The Expulsion of the Moriscos: Still more Questions than Answers James S. Amelang

Universidad Autónoma, Madrid

Abstract:

Among the many dramatic events that have recently attracted world attention has been the attempted migration across or around the Mediterranean of millions of refugees from the Middle East and Africa. Relatively few of these migrants-- and even fewer Europeans-- know of a singular precedent for this mass mobility: one that moved in the opposite direction, and which involved the forcible transfer from Spain to North Africa of tens of thousands of suspected Muslims. The expulsion in 1609-14 of the so-called *moriscos*-- that is, individuals of Islamic ancestry who had been baptized as Catholics-- was a highly controversial measure whose explicit goal was to purge from the Spanish empire the remaining descendants of the North Africans who had conquered the Iberian peninsula in the early 8th century and then resided there as Muslims to the 1520s. The story of the early modern moriscos, and the reasons why after a long period of coexistence they were expelled, offers lessons from the past, as well as some thoughts for the present.

Had there been a newspaper in Madrid in 1609-- and there was not one-- the headline on September 22 would have been a Trumpist's dream come true. It would have read something like "the king decrees that all Muslims are to expelled from Spain, whether they are true Muslims or not". The article itself would have gone on to explain the decision of the Council of State to exile from Spanish territory virtually all the descendants of the former Muslims of Spain who had converted (or had been converted) to Roman Catholicism, a process which had begun centuries earlier in the Middle Ages and which had been officially declared "mission accomplished" in 1526.

I am a historian of early modern Europe, that is, covering the fifteenth to eighteenth centuries, and have long been interested in the ups and downs of the two major persecuted minorities of early modern Spain, the converted Jews (conversos) and Muslims (moriscos). Like most of my colleagues, I am not often called upon to link my work to the present; and the truth is, I very much welcome the opportunity to do so. As a historian who lives in Europe today, the hypothetical headline I just read to you sounds all too familiar, although to be fair, Spain is one of the countries in Europe where one hears least about expelling Muslims, and this despite the fact that it has a large Islamic population, mostly of Moroccan origin. In fact, one of the more encouraging features of politics in Spain now is the lack of a political party or faction calling for anti-Muslim measures, of the sort one finds in virtually all the rest of the continent. Explaining why this

is is a job for a sociologist, political scientist, or perhaps a psychologist. I see my job today as a different one: to discuss another very visible differential between Spain and the rest of Western Europe. That is the accrual in the Iberian Peninsula beginning in the Middle Ages of a large population of Muslim origin, some of whose members genuinely converted to Christianity while others remained faithful to their ancestral religion. The group as a whole was known as the moriscos, and are the focus of this brief talk.

One way to start discussing the expulsion of the moriscos is to ask about the relevance for the present-day United States of this obscure event involving an obscure group of people in an obscure place several centuries ago. Here I think it important to resist the temptation to draw too close a parallel between what were frankly two very different contexts. As I suggested in my opening remarks, at first sight the expulsion which began in 1609 seems ready-made for consideration in light of the present political context. But one is struck not only by the similarity between these events, but also by some very visible differences. Among the most telling of the divergences was that at least officially, the expulsion from Spain of the moriscos was justified not so much as a political measure, as in religious terms. Various pragmatic arguments in its favor floated around, and certainly shaped not only the measure but also an important part of popular opinion regarding it. But the crucial justification for the expulsion was the failure on the part of the descendants of former Muslims to shed their ancestors' belief in Islam. It goes without saying that this is a complex issue

which raises complex questions of credibility, the possibility or desirability of pluralism within a confessional state, contemporary understandings of the relations of this confessionalism with political strength or weakness, and the like. Thus what I hope to do is to outline some of the principal questions raised by the historical experience of Spain's moriscos, and I will do so by focusing on what the recent and, as I will emphasize, quite flourishing historiography regarding the moriscos and their fate has to suggest.¹

The basic facts can be quickly stated by mentioning a few key dates:
711: the conquest of Spain by Muslims largely of north African origin;
722: the (fairly mythical) beginning of the "Reconquest", or effort by
Christians in northern Spain to regain territory by expanding southward;
1236: the Christian "recapture" of the Muslim metropolis of Córdoba,
followed by Seville in 1248, which left the southern kingdom of Granada as
the sole territory under Muslim control;

