

Scan

A3099

H W Gould  
letter  
+ attach. mats

7 pages

New Seq p. 2

N589=522  
3149  
3150

WEST VIRGINIA UNIVERSITY

MORGANTOWN, WEST VIRGINIA

COLLEGE OF ARTS AND SCIENCES

26606

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS

16 Nov. 1973

→ A3099  
A522  
A3149  
A3150

Dr. Neil J. A. Sloane,  
Bell Laboratories,  
600 Mountain Avenue,  
Murray Hill, N.J. 07974

Dear Dr. Sloane,

I appreciated your letter of 7 November very much. I don't know whether at most 5 elementary transformations will do it, but a finite number will surely suffice! As for handshakes, I don't have the faintest idea. But I do maintain a voluminous correspondence which may help explain why I am only now finally getting around to sending you the table of Fibonomial Catalan numbers. I calculated these by hand (two ways, recursively and every tenth one being checked by direct calculation) while my wife and I watched science fiction (and Dracula, Frankenstein, etc.) Saturday nights here from a Pittsburgh TV channel (sitting up till 3 or 4 A.M.). Makes the TV interesting when the plots are dull. The result is a ten-page table of the first 50 Fibonomial Catalan numbers in factored form. The fiftieth one has 110 distinct prime factors.

Anyway, enclosed is a Xerox copy of the first two pages. I had no precise use for the actual digits in those beyond K(10), so that was the last one I gave that way. You can easily run off the values of others from the factors I give. These first two pages will give you K(n) for n=1(1)22. Be careful to note that where n is given in the left-hand column, then K(n+1) is the value given at the right. I did this to agree with the usual notation I use for ordinary Catalan numbers:  $C(n) = \binom{2n}{n} / (n+1)$ .

A108

I want to ask you if you have considered including the following two interesting sequences??? To wit:

$$S_n = \sum_{k=0}^n \frac{n!}{(n-k)!} = 1, 2, 5, 16, 65, 326, 1957, 13700, 109601, 986410, 9864101, 108505112, \dots$$

A522

N589  
✓

A3149

and

$$S'_n = \sum_{k=0}^n k!(n-k)! = 1, 2, 5, 16, 64, 312, 1812, 12288, 95616, \\ 840960, 8254080, 89441280, 1060369920, 13649610240, \dots$$

where I have given  $S_n$  for  $n=0(1)11$ , and  $S'_n$  for  $n = 0(1)13$ .

You will notice that the two start alike, but begin to differ by 1 unit with  $n = 4$ , and then the difference grows, but not too remarkably. In fact it is easy to show that

$$S_n \sim en! \quad \text{whereas} \quad S'_n \sim 2n! \quad \text{as } n \rightarrow \infty$$

Recurrences:

$$S_n = nS_{n-1} + 1, \quad S'_n = n! + \frac{n+1}{2} S'_{n-1}.$$

These two sequences have recently been confused with one another and I am writing a review for the German Zentralblatt für Mathematik (copy enclosed in fact) that shows how this has happened. I think a table of sequences such as yours would be of great help in just such situations.

Of course, the two sequences above are familiar in other notation. Of course

$$S_n = n! \sum_{k=0}^n \frac{1}{k!} \quad \text{and} \quad S'_n = n! \sum_{k=0}^n \frac{1}{\binom{n}{k}}.$$

I came across  $S'_n$  one time years ago in calculating resistance of an array of  $n$  resistors in electrical engineering work.

I would very much like to see your book. How nearly ready is it now? I saw a mention of a prepublication version in a recent paper.

Best regards,

*Henry W. Gould*  
Henry W. Gould

P.S.: I collect peculiar sequences, and might be able to suggest still others you do not have.

P.P.S.: I should remark that you be sure to know that I use  $F_n$  with this definition:  $F_0 = 0, F_1 = 1$ , then  $F_{n+1} = F_n + F_{n-1}$ .

