

Ecological Speciation

PATRIK NOSIL

Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology, University of Colorado, Boulder, USA

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

Introduction	xv
Abbreviations	xviii
Part I: Ecological speciation and its alternatives	
I What is ecological speciation?	3
1.1. The often-continuous nature of the speciation process	3
1.2. Ecological speciation via divergent natural selection	6
1.3. A brief history of the ecological speciation hypothesis	13
1.4. Alternatives to ecological speciation	15
1.4.1. Models of speciation lacking selection	16
1.4.2. Mutation-order speciation	16
1.5. Other roles for ecology in speciation: population persistence and niche conservatism	19
1.6. Summary	21
2 Predictions and tests of ecological speciation	22
2.1. Comparative approaches (ERG)	23
2.1.1. Parallel speciation	26
2.1.2. Parallel speciation via experimental evolution in the lab	27
2.1.3. Parallel speciation in the wild	29
2.1.4. Difficulties with tests of parallel speciation	30
2.1.5. Explicit criteria for parallel speciation	30
2.2. Trait-based approaches (“magic traits”)	34
2.2.1. “Automatic” magic traits	34
2.2.2. “Classic” magic traits	35
2.2.3. Magic traits in the lab	39
2.2.4. Magic traits: conclusions	40
2.3. Fitness-based approaches (selection = RI)	41
2.3.1. Immigrant inviability	41
2.3.2. Ecologically dependent selection against hybrids	42

2.4.	Gene-flow-based approaches (isolation-by-adaptation)	43
2.4.1.	Isolation-by-adaptation: evidence	44
2.4.2.	Isolation-by-adaptation at putatively neutral genes: caveats	45
2.4.3.	Mosaic hybrid zones, phylogeographic studies, divergence-with-gene-flow models	46
2.5.	Phylogenetic shifts method	48
2.6.	Inferring causality when testing for ecological speciation	48
2.6.1.	Divergence after speciation is complete	50
2.7.	Tests and predictions of ecological speciation: conclusions and future directions	50

Part II: Components of ecological speciation

3	A source of divergent selection	55
3.1.	Differences between environments	55
3.1.1.	Examples	56
3.1.2.	Inferring divergent selection from adaptive landscapes	58
3.1.3.	An alternative to divergent selection: evolution on “holey” adaptive landscapes	58
3.1.4.	Linking differences between environments to reproductive isolation	60
3.2.	Interactions among populations	60
3.2.1.	Competition between closely related species	61
3.2.2.	Intraspecific competition within a single population	63
3.2.3.	Reinforcement	65
3.2.4.	<i>Distinguishing competition from reinforcement</i>	66
3.2.5.	Other interactions: mutualisms, tri-trophic interactions, and coevolution	66
3.2.6.	Linking interactions between populations to reproductive isolation	68
3.3.	The functional morphology and biomechanics of divergent selection	70
3.4.	Environmentally dependent sexual selection	70
3.4.1.	Divergent sexual selection through sensory drive	71
3.4.2.	Examples of divergent sexual selection via sensory drive	73
3.4.3.	A note on multimodal mating signals	77
3.4.4.	Divergent sexual selection: conclusions and remaining questions	78
3.5.	Interactions between the different sources of divergent selection	79
3.6.	Sources of divergent selection: conclusions	83

4	A form of reproductive isolation	85
4.1.	The different forms of reproductive isolation	85
4.1.1.	Divergent habitat preferences and developmental schedules	85
4.1.2.	Immigrant inviability	89
4.1.3.	Divergent mating and pollinator preferences	94
4.1.4.	Postmating, prezygotic incompatibility	95
4.1.5.	Intrinsic hybrid incompatibilities	96
4.1.6.	Ecologically dependent selection against hybrids	98
4.1.7.	Sexual selection against hybrids	100
4.1.8.	Forms of reproductive isolation: conclusions	101
4.2.	How common are different forms of reproductive isolation during ecological speciation?	102
4.3.	For a given point in the speciation process, do multiple reproductive barriers act, and what are their relative contributions to total reproductive isolation?	104
4.4.	Across the ecological speciation process, at what point do different barriers evolve?	106
4.5.	Forms of reproductive isolation: conclusions and future directions	107
5	A genetic mechanism to link selection to reproductive isolation	109
5.1.	Genetics of ecological speciation: the theory of divergence hitchhiking	110
5.2.	Linking selection to reproductive isolation via pleiotropy	113
5.3.	Linking selection to reproductive isolation via linkage disequilibrium	116
5.3.1.	Tight physical linkage	116
5.3.2.	Linkage disequilibrium and factors that reduce recombination: theory	116
5.3.3.	Linkage disequilibrium and factors that reduce recombination: data	117
5.3.4.	One-allele assortative mating mechanisms	120
5.3.5.	Strong selection	122
5.3.6.	Genetics mechanisms linking selection to reproductive isolation: conclusions	123
5.4.	Genetic constraints on ecological speciation	124
5.5.	The individual genetic basis of traits under selection and traits conferring reproductive isolation	125
5.5.1.	Theoretical relevance of number of loci under selection for speciation	125
5.5.2.	Genetic basis of adaptive divergence and reproductive isolation during ecological speciation	126
5.5.3.	Opposing genetic dominance as a form of reproductive isolation	128