1492: the *Wunderjahr* which saw not only the final conquest of Granada by Christian armies under king Ferdinand of Aragon and queen Isabella of Castile, but also the expulsion of the Jews and the successful voyage of Christopher Columbus to the western hemisphere;

1502: the decision by Ferdinand and Isabella to expel all Muslims from the kingdom of Castile who would not convert to Christianity;

1526: the extension of this policy under their successor Charles V to the Crown of Aragon and the rest of Spain;

1568-71: a major armed revolt in Granada by moriscos (former Muslims now converted to Christianity and their descendants), which ended in defeat, widespread destruction, and the dispersal of the survivors of what had been the largest nucleus of moriscos in Andalusia throughout the rest of Castile; 1609: the final solution, i.e. the expulsion of (in theory) all moriscos-approximately 300,000 in number-- from Spanish territories, mostly to Muslim states in North Africa...

The expulsion of the moriscos from Spain thus comes at the end of a long timeline. The call to this conference clearly refers to it as a migration, and while some might be put off by the use of that word, given the sheer amount of state-sponsored coercion involved, I personally as a social scientist have no problems with the term. That it was forced did not mean that it was not a migration. In fact, one can properly refer to it as the largest such migration in early modern European history.

It moreover was, or is, an event long encrusted in various mythologies, some dating from the time, and others having a more recent origin. The principal message-- and purpose-- of the contemporary mythology was apologia, that is, defense of what turned out to be a highly controversial event. Such efforts focused on both official and unofficial discourse. It is also important to note that only one side of this debate, that of approval, was allowed to be heard in public.² The other side, which included criticism of this measure, could reach the public sphere via print or

that the most vocal contemporary public criticism of the expulsion was voiced by Spain's enemies or rivals in the international arena. And the way many people today read this long-ago event echoes in part this discourse. (NB: I emphasize "in part", because these critiques also contained claims and suppositions that virtually all scholars now would not agree with).

That said, the big question today is not so much the simple one of whether the expulsion was a good or bad measure. Historians and others focus on a more complex agenda, centering on exactly what happened, why it happened, and what were its consequences. Other queries flow from these basic ones, and include whether the expulsion was justified in terms of the factors its partisans adduced as causes; in other words, were the reasons given for the expulsion at the time valid ones in the eyes of contemporaries and subsequent generations of Spaniards who were the beneficiaries or victims of its effects. Another is whether this decision was justified in terms of its effect. This means inquiring whether its impact was successful in the eyes not only of its supporters at the time, but also according to the subsequent judgment of Spaniards and others in the future. I lack the time to reconstruct the debates among historians over these questions, in part because until recently there has not been a solid enough consensus in this regard. And the reasons for this lack of consensus are good ones. It is not because we historians are an especially obtuse or cantankerous lot, but rather because we are now in the midst of a very exciting historiographical

moment in which we are trying to digest a lot of new research based in part upon new sources. Thus during the rest of my talk I will briefly review several major discussions that this recent research has produced, and then make some final remarks about the directions in which future discussions seem to be heading.

The multiple benefits that new research and rethinking of the history of the moriscos has produced include the following:

1. We now have more detailed knowledge of the political relations between converted Muslims and the Christian majority in early modern Spain, and one that focuses around at least two major themes: the most violent episode in the history of the Spanish moriscos, the Granada revolt of 1568-71 alluded to above; and above all, what has attracted the most new attention, which is the expulsion itself. Various scholars have gone back to the drawing board to examine both sets of events in close detail, and with closer attention to precise context. For example, thanks to fine-grained research of the sort found in Rafael Benítez's reconstruction of the trajectory that led to final decision for expulsion in 1609, we now can see more clearly how much it was the product of a very specific moment, one that saw a weak monarch and his equally beleaguered favorite opting for this move under considerable pressure caused by events and political initiatives elsewhere.³ One can also now draw attention to recent revealing work on the international dimensions of the expulsion. One example is a recent issue of the Italian

journal *Quaderni Storici* edited by Stefania Pastore and Giovanna Fiume, which focuses on the mixed reception of the exiled moriscos in Italy, not just in the parts of the peninsula that were not under the direct or indirect control of Spain but also in more independent entities such as Papal Rome, which harbored grave doubts about the practical as well as theological aspects of the expulsion, although it chose not to express them in public.⁴