New  
3149  
= N588.5

$$N 1248.5 = 3150$$

FIBONOMIAL CATALAN NUMBERS

k	n	F <sub>n</sub>	K(k+1), where $K(k) = \frac{1}{F_{k+1}} \binom{2k}{k} = \frac{F_{2k} F_{2k-1} \cdots F_{k+2}}{F_k F_{k-1} \cdots F_1}$
	0	0	
0	1	1	1
	2	1	
1	3	<u>2</u>	3
	4	<u>3</u>	
2	5	<u>5</u>	$2^2 \cdot \underline{5} = 20$
	6	8	
3	7	<u>13</u>	$2^2 \cdot 7 \cdot \underline{13} = 364$
	8	21	
4	9	34	$7 \cdot 11 \cdot 13 \cdot 17 = 17017$
	10	55	
5	11	<u>89</u>	$2 \cdot 3^2 \cdot 7 \cdot 11 \cdot 17 \cdot \underline{89} = 2097018$
	12	144	
6	13	<u>233</u>	$2 \cdot 3 \cdot 11 \cdot 17 \cdot 29 \cdot 89 \cdot \underline{233} = 674740506$
	14	377	
7	15	610	$2 \cdot 3 \cdot 5 \cdot 11 \cdot 29 \cdot 47 \cdot 61 \cdot 89 \cdot 233 = 568965009030$
	16	987	
8	17	<u>1597</u>	$2^3 \cdot 3 \cdot 19 \cdot 29 \cdot 47 \cdot 61 \cdot 89 \cdot 233 \cdot \underline{1597} = 1255571292290712$
	18	2584	
9	19	4181	$2^3 \cdot 3^2 \cdot 19 \cdot 29 \cdot 37 \cdot 41 \cdot 47 \cdot 61 \cdot 113 \cdot 233 \cdot 1597 = 7254987185250544104$
	20	6765	
10	21	10946	$13 \cdot 19 \cdot 29 \cdot 37 \cdot 41 \cdot 47 \cdot 61 \cdot 113 \cdot 199 \cdot 233 \cdot 421 \cdot 1597$
	22	17711	
11	23	<u>28657</u>	$2 \cdot 7 \cdot 13 \cdot 19 \cdot 23 \cdot 29 \cdot 37 \cdot 41 \cdot 47 \cdot 61 \cdot 113 \cdot 199 \cdot 421 \cdot 1597 \cdot \underline{28657}$
	24	46368	
12	25	75025	$2 \cdot 5^2 \cdot 7 \cdot 19 \cdot 23 \cdot 37 \cdot 41 \cdot 47 \cdot 61 \cdot 113 \cdot 199 \cdot 421 \cdot 521 \cdot 1597 \cdot 3001 \cdot 28657$

