
600,000 - 1,100,000	1,100,000 - 2,250,000
400,000 - 600,000	750,000 - 1,100,000
300,000 - 400,000	475,000 - 750,000
175,000 - 300,000	275,000 - 475,000
100,000 - 175,000	175,000 - 275,000
55,000 - 100,000	125,000 - 175,000
	\$6,000,000 + 2,500,000 - 6,000,000 1,100,000 - 2,500,000 600,000 - 1,100,000 400,000 - 600,000 300,000 - 400,000 175,000 - 300,000 100,000 - 175,000

³⁶from the August 2, 1996 issue of the American Symphony Orchestra League Magazine.

X	0 - 55,000	0 - 125,000
---	------------	-------------

Appendix C: Cities Visited and the Librarians Interviewed

Last Name	First Name	Orchestra	
Adams	Douglas	Dayton Philharmonic Orchestra	
Clark	Ray	Toledo Symphony Orchestra	
Conover	Peter	Houston Symphony	
Farabee	Marcia	National Symphony Orchestra	
Farrel	Linda	Harrisburg Symphony Orchestra	
Fredrickson	Ella	The Florida Orchestra	
Friedman	Shelley	The Nashville Symphony	
Frost	David	Columbus Symphony Orchestra	
Gardiner	Richard	Toledo Symphony Orchestra	
Levine	Martha	New World Symphony	
McGillen	Mary	Louisville Orchestra	
Mills	David	Charlotte Symphony Orchestra	
O'Brien	Bob	Atlanta Symphony Orchestra	
Rosenkrans	John	The Austin Symphony Orchestra	
Rosenkrans	John	Grant Park Symphony Orchestra	
Runyan	Michael	Indianapolis Symphony Orchestra	
Scanlon	Rebecca	The Richmond Symphony	
Schnackenberg	Karen	Dallas Symphony Orchestra	
Serio	Stuart	The Naples Philharmonic	
Sloniger	Kristi	Houston Grand Opera	
Takaro	Thomas	Florida Philharmonic	

Last Name	First Name	Orchestra	
Tarlow	Lawrence	The New York Philharmonic	
Tull	Tim	Houston Ballet Music Library	
Vaught	Greg	San Antonio Symphony Orchestra	
Vosburgh	Joann	Pittsburgh Symphony Orchestra	
Whitaker	Ron	The Cleveland Orchestra	
Wilson	Mark	Dallas Symphony Orchestra	

Appendix D: Classification of the Performance Librarian

Mary Plaine of the Baltimore Symphony gathered the following information in 1996 (now referred to as "The Mary Plaine Survey"). It includes each library position (principal, assistant, etc.) in each MOLA member orchestra.

Meeting Group Number	Number Classified as Staff	Number Classified as a Contracted Musician
I	19	30
II	30	4
III and IV	6	0

Appendix E: Timeline of the Move to Multiple Librarians³⁷

_ The Philadelphia Orchestra (group I) _				
	<u> </u>	_ The New	Jersey Symphony	/ (group II) _
_	_	_	_	_
	1975		1983	
$\frac{-}{1}$ 970		1 9 80	0	$199\overline{0}$

³⁷as it is impossible to accurately trace the move to multiple librarians for the profession as a whole, these two orchestras were chosen to represent the time frame of this shift for orchestras of their particular grouping.