2. Recent research has also uncovered and interpreted a great deal of material regarding the social and economic history of the moriscos. Much of this has focused on the longer term, and continues longstanding and valuable local work in, for example, notarial archives and Inquisition records. The cumulative effect of this new knowledge has been the slow conversion of rumors and stereotypes about moriscos, often engendered and diffused by their enemies, into better documented social and economic history. Thus, for example, we now have a much finer appreciation of the degree of stratification within morisco communities. The dominant stereotype in the past was that morisco settlements were largely undifferentiated, that is, that their members subsisted at the same general level of poverty, and practiced the same economic activities, which were by and large limited to agriculture. We now have a keener appreciation of the existence of greater variation in morisco economic initiatives, as well as of significant differences among moriscos at the local level, as well as among different types of morisco communities at a regional level. Predictably, differences among morisco activities often were more visible at this latter

level, and engendered stereotypes that pitted, say, Castile as opposed to Valencia or Granada, all large areas which housed distinct agricultural patterns and social systems.⁵

One of the most important developments has been the recent intense focus on morisco elites, defined in social and economic as well as political terms. Which immediately raises the crucial question of the differing degrees of assimilation of these elites into existing power structures. This is moreover one of the many questions where one finds it useful to distinguish between the experiences and opportunities of the moriscos as opposed to the *conversos*, or converts from Judaism, who underwent a parallel experience of largely forced (and similarly incomplete) assimilation into the Christian majority. In this regard one of the subjects which has attracted more attention recently is the curious recognition of the exisence of a morisco nobility, something which did not happen in the case of the former Jews.

Much more could be said about this new socio-economic history of the moriscos. It comes as little surprise to find, for example, greater attention paid to gender differentiation within morisco communities. I would quickly mention other interesting new work which has similarly revealed much about the forms of differentiation and hierarchy in morisco communities that came into the open thanks to the expulsion itself. The latter obliged the moriscos to mobilize and convert what resources they had into more mobile forms of capital. The subsequent activation of networks of contacts in order

to export this wealth brought to the surface the existence of a cohort of moriscos with more resources than virtually anyone had suspected. And some of the most interesting information on this question comes from the reports of the Spanish government's wide-ranging espionage networks.⁹

The other major issue being debated in the social history of the moriscos-- and the one that has perhaps done the most to alter traditional views-- has been the question of the relations between moriscos and their "Old Christian" neighbors at the local level. Both the decrees of expulsion and the apologetic literature that appeared in order to justify it constantly asserted, and even took for granted, the existence of profound hostility between the so-called Old versus New Christians. However, the British scholar Trevor Dadson recently produced an enormous study-- almost 1400 pages long-- that reconstructs the strenuous efforts not only by the moriscos of a small town in La Mancha to defy the expulsion order, but also the equally determined initiatives of their Old Christian neighbors to help them stay in Spain. Dadson's exhaustive documentation and keen eye for reading between the lines of official papers has converted this study into the most innovative (and influential) recent book on the social and economic history of the moriscos of the past generation.¹⁰

All this new work has done much to alter our understanding above all of the impact of the expulsion. As a result, historians are now more inclined to accept the hypothesis that there were both many more moriscos exempted

from exile, as well as many more returnees after having been expelled, than we had previously thought. Given the nature of the documentation, and the obvious need to keep most of this absorption in secrecy, we will never be able document this dimension of morisco history with any exactitude. Still, there is no mistaking the tendencies now coming to the fore thanks to this innovative (and strenuous) research.

- 3. Finally, great strides have been made recently in the spiritual and intellectual history of the moriscos. For obvious reasons, this field has largely been the hands of professional Arabists, who have continued to labor on many of the topics of basic philological and religious historical research that began in the later nineteenth century. The more visible work in this field has included the preparation and publication of new editions and translations of key texts, including the following examples:
- The first-person account of the so-called "Mancebo" or young man of Arévalo, a town in Old Castile. 11 This refers to the first-person journal of an anonymous morisco who at some point in the 1530s was sent by the elders of his community to communicate with other nuclei of crypto-Muslims in central and southern Spain while he studied to become an Islamic spiritual expert. The text provides fascinating accounts of conversations with a wide swath of individuals and groups, most notably a 93-year old illiterate Muslim woman nicknamed the "Mora de Ubeda", famous for her extraordinary knowledge of the Koran. It also provides an unusually

revealing view of the health of crypto-Islam in different regions of the peninsula in the first or second generation following the final conversions.