$$n = 2k + 1$$

Theorem:  $k \geq 2$  &  $F_{2k+1} = \text{prime}$

$$\Rightarrow F_{2k+1} \mid K(k+1).$$

Calculated by *A. W. Gould*

k	n	$F_n$	$K(k+1)$
	26	121393	
13	27	196418	$2 \cdot 3 \cdot 5 \cdot 7 \cdot 17 \cdot 19 \cdot 23 \cdot 37 \cdot 41 \cdot 47 \cdot 53 \cdot 109 \cdot 113 \cdot 199 \cdot 281 \cdot 421 \cdot 521 \cdot 1597 \cdot 3001 \cdot 28657$
	28	317811	
14	29	<u>514229</u>	$2^3 \cdot 5 \cdot 11 \cdot 17 \cdot 19 \cdot 23 \cdot 31 \cdot 37 \cdot 41 \cdot 53 \cdot 109 \cdot 113 \cdot 199 \cdot 281 \cdot 421 \cdot 521 \cdot 1597 \cdot 3001 \cdot 28657 \cdot 514229$
	30	832040	
15	31	1346269	$2^3 \cdot 5 \cdot 11 \cdot 17 \cdot 19 \cdot 23 \cdot 31 \cdot 37 \cdot 41 \cdot 53 \cdot 109 \cdot 113 \cdot 199 \cdot 281 \cdot 421 \cdot 521 \cdot 557 \cdot 2207 \cdot 2417 \cdot 3001 \cdot 28657 \cdot 514229$
	32	2178309	
16	33	3524578	$2 \cdot 5 \cdot 11 \cdot 23 \cdot 31 \cdot 37 \cdot 41 \cdot 53 \cdot 89 \cdot 109 \cdot 113 \cdot 199 \cdot 281 \cdot 421 \cdot 521 \cdot 557 \cdot 2207 \cdot 2417 \cdot 3001 \cdot 3571 \cdot 19801 \cdot 28657 \cdot 514229$
	34	5702887	
17	35	9227465	$2^2 \cdot 3^3 \cdot 5^2 \cdot 11 \cdot 13 \cdot 23 \cdot 31 \cdot 41 \cdot 53 \cdot 89 \cdot 107 \cdot 109 \cdot 199 \cdot 281 \cdot 421 \cdot 521 \cdot 557 \cdot 2207 \cdot 2417 \cdot 3001 \cdot 3571 \cdot 19801 \cdot 28657 \cdot 141961 \cdot 514229$
	36	14930352	
18	37	24157817	$2^2 \cdot 3^2 \cdot 5 \cdot 13 \cdot 23 \cdot 31 \cdot 53 \cdot 73 \cdot 89 \cdot 107 \cdot 109 \cdot 149 \cdot 199 \cdot 281 \cdot 421 \cdot 521 \cdot 557 \cdot 2207 \cdot 2221 \cdot 2417 \cdot 3001 \cdot 3571 \cdot 9349 \cdot 19801 \cdot 28657 \cdot 141961 \cdot 514229$
	38	39088169	
19	39	63245986	$2^2 \cdot 3^2 \cdot 5 \cdot 7 \cdot 23 \cdot 31 \cdot 53 \cdot 73 \cdot 89 \cdot 107 \cdot 109 \cdot 149 \cdot 199 \cdot 233 \cdot 281 \cdot 521 \cdot 557 \cdot 2161 \cdot 2207 \cdot 2221 \cdot 2417 \cdot 3001 \cdot 3571 \cdot 9349 \cdot 19801 \cdot 28657 \cdot 135721 \cdot 141961 \cdot 514229$
	40	102334155	
20	41	165580141	$2^4 \cdot 3^2 \cdot 5 \cdot 7 \cdot 23 \cdot 29 \cdot 31 \cdot 53 \cdot 73 \cdot 107 \cdot 109 \cdot 149 \cdot 211 \cdot 233 \cdot 281 \cdot 521 \cdot 557 \cdot 2161 \cdot 2207 \cdot 2221 \cdot 2417 \cdot 2789 \cdot 3001 \cdot 3571 \cdot 9349 \cdot 19801 \cdot 28657 \cdot 59369 \cdot 135721 \cdot 141961 \cdot 514229$
	42	267914296	
21	43	<u>433494437</u>	$2^4 \cdot 3^3 \cdot 5 \cdot 7 \cdot 23 \cdot 29 \cdot 31 \cdot 43 \cdot 53 \cdot 73 \cdot 107 \cdot 109 \cdot 149 \cdot 211 \cdot 233 \cdot 281 \cdot 307 \cdot 521 \cdot 557 \cdot 2161 \cdot 2207 \cdot 2221 \cdot 2417 \cdot 2789 \cdot 3001 \cdot 3571 \cdot 9349 \cdot 19801 \cdot 59369 \cdot 135721 \cdot 141961 \cdot 514229 \cdot 433494437$
	44	701408733	