5.6. Ecological speciation genes	128
5.6.1. Genes that affect reproductive isolation today	130
5.6.2. Timing of divergence	134
5.6.3. Speciation effect sizes	135
5.6.4. Ecological speciation genes: conclusions	138
5.7. Genetic mechanisms: conclusions and future directions	138

Part III: Unresolved issues

6 The geography of ecological speciation	141
6.1. Geographic views and definitions of speciation	141
6.1.1. Spatial, demic non-spatial, and spatial population genetic views	141
6.1.2. Allopatric ecological speciation	145
6.2. Non-allopatric speciation: geographic contact constrains divergence	145
6.2.1. The balance between selection and gene flow: theory	145
6.2.2. The balance between selection and gene flow: data	146
6.3. Non-allopatric speciation: geographic contact promotes divergence	148
6.3.1. The “cascade reinforcement” hypothesis	149
6.3.2. Geographic contact and adaptive spread of chromosomal inversions	150
6.3.3. Hybridization as a source of novelty: the “hybrid swarm” theory of adaptive radiation	151
6.4. The balance between constraining and diversifying effects of gene flow	152
6.5. Multiple geographic modes of divergence	154
6.6. Two problems with detecting divergence in the face of gene flow	156
6.7. Detecting divergence in the face of gene flow: comparative geographic approaches	156
6.8. Detecting divergence in the face of gene flow: coalescent approaches	158
6.8.1. Reliably detecting that gene flow occurred at some point in time	158
6.8.2. The timing of gene flow in relation to the evolution of reproductive isolation	160
6.9. Detecting divergence with gene flow: genomic approaches	160
6.10. The spatial context of selection: discrete patches versus continuous gradients	163
6.11. The spatial scale of speciation	166
6.12. Geography of ecological speciation: conclusions	167

7 The genomics of ecological speciation	169
7.1. Heterogeneous genomic divergence	170
7.2. The metaphor of genomic islands of divergence	170
7.2.1. Experimental evidence for “genomic continents” of speciation	176

7.2.2.	An integrated view of the size and the number of divergent gene regions	180
7.2.3.	The growth of genomic regions of divergence	181
7.3.	Selective sweeps and adaptation from standing variation versus new mutations	184
7.4.	Gene expression and ecological speciation	186
7.4.1.	Gene expression and adaptive genetic divergence	187
7.4.2.	Gene expression and reproductive isolation	188
7.4.3.	Gene expression and ecological speciation: conclusions	190
7.5.	The genomics of ecological speciation: conclusions and future directions	190

8 The speciation continuum: what factors affect how far speciation proceeds? 192

8.1.	The speciation continuum	192
8.2.	The stability of partial reproductive isolation	196
8.2.1.	The “stuck partway” view of speciation	196
8.2.2.	The “feedback loop” view of speciation	197
8.2.3.	Reconciliation of views: time-dependence of stability and the “speciation slowdown”	199
8.3.	Non-selective explanations for how far speciation proceeds	200
8.4.	Ecological explanations for how far speciation proceeds	200
8.4.1.	Dimensionality of ecological shifts	201
8.5.	Multifarious versus stronger selection: theory	202
8.5.1.	Contributions to total selection	202
8.5.2.	Per-trait selection coefficients and correlated evolutionary response	203
8.5.3.	Differential importance at different stages of the speciation process	203
8.6.	Multifarious versus stronger selection: phenotypic tests	204
8.6.1.	Phenotypic support for the stronger selection hypothesis	204
8.6.2.	Phenotypic support for the multifarious selection hypothesis	205
8.6.3.	Problems with phenotypic tests	206
8.7.	Multifarious versus stronger selection: genomic tests	208
8.7.1.	Genomic support for the stronger and multifarious selection hypotheses	209
8.7.2.	Hypothetical experimental genomic tests	209
8.8.	Other factors affecting the speciation continuum	210
8.8.1.	Temporal stability of divergent selection	211
8.8.2.	Alternative outcomes to speciation: sexual dimorphism and phenotypic plasticity	211
8.9.	The speciation continuum: conclusions and future directions	212

9	Conclusions and future directions	214
9.1.	What we know about ecological speciation	214
9.2.	Future work: 25 unresolved issues in ecological speciation	215
9.3.	Competing hypotheses deserving further work	215
9.4.	Issues warranting further work that were not covered in detail	215
9.4.1.	Tempo and rate of ecological speciation	215
9.4.2.	How common is ecological speciation?	218
9.4.3.	Joint action and interactions between speciation models	222
9.4.4.	Consequences of ecological speciation	223
9.5.	Final conclusion	223
	References	225
	Index	271