- Various anti-Muslim works, that is, polemics aimed at detaching former Muslim readers and even clerics from their traditions. One of the most revealing and influential among these is a series of dialogues which the Erasmian humanist (and descendant of converted Jews) Bernardo Pérez de Chinchón published in 1535 under title of the *Anti-Quran*. 12
- In my view the most unusual among these primary sources is an autobiographical text which appeared in the form of a travelogue, by an Andalusian morisco named Ahmad ibn Qasim Al-Hajari. After starting in Granada, where the author was recruited as a young man to serve on the team of translators of the so-called "lead books" (more on them below), the author escaped to Morocco, where he soon prospered as a political adviser and diplomat. Al-Hajari was then sent as an ambassador to France, and while there travelled widely in Europe before finally returning to North Africa, where he eventually settled in Egypt. The text gives a fascinating glimpse into how a Muslim of Spanish background perceived early modern Europe, and includes reconstructions of his conversations with a wide range of scholars, clerics, government officials, and other interlocutors.

But scholars have broken new ground in other ways in addition to editing important texts. One good example of strenuous and innovative work with local sources is Amalia García Pedraza's research in Granada's notarial archives in pursuit of reconstructing attitudes toward death among local moriscos, especially the more assimilated ones who lived within the city. 14 And most influential here has been the work of Mercedes García Arenal, an unusually prolific and wideranging scholar, who has gathered a large circle of colleagues and students to collaborate with her and her frequent co-author Fernando Rodríguez-Mediano in a lengthy series of projects. One useful starting point for following her work-- a fair amount of which is available in English-- is their joint contribution to a growing body of research and analysis regarding what was easily the most bizarre episode in the entire one hundred years of the history of the moriscos, the scandal of the *Plomos* (lead seals) of Granada. 15

This refers to the "discovery" in Granada beginning in 1588 of a series of objects, mostly lead seals bearing inscriptions in Arabic, that referred directly to the earliest moments of the Christian evangelization of Spain purportly through Saint James. Their messages included numerous and frankly shocking revelations, especially the news that the Virgin Mary had been a speaker of Arabic. This surprise was joined by many others, including the existence outside the New Testament of a fifth gospel written in that language, and which reinforced the notion of the existence of an alternative revelation whose geographical center was the city of Granada. Numerous studies of this bizarre episode have been written in the wake of

this discovery, which continues to attract the attention not only of Arabists but also of specialists in early modern cultural as well as religious history.

In the aftermath of this new wave of research García-Arenal and Rodríguez-Mediano went on to organize a major European research project known as the CORPI initiative. Its aim was to make further progress in the reconstruction of scholarly familiarity with both Islam and the Arabic language in the part of Western Europe where they had their deepest historical roots. The newest development here has been their effort to trace how inter-religious polemic during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries fostered in Southern Europe the development of variants of religious and philosophical skepticism similar to those which emerged in Northern Europe in the wake of western Christianity's splitting into Catholic and Protestant factions (not to mention the older and still ongoing polemics between Christians and Jews that served as another indirect fount of skepticism). Among the first fruits of these excursions into unexplored territory has been a collection of essays from the members of the project, which cover an impressively wide range of topics in Christian and Jewish as well as Muslim history. 16

If we step back from all this activity and try to get a reading of the scholarly situation now, my feeling is that the present is marked neither by iron consensus nor by fierce combat among the historians of moriscos.

Instead, what outsiders such as myself register is slow change in the

general contours of agreement and disagreement among the specialists, and above all real, visible progress in the forging and dissemination of both specialized and general knowledge of a collectivity that has not received the historiographical attention that it deserves. Above all, what we have seen in the last generation has been a significant shift in focus away from the dominant themes of the past, especially the near-exclusive emphasis that assumed that moriscos were crypto-Muslims, or rather, that assumed that they were *solely* crypto-Muslims. This had of course been the overriding assumption and concern of their persecutors. One crucial result of the broader approach summarized here is that the moriscos have taken on a more plural and differentiated profile. They now are approached as individual members of communities with specific types of resources and support at their disposal. They moreover mobilized these resources, both material and immaterial, as best as they could as they sought to cope with continuous but far from uniform hostility and mistrust on the part of the Old Christian majority and its leading institutions.