Calculated by *W. J. Gould*

PRIME FACTORS OF CATALAN NUMBERS

k	n	$\binom{n}{k} - \binom{n}{k-1}$	Prime factors
0	1	1	
1	3	2	2
2	<u>5</u>	5	<u>5</u>
3	<u>7</u>	14	2· <u>7</u>
4	9	42	2·3·7
5	<u>11</u>	132	2 <sup>2</sup> ·3· <u>11</u>
6	<u>13</u>	429	3·11· <u>13</u>
7	15	1430	2·5·11·13
8	<u>17</u>	4862	2·11·13· <u>17</u>
9	<u>19</u>	16796	2 <sup>2</sup> ·13·17· <u>19</u>
10	21	58786	2·7·13·17·19
11	<u>23</u>	208012	2 <sup>2</sup> ·7·17·19· <u>23</u>
12	25	742900	2 <sup>2</sup> ·5 <sup>2</sup> ·17·19·23
13	27	2674440	2 <sup>3</sup> ·3 <sup>2</sup> ·5·17·19·23
14	<u>29</u>	9694845	3 <sup>2</sup> ·5·17·19·23· <u>29</u>
15	<u>31</u>	35357670	2·3 <sup>2</sup> ·5·19·23·29· <u>31</u>
16	33	129644790	2·3·5·11·19·23·29·31
17	35	477638700	2 <sup>2</sup> ·3·5 <sup>2</sup> ·11·23·29·31
18	<u>37</u>	1767263190	2·3·5·7·11·23·29·31· <u>37</u>
19	39	6564120420	2 <sup>2</sup> ·3·5·11·13·23·29·31·37
20	<u>41</u>	24466267020	2 <sup>2</sup> ·3·5·13·23·29·31·37· <u>41</u>
21	<u>43</u>	91482563640	2 <sup>3</sup> ·3·5·13·29·31·37·41· <u>43</u>
22	45	343059613650	2·3·5 <sup>2</sup> ·13·29·31·37·41·43
23	<u>47</u>	1289904147324	2·3 <sup>2</sup> ·13·29·31·37·41·43· <u>47</u>

$$C(k) = \frac{1}{k+1} \binom{2k}{k}$$

$n = 2k + 1$ , whence  $\binom{n}{k} - \binom{n}{k-1} = \binom{2k+1}{k} - \binom{2k+1}{k-1} = \frac{(2k+2)!}{(k+1)!(k+2)!} = C(k+1)$ .

Theorem:  $k \geq 2$  and  $2k+1 = \text{prime} \Rightarrow 2k+1 | C(k+1)$ .

Calculated by J. W. Jones

226218

1972 Wb

ZENTRALBLATT FÜR MATHEMATIK

Date: 06 10 72

Term: 8 weeks

Please classify according to the MOS schedule of the AMS

PRIMARY CLASSIFICATION CODE 1 5 A 1 5

Secondary classifications 05A19

If full MOS scheme is not available to you, please give the appropriate section number (see reverse) and use keywords of your own choice for finer classification.

Kaucky, Josef:

Some remarks on a combinatorial problem.

Mat. Časopis, Slovensk, Akad. Vied  
22, 215-218 (1972).

05

H.W. Gould *Ad*

Please use extra sheets if necessary

Please type if possible

The determinant

$$D_n = \begin{vmatrix} 0! & -\binom{1}{1} & 0 & 0 & \dots & 0 \\ 1! & \binom{2}{1} & -\binom{2}{2} & 0 & \dots & 0 \\ 2! & -\binom{3}{1} & \binom{3}{2} & -\binom{3}{3} & \dots & 0 \\ \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots \\ (n-2)! & \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots & -\binom{n-1}{n-1} \\ (n-1)! & (-1)^n \binom{n}{1} & (-1)^{n-1} \binom{n}{2} & \dots & \dots & \binom{n}{n-1} \end{vmatrix}$$

was the subject of Problem 690 [Math. Magazine, 41(1968), 96, 290-291; 42(1969), 154-156]. The author of the present paper claims that the published value of  $D_n$  and the proof are incorrect and then gives a fresh derivation of a correct value. This is an interesting situation, because the author quotes the (correct) formula found in the reference cited quite incorrectly. The formula for  $D_n$  derived in the present paper is, however, also correct as we shall show below.