And with this I end by returning to the title of my talk. Having more questions than answers can actually be a good thing in history, provided that the questions are informed and focus on the right issues, that is, the topics that bring forward movement. I firmly believe that the study of moriscos today is in better hands than ever, and I hope that some of you may be tempted to find this out for yourselves, as readers or even as researchers. If you do so, believe me, you will not regret it.

- ¹ Among the more important general studies see: Antonio Domínguez Ortiz and Bernard Vincent, Historia de los moriscos: vida y tragedia de una minoría, Madrid: Alianza, 1997 [orig. ed. 1979], as well as Vincent's collection of essays El río morisco, trans. Antonio Luis Cortés Peña, Valencia-Granada-Zaragoza: Universitat de València-Universidad de Granada-Universidad de Zaragoza, 2007; Francisco Márquez Villanueva, El problema morisco (desde otras laderas), Madrid: Prodhufi, 1998; L.P. Harvey, Muslims in Spain, 1500 to 1614, University of Chicago Press, Chicago, 2005; and Luis F. Bernabé Pons, Los moriscos. Conflicto, expulsión y diáspora, Madrid: Ediciones de la Catarata, 2009.
 ² On this see Grace Magnier, Pedro de Valencia and the Catholic Apologists of the Expulsion of the Moriscos: Visions of Christianity and Kingship, Leiden: Brill, 2010.
- ³ Rafael Benítez Sánchez-Blanco, Heroicas decisiones: La Monarquía Católica y los moriscos valencianos, Valencia: Institució Alfons el Magnànim, 2001. Other valuable recent work on the expulsion includes Benjamin Ehlers, Between Christians and Moriscos: Juan de Ribera and Religious Reform in Valencia, 1568-1614, Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2006; and Mercedes García-Arenal and Gerard Wiegers (eds.), The Expulsion of the Moriscos from Spain: A Mediterranean Diaspora, Leiden: Brill, 2014.
- ⁴ "Diaspora morisca", eds. Giovanna Fiume and Stefania Pastore, *Quaderni Storici*, nº 144, 2013, pp. 663-812.
- ⁵ Studies of the social history of the moriscos include: Mercedes García-Arenal, *Inquisición y moriscos*. Los procesos del tribunal de Cuenca, Madrid: Siglo XXI, 1978; Serafín de Tapia Sánchez, La comunidad morisca de Avila, Salamanca: Universidad de Salamanca, 1991; Luis García-Ballester, "The Inquisition and minority medical practitioners in Counter-Reformation Spain: Judaizing and Morisco practicioners, 1560-1610" in Ole Peter Grell and Andrew Cunningham (eds.), *Medicine and the Reformation*, London: Wellcome Institute Series in the History of Medicine; Routledge, 1993, pp. 156-191; Gregorio Colás Latorre, "Cristianos y moriscos en Aragón: una nueva lectura de sus relaciones y comportamientos en el marco de la sociedad rural", *Mélanges de la Casa de Velázquez*, vol. 29, 1993, pp. 153-170; and Mary Halavais, *Like Wheat to the Miller: Community, Convivencia, and the Construction of Morisco Identity in Sixteenth-Century Aragon*, New York: Columbia University Press, 2002.
- ⁶ There has been surprisingly little direct comparison of the experience of the converted Jews with that of their ex-Muslim counterparts. Among the few exceptions see Claude Bernard Stuczynski, "Two Minorities Facing the Iberian Inquisition: The 'Marranos' and the 'Moriscos'", *Hispania Judaica*, vol. 3, 2000, pp. 127-143; my own *Parallel Histories: Muslims and Jews in Inquisitorial Spain*, Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 2013; and the diverse volumes (to date three) in the series edited by Kevin Ingram, *The Conversos and Moriscos in Early Modern Spain and Beyond*, published in Leiden by Brill since 2009.
- ⁷ For a richly documented analysis of the case of Granada, see Enrique Soria Mesa, *Linajes granadinos*, Granada: Diputación Provincial, 2008. This context also produced an exceptionally interesting text in which a local morisco notable defended morisco linguistic and social customs against the 1566 forced assimilation decrees of Philip II that provoked the disastrous revolt of 1568. It is now available in English as Francisco Núñez Muley, *A Memorandum for the President of the Royal Audience and Chancery Court of the City and Kingdom of Granada*, ed. and trans. Vincent Barletta, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2007.
- ⁸ One of the few studies of morisco history from the perspective of gender is Mary Elizabeth Perry, *The Handless Maiden: Moriscos and the Politics Of Religion in Early Modern Spain*, Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2005. See also Aurelia Martín Casares, *La esclavitud en la Granada del siglo XVI. Género, raza y religión*, prologue B. Bennassar, Granada: Universidad de Granada, 2000, and Ronald E. Surtz, "Morisco Women, Written Texts, and the Valencia Inquisition", *Sixteenth Century Journal*, vol. 32, nº 2, 2001, pp. 421-

- ⁹ See for instance Luis F. Bernabé Pons and Jorge Gil Herrera, "Los moriscos fuera de España. Rutas y financiación", in García-Arenal and Wiegers (eds.), *Los moriscos: Expulsión y diáspora*, pp. 213-231.
- ¹⁰ See Trevor J. Dadson, Los moriscos de Villarrubia de los Ojos (siglos XV-XVIII). Historia de una minoría asimilada, expulsada y reintegrada, Madrid-Frankfurt: Iberoamericana-Vervuert, 2006. Readers not familiar with Spanish can get a sense of the argument of this very lengthy but crucial book by consulting a companion collection of essays by the same author, Tolerance and Coexistence in Early Modern Spain: Old Christians and Moriscos in the Campo de Calatrava, Woodbridge Suffolk: Tamesis, 2014. A similar stance stressing the relative lack of hostility between moriscos and their Old Christian neighbors at the local level has appeared more recently in a detailed reconstruction of ethnic-social relations in the nearby town of Deza. See Patrick O' Banion's thoroughly documented This Happened in My Presence: Moriscos, Old Christians, and the Spanish Inquisition in the Town of Deza, 1569-1611, Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2017.
- ¹¹ Tratado [Tafsira] del Mancebo de Arévalo, ed. María Teresa Narváez Córdova, Madrid: Trotta, 2003.
- ¹² Antialcorano, Diálogos christianos, conversión y evangelización de moriscos, ed. Francisco Pons Fuster, Alicante: Universidad de Alicante, 2000.
- ¹³ Kitab Nasir al-din ala 'L'Qawn al-Kafirin (The Supporter of Religion Against the Infidel), general introduction, critical edition and annotated English translation by P.S. Van Koningsveld, Q. Al-Samarrai, and G.A. Wiegers. Madrid: CSIC, 2015.
- ¹⁴ Amalia García Pedraza, *Actitudes ante la muerte en la Granada del siglo XVI. Los moriscos que quisieron salvarse*, Granada: Universidad de Granada, 2001, 2 vols. For the record, a strong social as well as cultural and spiritual dimension informs this and other studies by the author.
- ¹⁵ There is a very large and still growing bibliography on the lead books of Granada. Recent major works include: Manuel Barrios Aguilera and Mercedes García-Arenal (eds.), Los Plomos del Sacromonte: Invención y tesoro, Valencia-Granada-Zaragoza: Universitat de València-Universidad de Granada-Universidad de Zaragoza, 2006; A. Katie Harris, From Muslim to Christian Granada: Inventing a City's Past in Early Modern Spain, Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2007; and Mercedes García-Arenal and Fernando Rodríguez Mediano, Un Oriente español: Los moriscos y el Sacromonte en tiempos de Contrarreforma, Madrid: Marcial Pons, 2010; English version as The Orient in Spain: Converted Muslims, the Forged Lead Books of Granada, and the Rise of Orientalism, trans. Consuelo López-Morillas, Leiden: Brill, 2016.
- ¹⁶ See e.g. Mercedes García Arenal (ed.), After Conversion: Iberia and the Emergence of Modernity, Leiden: Brill, 2016. For other studies among the more suggestive recent works on the intellectual history of the moriscos see García-Arenal and Rodríguez Mediano, The Orient in Spain; Seth Kimmel, Parables of Coercion: Conversion and Knowledge at the End of Islamic Spain, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2015; and Felipe Pereda, Images of Discord: Poetics and Politics of the Sacred Image in 15th-Century Spain, Turnhout, Harvey Miller, 2017 (orig. Span ed. 2007).