Please keep distance between lines

C  
O  
P  
Y

NOTE TO EDITORS AND PRINTERS: The fractions on this page should be set and printed just as shown because of the fact that the review points out mistakes based on confusion between "a/b" and "ab" in the original paper reviewed.

*A. W. Gould*

T H A N K Y O U,

In the first place, the (correct) value given in the published solution is

$$(1) \quad D_n = \sum_{j=0}^{n-1} S_j, \quad \text{where} \quad S_j = \sum_{i=0}^j \frac{j!}{(j-i)!},$$

which is incorrectly given in the present paper with

$$(2) \quad S_j = \sum_{i=0}^j i!(j-i)!$$

This circumstance may be due to the fact that  $S_j$  is incorrectly printed in one place in the problem solution as

$$S_j = \sum_{i=0}^j i!/(j-i)!$$

and possible confusion of  $i!/(j-i)!$  with  $i!(j-i)!$ .

The first few values (for  $j = 0, 1, 2, \dots$ ) of  $S_j$  as given by (1) are 1, 2, 5, 16, 65, 326, ... whereas the values given by (2) (as noted by the author) are 1, 2, 5, 16, 64, 312, ... and the correct values of  $D_n$ , correspondingly, are 1, 3, 8, 24, 89, 415, ...

In the second place, the derivation of the value of  $D_n$

$$(3) \quad D_n = \sum_{j=1}^n \binom{n}{j} (j-1)!$$

in the present paper seems to be quite correct, and the fact that (3) agrees with (1) as originally set forth in the problem solution is easily seen from the following steps:

$$\sum_{j=0}^{n-1} \sum_{i=0}^j \frac{j!}{(j-i)!} = \sum_{i=0}^{n-1} i! \sum_{j=i}^{n-1} \binom{j}{i} = \sum_{i=0}^{n-1} i! \binom{n}{i+1}$$

which is precisely (3) upon replacing  $i$  by  $j-1$ .

Finally, the recurrence given for (2) is not new.

*Henry W. Gould*  
3. Nov. 1973



FATAL ERROR \* MISSING ROUTINE  
FATAL ERROR \* MISSING ROUTINE  
FATAL ERROR \* MISSING ROUTINE  
FATAL ERROR \* MISSI

P9  
P9  
M9

\*MNE GEBORT INSERTED AT REFERENCES  
\*MNE GEBORT INSERTED AT REFERENCES  
\*MNE GEBORT INSERTED AT REFERENCES

\*RINH = (BCD) USER/RAR

1  
2  
641T 01/31/74 18.192

5  
16  
64  
312  
1812  
12288  
95616  
848960  
8254080  
89441280  
1060069920  
13649610240  
187550368000  
2824077312000  
44927447040000  
760034451456000  
13622700994560000  
257872110354432000  
5140559166898176000  
107637893007589376000  
2361827297364895504000  
54193944307263602698000  
1297872705574034472960000  
32383555215793434132480000

3149

50 00 1 N=2.50

\*RINH = (BCD) USER/TORAR

U~#XO<38:0/D

#10

W1Mk+L1H83P@<0#

F~X~X~X~

00GIN: NJS

DC

13 19 29 37 41 47 61 113 199\*\*\*\*\*p

700550979746059

233 421 1597\*\*\*p

109744478168199574282739

1597 421\*233\*199\*113\*61\*47\*41\*37\*29\*19\*13\*p

109744478168199574282739

7 13 19 23 29 37 41 47 61 113 199\*\*\*\*\*p

225577415478230998

421 1597 28657\*\*\*p

4346236474244131564253156182

28657 1597\*421\*199\*113\*61\*46\*7\*41\*37\*29\*23\*19\*13\*7\*2\*p

4346236474244131564253156182